ABSTRACT

SMART, VANESSA WALL. A Narrative Inquiry: North Carolina Veteran Art Teachers’ Perspectives on Resources and Addressing Race in the Public Secondary Art Classroom. (Under the direction of Dr. Lance D. Fusarelli.)

This dissertation is a narrative inquiry of secondary art teachers in North Carolina, which examines how they address race in lessons they create and how secondary students may be subjected to images provided by public arts agencies that are reflective of social and cultural injustices as theorized by Critical Race Theory. Communicating through images, symbols, and likenesses creates a visual language specific to art classrooms, which becomes a substantial vehicle for racist ideals such as Black men as Sambos (Clarke, 2002), Black women as hyper-sexed objects (Gilman, 2002), and Black artists as primitive, naïve, and unskilled folk artists. The following research questions were explored: What are the perspectives of secondary teachers in North Carolina as it relates to addressing race and identity in their classrooms? How do North Carolina secondary art teachers develop lessons when referencing or visiting public art collections?

Qualitative data collected from interviews of ten secondary art teachers in North Carolina allowed for an in depth examination of secondary art teachers’ pedagogy and curriculum development. Teachers’ narratives revealed their decision-making processes when selecting museum exhibits to view and images to use as reference in their classrooms, and it was discovered that teacher support, class size, teacher and student interests, and connections to other subject areas played considerable roles in lesson plan development and selection of museum and gallery exhibits to visit.

Findings included common themes shared by the participants in this narrative study, which included participants’ desire to be effective educators while ensuring student success,
using art as a means of communication and expression, the use of technology as a virtual museum and research tool in middle and high school art, and limited resource availability for the purpose of acquiring classroom materials. The study reinforces the importance art holds in education and clarifies the need for more meaningful connections to individual student accounts and in the secondary art classroom through the use of counter-storytelling.
A Narrative Inquiry: North Carolina Veteran Art Teachers’ Perspectives on Resources and Addressing Race in the Public Secondary Art Classroom

by
Vanessa Wall Smart

A dissertation submitted to the Graduate Faculty of North Carolina State University in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

Educational Research and Policy Analysis

Raleigh, North Carolina

2015

APPROVED BY:

Dr. Lance D. Fusarelli
Committee Chair

Dr. Tuere Bowles

Dr. Meghan Manfra

Dr. Lisa Bass
DEDICATION

To my four daughters, I thank you, and I give the idea of this work and the ideals in this work to you. The idea that ‘we can do anything’ is not limited to greeting cards and Black History month. It is embedded in our everyday conversations about our own strengths and triumphs. It is the embodied in our support for each other. It is manifested in the love and laughs and prayers we share. It is to be passed on to any and all you will teach. Thank you Ayana. Thank you Naja. Thank you Hadiya. Thank you Masala.

Thank you, Ken for all of your help. I can’t even begin to list everything here. Eli, I knew I would like you as soon as I met you. You are the most uplifting, blessed, funniest, brightest, strongest, best grandson any Mimi could ask for. Thank you for loving me back. Ma... Thank you for the prayers (“bless your pea-picking heart”), the babysitting, the dinners, the support, and most of all, the laughs. You are the best ever. My sister Charlie and my brother Trevis-thanks for trees climbed, upside-down laugh fests, and everything we’ve been through and come through!

My late father used to say, “Do the best you can with what you’ve got”. To everyone who supported me in any way, if this is the best I can do with you, then you are all more than awesome! To The Max, Daddy!
BIOGRAPHY

Vanessa Wall Smart was born in Durham, NC. She earned a Bachelors of Arts degree in Art Education from Winston-Salem State University in 1996, and a Master of Public Administration degree from North Carolina Central University in 2008. Upon completion of her undergraduate studies, she began teaching in the public schools, and has not yet left the art classroom. In addition to teaching full time, she has participated in internships with The NC Museum of Art and The Chatham County Fair Association. Vanessa has also worked with the Literacy Through Photography program at Duke University’s Center for Documentary Studies.

Vanessa has been selected as teacher of the year at her current school, has served as a mentor to new teachers, and has tutored students after school in various subject areas. She received grant writing training and is a member of the district-level grant writing team in her district. Along with those responsibilities and activities, she is a commissioned artist who has participated in both group and solo art shows and exhibits across the southeast.
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Thanks to my 6500 super students, especially those who kept me laughing, motivated, and excited about art. You all are going to do great things and change the world.

My deepest appreciation goes to my professors and mentors at NC State University, including my committee chair Dr. Lance Fusarelli, and committee members Drs. Tuere Bowles, Meghan Manfra, and Lisa Bass.

I especially acknowledge my fellow art teachers who gave their time and support as they participated in interviews for this study. I am forever grateful for their willingness to share their stories for the sake of research and art.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF FIGURES ........................................................................................................................................viii

CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION ......................................................................................................................1

Background .................................................................................................................................................1
Statement of the Problem ...............................................................................................................................2
Purpose of the Study .....................................................................................................................................7
Significance of the Study ...............................................................................................................................7
Definition of Terms ......................................................................................................................................10
Overview of Methodology ...........................................................................................................................11
Chapter Summary .......................................................................................................................................12

CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW ..............................................................................................................14

Introduction ...............................................................................................................................................14
K-12 Arts Education ....................................................................................................................................15
Early Federal Arts Policy, Support, and Resources ....................................................................................19
21st Century Federal Arts Education Policy ..............................................................................................23
State Level Support/ Resources ................................................................................................................26
Critical Race Theory ...................................................................................................................................30
  Permanence ............................................................................................................................................32
  Colorblindness .......................................................................................................................................33
  Counter-storytelling and Recognition of Cultural Capital .....................................................................48
Chapter Summary .......................................................................................................................................51

CHAPTER 3: METHODOLOGY ....................................................................................................................55
Cross-Narrative Analysis ................................................................. 131
Document Analysis of Participant Lesson Plans ................................. 137
Chapter Summary ............................................................................ 144

CHAPTER 5: INTERPRETATIONS, IMPLICATIONS, AND CONCLUSIONS .......... 145
Conclusions and Connections to Research ........................................ 146
Implications for Teachers .................................................................. 154
Recommendations for Practice .......................................................... 157
Recommendations for Future Research ............................................ 158
Summary and Reflections ................................................................ 160

REFERENCES ..................................................................................... 162

APPENDICIES .................................................................................. 177
APPENDIX A Teacher Interview Protocols ........................................ 178
APPENDIX B Informed Consent Form ................................................. 180
APPENDIX C Participant Demographics ............................................ 182
APPENDIX D Lesson Plan Matrix ...................................................... 183
# LIST OF FIGURES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Artist/Title/Year</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>James Lesesne Wells, 1980</td>
<td>African Nude</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Kara Walker, 1997</td>
<td>Freedom, a Fable: A Curious Interpretation of the Wit of a Negress in Troubled Times Introduction</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Augustus Saint-Gaudens, 1884-1897</td>
<td>Robert Gould Shaw and the 54\textsuperscript{th} Regiment Memorial</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Jacob Lawrence, 1940-1941</td>
<td>The Migration of the Negro Panel no. 57</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Romare Bearden, 1964</td>
<td>The Dove</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Christian Friedrich Mayr, 1838</td>
<td>Kitchen Ball at White Sulphur Springs, Virginia</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Winslow Homer, 1867</td>
<td>A Visit from the Old Mistress</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Pablo Picasso, 1907</td>
<td>Les Demoiselles d’Avignon</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Gauguin, 1897</td>
<td>Where Do We Come From? What Are We? Where Are We Going?</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Ernie Barnes, 1976</td>
<td>Sugar Shack</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td></td>
<td>Lesson Plan Analysis</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Norman Rockwell, 1946</td>
<td>Boy in a Dining Car</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

Background to the Study

As a keen and eager seventeen-year-old, I explained my collegiate and career aspirations of studying art and becoming a famous artist to my parents, to which my mother replied, “If I am paying for college and you want to study art, you can enroll in an art education program and become an art teacher, you cannot major in art only. You know we don’t see much art for us, artists don’t look like us, and they don’t make much money.”

Seventeen years later, an equally eager group of middle school students entered our state’s art museum and were ready to be inspired by the great things their art teacher ensured them was just inside the museum’s walls. After the day-long field trip, one student of color remarked, “Mrs. Smart, why did you take us to that place? That is what real art looks like? All we saw was old white people and African stuff. I’m not white or African!”

I have found and continue to find many opportunities to dispel the myths and stereotypes about art and artists that continue permeate the art world, specifically in the secondary art classroom. Those conversations, as well as many I have had with students and educators throughout my teaching career, initiated my investigation of how some theories and practices of visual art education are normalized based on white privilege, and how often standards of beauty and works accepted as high art founded on white imagery and standards are transferred through the secondary visual arts curriculum and classroom pedagogy.

Those conversations suggest that some believe ways in which the Black image is portrayed become determining factors in career status for artists and standards for what may be considered “real art”. In particular, I am interested in how secondary art teachers may subject students to images that are reflective of social and cultural injustices as theorized by
Critical Race Theory, and how those secondary art teachers develop lessons that address creation, recreation, or the maintenance of identities of people of color.

**Statement of the Problem**

“Any situation in which ‘A’ objectively exploits ‘B’ or hinders his and her pursuit of self-affirmation as a responsible person is one of oppression. Such a situation in itself constitutes violence, even when sweetened by false generosity” (Freire, 1993, p. 37).

Teachers of students of color who participate in the arts may not expose their students to images and traditional forms of art that represent people of color in a positive light or that have been created by artists of color. The collections purchased and acquired by public arts agencies and museums, as well as outreach and education efforts, do not accurately reflect the state’s secondary student population, consequently, secondary art teachers should allow for meaningful opportunities to address race in their art classrooms which include the use of counter-storytelling.

“Students need to recognize their own biases and those of others in order to understand the connections between power and wealth and injustice” (Stuhr, Ballengee-Morris, & Daniel, 2008, p. 83). It is imperative for teachers to move students beyond the binding of textbooks in order to create connections with real-world experiences and communities through art. In addition, secondary art consumers should have genuine opportunities to explore the idea that race, nationality, cultural background, and identity are not static and fixed, but fluid and diverse (Bonilla-Silva & Dietrich, 2011; Garber, 2005). Therefore, my research is not such that I explore in what way or for what reasons specific images are acquired and maintained, rather I wish to examine how and to what extent
secondary art teachers offer opportunities to explore the contemporary issue of race and identity in their secondary art classrooms, and how their access to resources may affect their ability to explore various ideas in their secondary art classrooms.

Arts participation has been proven many times over to improve performance and decrease dropout rates for students who face challenges such as lower socioeconomic status (Brewer, 2002; Caughlan, 2008; Deasy, 2002; Engebretsen, 2013; Rabkin & Hedberg, 2011). However, opportunity, access and exposure are inequitable among students of color and students with lower socioeconomic status in the K-12 setting and continue to decline (Rabkin & Hedberg, 2011). Schools have had fewer arts class offerings (Engebretsen, 2013) and in many instances students who are most in need and enrolled in the most challenged of schools have fewer opportunities to participate in the arts. The practice of art education is diminished moreover for those students who would benefit most from its presence in their education experience.

Students of color who are fortunate enough to have arts experiences will likely participate in “consuming” public art in the form of museum visits or previewing master works in texts and art classroom resources developed by public museums and galleries, and textbooks adopted by school systems. Those master works are a permanent part of art history and serve as the unwritten standard of high art and acceptable foundations for arts learning in many art classrooms in public schools. Permanent collections and temporary exhibitions are often acquired and placed on display based on majority ideals and standards of beauty and what the museum director and curatorial staff deem worthy of collection, preservation, interpretation, study, and display.
During my master’s degree program, I completed an internship in my state’s museum of art wherein I worked with the visitor and volunteer coordinator, the marketing director, the education department, and the photography/cataloging department. During my three months there, I encountered nine Black people employed by the museum. Two were in administrative positions, two in security positions, two worked at the ticket counter, and three in housekeeping. Of final note, the docents in the museum worked on a volunteer basis and I saw no Black docents during my internship.

My point is to bring awareness to that of the traditional culture of majority presence in the art classroom setting. When secondary students enter some art classrooms in this state, they not only encounter not only a mostly white presence in the images they see, but also in the museum setting they may visit on a school field trip. That museum is not the only mostly white experience I have had, and surely not the last I will experience. Many times during my career as student and teacher I have looked for and wanted to see people of color on the walls and walking the halls of museums and galleries.

The North Carolina Museum of Art’s education department has developed a somewhat interactive web page that allows educators or visitors to the site to create lessons based on what the museum calls “150 of the most teachable objects in the North Carolina Museum of Art collection” (NCMA, 2013), in which there are few Black faces. The lessons listed on the site utilize the objects that are placed onto a virtual concept map that allows users to create connections with thirty-two concepts, which include change, function, family, survival, power, ritual, meaning, perspective, place, and identity.
The concept maps serve as a function to create involvement from classroom teachers, teaching artists, or visitors to the museum who may be interested in creating lessons for groups. The lessons created from the concept maps are not products developed directly by the museum’s education department; rather, they are an extension of classroom activities based on the museum’s collection. The connections that are available for classroom teachers to make are utilized on the museum’s website, but perhaps not so often in education outreach programming. The art classroom is an appropriate and ideal place to address change, function, family, survival, power, ritual, meaning, perspective, place, identity, and race.

The permanence of racism as proposed by Bell (1992) applies to American life, law, and culture, therefore, art, as a distinct subset of culture is a social product in which artists are socially located. The historical context of race in art education is defined and signified by imagery and lessons, both articulated and suggested, learned from those works of art (Amburgy, Knight, & Keifer-Boyd, 2006). Additionally, the language of art is itself culturally distinct, both facilitating and impeding the creation of cultural products (Wolff, 1990). Students who participate in arts classes in secondary schools are exposed to images that perpetuate and often complete racist stereotypes, and various other oversimplified conceptions about people of color.

The system of communicating through images, symbols, and likenesses creates a visual language specific to art classrooms. During my years of experience in the art classroom, I have questioned whom certain images are for and why they are designed and offered (often along with textbooks) as foundational pieces for art students. The visual language created is a substantial vehicle for racist ideals such as Black men as Sambos
(Clarke, 2002), Black women as hyper-sexed objects (Gilman, 2002), and Black artists as primitive, naïve, and unskilled folk artists with little to no chance for success in the world of so-called high art. Although art has the power to appeal across cultures, gender, and socioeconomic status, the presence or portrayal of people of color in art resources and often used well-known pieces of art can exemplify Critical Race Theory (CRT) tenets such as whiteness as property and colorblindness.

Gillborn (2005) mentions the eradication of Blacks from a visual representation of slavery in America and England wherein there were no images of Black people in the conceptual piece. The author called the negation obscene and significant. Insofar as positive images of Black people being eradicated or eliminated from arts education, I have observed few curriculum supplements and suggested texts that focus on Black artists in America. Gilborn also stated that the focus on white people’s sense of self, interests, and concerns had become a fascinating pastime in parts of the United States academy, and there was a danger of multiculturalism studies being colonized by white people.

The negation of people of color in collections that are created for public viewing and scrutiny is a vehicle for creating additional cultural hierarchies that in essence perpetuate the stereotypes my mother and my students spoke of—real art and real artists do not include Black people. I identify the need for more substantial conversations between public arts teachers and researchers that would encourage secondary art students’ consideration of and examination of race in art. I suggest an investigation of how North Carolina secondary art teachers offer frequent and meaningful opportunities for expression and/or include counter-
normal images and works of art that allow for exposure to positive representations of people of color, specifically Black people.

**Purpose of the Study**

My research focus is a narrative inquiry on the perspectives of secondary art teachers in North Carolina and how they allow for opportunities to address race in lessons or curricula they develop. I specifically explore the following research questions:

1. What are the perspectives of secondary teachers in North Carolina as it relates to addressing race and identity in their classrooms?
2. How do North Carolina secondary art teachers develop lessons when referencing or visiting public art collections?

**Significance of the Study**

In 2011 the President’s Committee on the Arts and Humanities (PCAH) developed a comprehensive report, *Re-Investing in Arts Education: Winning America’s Future Through Creative Schools*, that was a federal examination of arts education data in the United States. The report concluded with five recommendations that included expanding research foci as it pertains to data collection related to arts education. The nature of this research will expand CRT to include public secondary art and lessons tailored for images consumed from public collections. There have been many studies and works written that focus on arts instruction methodology, with fewer addressing secondary art lessons as they may be situated in Critical Race Theory.

Investigating governmental support of and provisions made for the institution of public art is vital to creating opportunities for more transparent, approachable, and honest
critiques of public museums, galleries, and depositories, and how art teachers in public
schools use those resources. Agencies and entities such as The National Endowment for the
Arts (NEA), National Endowment for the Humanities (NEH), and National Assembly of
State Arts Agencies (NASAA) have all benefited from financial support from federal and
state funding sources. The principles we expect elected officials to uphold such as
accountability, transparency, and equity should also apply to collections and resources that
belong to and are used by the public.

Every state in our country funds the arts in one manner or another. The funding and
support has come as a result of the realization that the arts are economic drivers, educational
assets, catalysts that promote civic minded activities, and preservers of cultural legacies
(NASAA, 2013). If, however, those cultural legacies and civic-minded activities are
reflective of the majority population, culture, and means of knowing, they remain one of the
sources of the racial oppression that is most prevalent in our society (Bonilla-Silva, 2002;
Ladson-Billings & Tate, 1995; Omni & Winant, 1994).

Ladson-Billings and Tate (1995) remind us that some school activities that are
considered multicultural such as eating ethnic foods, participating in folk dances, and
creating works of art in the styles of specific cultures does not signify multicultural or critical
teaching. Additionally, Stuhr, Ballengee-Morris, and Daniel (2008) iterate the need to
recognize biases we perpetuate when participating in art creation and analysis. My research is
situated in the need for a critical examination of public art education practices and norms
based on exhibitions, other than those focused specifically on commemorative events such as
Black History Month or events specifically related to a “multicultural event”, that become
examples of those less than critical experiences students may have in art classes.

Freire (1993) highlighted the need to look more deeply into ideologies and foundations of things that may go unquestioned and taken for granted. The critical narrative inquiry utilized in this study aims to do just that-dig into the subtexts and underlying meanings of the lessons and curricula young artists are exposed to and images they expected to recognize and appreciate as high art, even if the pieces do not accurately or sufficiently represent them. It is important to recognize the role permanent and revered works of art play in the development of cultural identities or reinforcement of simplified ideas of specific groups of people of color. A primary objective of both this research and CRT is to challenge the dominant ideology while offering critiques to liberal ideals through narratives and counter-storytelling (Delgado & Stefancic, 2012; Ladson-Billings & Tate, 1995; Solorzano & Yosso, 2001).

Participation in the arts by people of color, specifically Hispanics and African Americans has declined steadily between 1982 and 2008 (Engebretsen, 2013; Rabkin & Hedberg, 2011). According to The National Endowment for the Arts’ Survey of Public Participation (2008), access to arts education for people of color is significantly lower than that of white students. During the years of data collection, no less than 53% of white students received arts education in their childhood while 59% report they received arts education in their childhood in 2008. Hispanic participation declined from 47% in 1982 to 26% in 2008, and African American access declined from 51% to 28%. It seems that the many studies that have proven the arts to be beneficial to students by boosting academic performance and college attendance fall on deaf ears or are not taken into account when determining
curriculum needs for students of color (Brewer, 2002; Chapman, 2005; Mishook & Kornhaber, 2006; NAEA, 1994, NASAA, 2013; NEA, 2013; Rademaker, 2007; Ruppert, 2006).

Creating conversations about the connections shared by arts exposure, participation, and perceived biases are key to developing anti-bias art pedagogy. Desai (2010) and Stuhr, Ballengee-Morris, and Daniel (2008) have written extensively about the need to reframe contemporary understanding of difference through art processes and art education. “Our visual culture continues to reproduce colorblind racism by naturalizing and normalizing images of racial difference in the name of cultural diversity” (Desai, 2010, p. 24). Colorblind racism must be examined in order to challenge racist ideals and practices that take place recurrently in communities and schools.

The following definitions offer clarity for reader understanding and action:

**Definition of Terms**

1. **Art Education** is the specific discipline of visual arts, which contains a specific body of knowledge and skills that include but are not limited to drawing, painting, sculpting, photography, printmaking, and fiber arts. The state of focus for this research includes qualifications to the definition such as, “arts education benefits both student and society, because students of the arts gain powerful tools for: understanding human experiences; teamwork and collaboration; making decisions creatively and solving problems when no prescribed answers exist; and understanding the influence of the arts and their power to create and reflect cultures” (NCDPI, 2013).
2. **Arts Participation** includes the five broad categories of attending arts events and activities, art-making and art-sharing, reading books and literature, arts education, and consumption of art through electronic media (NEA, 2013).

3. **Public Arts Agencies/ Museums** are subsets of active programs that “foster access to the arts and increase the aesthetic value of public places” (NASAA, 2013). This study includes works from The National Gallery of Art, the state’s museum of art, public university and colleges in the state, and local collections in arts councils and public spaces.

4. **Public Support and Resources** include but are not limited to monetary support and “roles that vary and may include serving as an advisor, managing artist rosters, maintaining the state art collection, commissioning artworks and selecting installation sites” (NASAA, 2013).

5. **Stereotypes in Works of Art** are dominant forms of representation that perpetuate marginalized groups as “others” (Desai, 2000). Racist ideals such as Black men and women in positions of servitude, cartoon-like representations of Black people, Black women as sexual objects, Black people with large lips and hips, Black men as and Black artists as primitive, naïve, and unskilled folk artists with little to no chance for success in the world of so-called high art are examples of such representations.

**Overview of the Methodology**

This study employed a qualitative narrative inquiry in order to explore how secondary art teachers in public schools in North Carolina address race through lessons delivered to students in art classes. Data collection included teacher interviews, observations of lessons,
analysis of lesson plans/curricula, and review of researcher logs. Data collection occurred during the second semester of the 2013-2014 school year with interviews conducted with teacher participants who had visited or viewed public works of art with their classes. A semi-structured interview protocol was used [Appendix A], and digital recordings of the interviews were created and transcribed by the researcher. Lesson plans and artifacts were collected throughout the study and all data were stored in a secure file on the researcher’s computer that could be accessed only through password-protected software.

Critical Race Theory served as the theoretical frame for this study in art education research because it offers opportunities to challenge norms and ideologies while providing a place for the minoritized to give expressions and accounts of their experiences. Critical Race Theory does not offer tenets to provide isolated explanations of race as an issue in art: rather it allows the researcher to focus on how it is an issue and what effects race has in the delivery of art lessons. Data analysis included discovering themes that emerge while aligning to CRT tenets. In addition, cross-narrative themes as well as individual narrative themes were analyzed through a CRT lens in order to establish a basis for the usefulness of the theory across educational curricula and subjects.

**Chapter Summary**

Chapter One presented the background of the study along with the statement of the problem and purpose of the study. The statement of the problem included an explanation of how students need opportunities to explore the idea that race, nationality, cultural background, and identity are not fixed, but fluid and diverse due in part to the fact that images and traditional forms of art that represent people of color in a positive light or that
have been created by artists of color are in limited supply in collections purchased and acquired by public arts agencies and museums. The research question was presented along with the significance of the study and definition of key terms related to the study. An overview of the chosen methodology, a narrative analysis of public art teachers’ lessons in the state of North Carolina, concluded the chapter.
CHAPTER II
LITERATURE REVIEW

Introduction

The arts are valid and necessary forms of expression that catapult social change and serve as catalysts for creative thought (Bell, 2010; Caughlan, 2008; Deasy, 2002; Desai, 2010; Rademaker, 2007; Stuhr, Ballengee-Morris & Daniel, 2008). Moreover, in education, the arts provide support to traditional forms of reading, writing, and other forms of literacy (Caughlan, 2008). Unlike textbooks that are published by private companies, some works of art are a part of national and state collections that belong, per se, to the people. In some instances, images that are national and global treasures are seen in public schools, and art classrooms moreover, have become visual introductions and possible reminders of ideas and ideals of acceptable representations of social, economic, and cultural ways of belonging. This research is focused on how secondary students may have opportunities to address race in their schools when viewing images provided by public arts agencies that are reflective of social and cultural injustices as theorized by Critical Race Theory.

The creation of arts policies in the United States has been a part of government interest and support for some time. One example of note is Franklin D. Roosevelt’s New Deal and The Public Works Art Project (WAP) (Mankin, 1995). The WAP was created to provide work for artists in need of employment between 1932 and 1935 and was a catalyst for the creation of The National Gallery of Art in 1937. Those significant policies and programs, and others like them, affected the creation and further development of arts agendas and created a foundation for maintaining that the arts are of consequence to the populace.
With this governmental support, one may argue that there is a specific cultural and artistic perspective that is encouraged and endorsed by the government. Assumptions, values, and knowledge related to the arts shape individuals’ judgments about the significance and meaning of works of art considered to be national treasures, historical events represented by an artistic creation, and the process of creating “traditional” forms of art.

My aim in creating this literature review is to explore the history of arts support through the provision of resources in the United States with a focus on images and classroom supplemental materials provided by public arts agencies that are reflective of social and cultural injustices as theorized by Critical Race Theory. I will present the literature related to arts beginning with the importance and significance of the arts in schools, early governmental support of the arts and its development through the 20th century, followed by state-level arts support and resources, and conclude with literature addressing Critical Race Theory and its tenets which will inform, guide and support my research.

**Art Education**

It has been well documented that art-related activities are effective in developing a sense of identity and self-esteem, and there is evidence to suggest that peer mentoring and other leadership activities help reorient pupils so that they become more “positively affected towards learning” (Hickman, 2006, p. 334). The arts are believed to foster an atmosphere of engagement, attention, and exploration (Moorefield-Lang, 2010). It is suggested that arts education promotes growth in self-esteem, self-confidence, and self-identity. These subjects are also believed to support growth in academic achievement. Oreck (2004) noted that the effectiveness of arts-based professional and curriculum development should be evaluated in
light of the current national movement for high stakes testing and centralized control of curriculum.

There are a number of studies indicating a strong correlation between arts involvement and positive outcomes such as higher academic achievement and lower dropout rates (Caughlan, 2008; Eisner, 2002; Moorefield-Lang, 2010). Caughlan also noted that several large-scale studies built on the insights of smaller, qualitative studies conducted during the 1970s and 1980s. The studies indicated that the kinds of thinking and work involved in developing one’s abilities in the visual arts, music, and theater also help students work collaboratively, engage in productive critique, complete complex projects, and develop a positive self-concept (Moorefield-Lang, 2010; Thornton, 2005).

Eisner (2002) stated learning is not only the result of standards, planned curriculum experiences and the ability of a teacher to teach, but it is also shaped by the climate of a school including its attitudes of teachers and students, hidden expectations about what is valued and expected—the explicit and implicit curriculum respectively of both the classroom and the entire school. Eisner asserts learning is also shaped by the null curriculum, what is not taught or included in the culture of the school. In schools where the arts are not included, or when they are taught in unstructured ways, students are still learning. The absence of organized and purposeful arts in schools sends a lasting message to students about the arts, and students may learn that the arts are not of value. Together the explicit, implicit and null curricula shape the culture of the school.

Gardner (1983) spoke of the tendency of schools to privilege verbal and logical-mathematical intelligences over musical, spatial, and kinesthetic intelligences. He also
discussed windows of opportunity for artistic development that may close if children are
 denied the chance to learn and practice. Brewer (2002) notes that we often talk in terms of
 balance among the arts, sciences, and humanities, but he warns that their differences should
 be kept in mind: The arts, he says, are affective and participatory, celebrating the life of
 feeling and imagination; science is objective, detached, precise, and rational; and the
 humanities deal with the analysis of moral actions. He concludes by saying that each family
 of study has its own essential forms of cognition, and therefore in general education the arts
 have a distinct role to play.

Eisner (1979) and Simpson, Jackson, and Aycock (2005) restated the idea that
 experiences in school can be educative, noneducative, or miseducative as proposed by
 Dewey. Arts education experiences would be considered educative if they enhance further
 expansion and growth for the student within the domain of the arts. On the other hand, arts
 experiences would be miseducative if the student's possibilities for further growth were
 limited, or noneducative if the experiences have essentially no impact on growth in the
 domain of art. If a student's art and art education experiences related to race have been
 negative, menial, or nonexistent, it should not be surprising if he or she is predisposed to
 think of the importance of race in art education in these same terms.

Tomhave (1992) offers an in-depth analysis of art education literature based on
 multicultural education. He identified six approaches to multicultural education, which
 includes acculturation/assimilation, bi-cultural/cross-cultural research, cultural separatism,
 multicultural education theory, social reconstruction, and cultural understanding. To inform
 my study, I focused on the literature presented in both the social reconstruction (Blandy,
1987; Chalmers, 1981; Freedman, 1988; Nadaner, 1985) and cultural understanding approaches (Allison, 1980; Boyer, 1987; DiBlasio, 1985; Eisner, 1979; Weinken, 1986) presented by Tomhave, as they are approaches in which curricula are “examined and scrutinized to determine if there is a hidden agenda that perpetuates cultural inequalities” (p. 53). In addition, we, as educators can “accommodate the concerns of various ethnic groups, and also gain an appreciation, respect, and acceptance of diverse cultures’ contributions to the human condition” (p. 53).

Social reconstruction (Blandy, 1987; Nadaner, 1985) researchers realize the goal of the method is to dispel the idea that students are to be enabled with the efficiency, technical skills, and artistic values of the majority population. This miseducation was created to enable those who are underprivileged, of color, female, or otherwise minoritized (Chalmers, 1981; Freedman, 1988), to get employment in the arts or participate at a level higher than those who do not subscribe to the status quo. Cultural understanding approaches (Boyer, 1987; Weinken, 1986) address the need to realize the significance of social and cultural rights of the majority (Allison, 1980) as well as the recognition that the ideas, beliefs, values, and feelings of cultures are determined by art, language, and other forms of expression (DiBlasio, 1985; Eisner, 1979).

Finally, arts-based research in which students are able to participate include five perspectives presented by Keifer-Boyd (2011), which include arts-insight, arts-inquiry, arts imagination, arts-embodiment, and arts-relationality. The two perspectives related to this study and the importance of counter-storytelling are arts-imagination, which is art making as a way to understand, and arts-embodiment, which is defined as art embodying knowledge.
The author describes research in which art making is used as a way to reflect on individual understanding of self as they are informed or misinformed by experiences, cultures, worldviews, and power dynamics. As secondary students may participate in counter-storytelling in their classrooms, they participate in arts-embodiment by exploring concepts that “promote human dignity through subversive renderings of difference that dislodge hatred of self and others” (Keifer-Boyd, 2011, p.12).

**Early Federal Arts Policy, Support, and Resources**

Government support of the arts is not new, nor is it passé, as it remains a significant point of contention and occasionally agreement among 21st century policy makers. There has been documented support of the arts in the U.S. (Chapman, 2005; Engel, 1977; Lowell & Ondaatje, 2006; USDOE, 2012), which resulted in the creation of timelines, policy reports, and evaluations. One of the first marks of American governmental support of the arts was the design, building, and decoration of The Capitol Building, and later the chartering of The Smithsonian Institution in 1846 (Mulcahy & Wyszomirski, 1995), which subsequently has grown to 19 museums, 9 research centers, and 140 affiliated museums around the world.

In 1961 a resolution was entered to Congress to establish an advisory council on the arts within the Department of Health, Education, and Welfare that would serve to coordinate private and federal arts activities. The bill was defeated in the House. Three years later, in January 1964, Senator Jacob Javits introduced S.165 that would establish a U.S. National Arts Foundation. In December of the same year the Senate passed S. 2379, which is a combination of provisions set forth in S.165 and another arts bill. The bill was to establish the National Council on the Arts and a National Arts Foundation (Wood, 2000).
Scott (1970) lamented that the creation of state arts agencies was a great step forward for the arts, but the agencies should be offered more than “token appropriations” (p. 376) from Congress. The “arts” law enacted in 1965 was to address creativity and the arts in America authorized 10 million dollars annually to The National Endowment for the Arts (NEA) and The National Endowment for the Humanities (NEH).

Engel (1977) gathered facts about arts in education and federal recognition and support for the arts in the early 1970’s. He noted that at the time, The Office of Education, through its Emergency School Aid Act, supported performing arts groups in conjunction with schools with the emphasis being upon the performance, rather than upon a design, for arts education that is expected to last longer than the particular funded program. In his work, he also mentions the Federal Interagency Committee on Education, which was established in 1964, and currently has the function of studying and making recommendations for assuring effective coordination of federal programs, policies, and administrative practices affecting education (USDOE, 2012).

In 1982, President Reagan issued a memorandum to the Department of Education stating senior policy making officials on the committee should include members from but not limited to The U.S. Department of Education, The National Endowment for the Arts, and The National Endowment for the Humanities. Currently, the membership includes “the Secretary of Education, or his designee, who chairs the Committee, and senior policy making officials from those Federal agencies, commissions, and boards that the President may find appropriate. The Council of Economic Advisors, the Office of Science and Technology policy and the Domestic Policy Staff designate a staff member to attend the Committee's
meetings. The Secretary recommends member agencies to the President” (USDOE, 2012).

Created in 1985, the Jacob K. Javits Fellow Program provides fellowships for graduate students whose focus is the arts, humanities, or social sciences. The students are selected on the basis of demonstrated achievement, financial need, and promise. The federal board appointed for the maintenance of the program:

- establishes general policies for the graduate fellows program and oversees its operation; selects each year the fields in which fellowships are to be awarded;
- determines the number of fellowships each year to be awarded in each designated field; and appoints distinguished panels in each field for the purpose of selecting the fellows. In making appointments, the Secretary gives due consideration to the appointment of individuals who are highly respected in the academic community.
- One member must be an enrolled student in an institution of higher education at the time of appointment (USDOE, 2012)

There was an announcement made by the NEA in 1986 that beginning in FY 1988, the Artists-in-Education Program would be “broadened with the goal of encouraging serious and sequential study of the arts as a part of basic education” (Wood, 2000, p. 52). In the first year of the Artists-in-Education Program’s new category of Arts-in-Schools Basic Education Grants, 42 states applied for support. The NEA’s (2012) website explains that funding is available for “in-depth, curriculum-based arts education for children and youth in schools or other community-based settings”. In addition, the funded projects must provide participatory learning that allows students to engage with accomplished artists and teachers; they should align with either national or state arts education standards, and finally, must include
assessments of participant learning.

Wood (2000) and The National Endowment for the Arts (NEA) provide a brief chronology of federal arts support that spans the years of 1965 through 2000. The timeline includes presidential appointments made for the purposes of decorating federal buildings, documentation of donations that created a foundation for the National Gallery of Art, and introductions of legislations that address the arts in the United States. In 1995, the NEA reached 30 years of age and had a budget of over 162 million dollars (current figures are provided in the next section). The previous year marked the date of the first federally sponsored national arts conference, where over 1,100 participants met to discuss national arts policy, centered around four themes: “The Artist in Society,” “Lifelong Learning through the Arts,” “The Arts and Technology,” and “Expanding Resources for the Arts.”

The federal partnership between the Department of Education and the Arts Endowment is a respected one, including former support for a national arts education research center, collaboration on the National Assessment of Educational Progress as they worked to establish voluntary national standards for arts education, and a number of other research efforts. The push for national standards began in 1992 and was voluntarily adopted by states. National Arts Education standards are one outcome of the education reform effort generated in the 1980s, which was powerfully effective (National Art Education Association, 1994). Six national education goals were announced in 1990, and the “Goals 2000: Educate America Act” writes the national goals into law, naming the arts as a core, academic subject—as important to education as English, mathematics, history, civics and government, geography, science, and foreign language” (National Art Education Association, 2004, p.
The standards address what students should know and should be able to do.

The Arts Education Partnership (AEP), formed in 1995 with the National Assembly of State Arts Agencies and the Council of Chief State School Officers, is one of the agency’s most successful endeavors. The Partnership comprises an association of more than 140 national organizations from the business, arts, education, and government sectors. The AEP works with various state and local partners to improve arts education in the U.S.

**21st Century Federal Arts Education Policy**

Support for the arts from the National Endowment for the Arts occurs by way of grant making, leadership initiatives, partnerships, professional development, and arts education research. Grants available from the NEA designed to support professional development opportunities for teachers, teaching artists, and other education providers are currently available and are a significant source of federal funding and support for the arts. Programs and initiatives seeking funding must include experience, creation, and assessment practices in their application. According to the NEA (2013), experience speaks to exposure to exemplary works of art in live form if possible. It is required that through the guidance of teachers, teaching artists, and cultural organizations, students and/or arts education providers will study works of art in order to understand the cultural and social context from which they come, and to appreciate the technical and/or aesthetic qualities of each work.

According to the U.S. Department of Education (USDOE, 2012), the Arts in Education Model Development and Dissemination Grants Program (AEMDD) is authorized under section 10401, part D, Subpart 1 of Title X of the Elementary and Secondary Education Act:
The grants program supports the development, documentation, evaluation, and dissemination of innovative, cohesive models that have demonstrated effectiveness in (1) integrating arts into the core elementary and middle school curricula, (2) strengthening arts instruction in these grades, and (3) improving students’ academic performance, including their skills in creating, performing, and responding to the arts. Integrating is defined as both strengthening the use of high-quality arts in the course of other academic instruction and strengthening the place of arts as a core academic subject in the regular school curricula (USDOE, 2012)

In 1999 the chairman of the NEA proposed the “Challenge America” initiative, and President Clinton sought funding for it in the FY 2000 budget request to Congress. According to Wood (2000), the two broad purposes of the initiative were “bringing together the arts, the American people and communities to address community concerns, and fostering development of new cultural initiatives and programs in previously underserved areas” (p. 60). In the same year, the NEA launched four Design Leadership Initiatives to foster design talent and improve the overall quality of arts and design across the country.

The NEA addresses professional development programs and arts education research by way of their partnership with the National Assembly of State Arts Agencies (NASAA). In addition, arts education managers have the opportunity to access virtual professional development community of representatives for arts education from state departments of education. The NASAA has a representative agency from all fifty states as well as four territories and the District of Columbia. According to the NASAA (2012), they provide funding for arts institutions, schools, and artists. Training is offered to educate the public
about the importance of the arts, support is given for in and out-of-school arts activities, and preservation efforts are made to celebrate diversity and cultural traditions of each state and territory. By law, the NEA is required to allocate 40% of its grant funds to regions and states (NASAA, 2012).

Woronkowicz, Nichols, and Iyengar (2012) present an overview of the three major types of arts funding in the United States which include: (1) direct funding from the NEA, state arts agencies, and local agencies, (2) “other” public funding from various federal and state agencies, and (3) private sector contributions from individuals, foundations, and corporations. As of January 2013, the NEA’s budget request to Congress was $154.255 million dollars, which, according to the NEA, includes a 3 million dollar relocation allocation. The figure reflects an increase of 6.7 million dollars for grant making with 2.7 million dollars going specifically to regional arts organizations and state arts agencies.

Of the three major types of funding, direct funding from the NEA, state arts agencies, and local agencies will guide my research and provide a basis for my study’s premise of how students may be subjected to images provided by public arts agencies that are reflective of social and cultural stereotypes and general conceptions of the Black existence and experiences. Each state that receives funds from the NEA (all fifty states) must develop and disseminate a plan that guarantees appropriate use of all funds. State-level arts planning may be a part of fund dissemination and is a reflection of priorities and foci for the arts and arts education. Once the planning requirements are met by individual states, using formulas reflective of state populations and equal state proportions, the NEA state partnership allocates funds (Woronkowicz, Nichols, & Iyengar, 2012).
In 2011 The President’s Committee on the Arts and Humanities (PCAH) developed a comprehensive report, *Re-Investing in Arts Education: Winning America’s Future Through Creative Schools*, a federal examination of arts education data in the United States.

**State Level Support/ Resources**

Most of the U.S. state departments of education have adopted the national arts standards that were created to focus on what students in the arts should know and be able to do rather than on the programs, processes, or access issues that aim to offer chances for learning (Hatfield, 1999; Remer, 2010). In the authors’ opinions, state education (standards) policies serve as predictors of what happens or will happen in local districts and schools. Hatfield also poses several questions related to arts integration and state curricula. He posits, “if the content of the national arts standards, state arts frameworks, and local arts curricula is recognized as a core area of learning for U.S. students, why do arts advocates focus so heavily on the impact of the arts on learning in and across other disciplines” (Hatfield, 1999, p. 10)?

Chapman (2005) explains that in many schools, and in NCLB, initiatives for improvement call for integrating the arts into the academic curriculum. According to the author, this stance acknowledges that studies of the arts have been so neglected that they must now be integrated back into the curriculum. At the same time, the expertise of specialists is largely untapped in the quest for this kind of school improvement. Parsad and Spiegelman (2012) report that during the 2009-2010 school year, music education was almost universally available in the nation’s public elementary schools, with 94 percent of schools offering instruction that was designated for music. In addition, the report stated that
visual arts instruction was available in 83% of surveyed elementary schools. Dance and drama were taught less in elementary schools at a rate of 3% of elementary schools offering dance instruction and 4% offering drama or theatre instruction, and this rate of arts instruction in the 1999-2000 school year was a reduction from 20% (Parsad & Spiegelman, 2012).

As I am interested in arts education resources and the role they play in secondary arts students’ perceptions of Black people, I will provide a bit of information about North Carolina’s recent bill and legislation passed that address the arts. The state passed legislation in 2009 that speaks to the importance of the arts in education, the significance education and the arts play on student self-perceptions (Epstein, 1998), and the state’s commitment to engaging in maintaining a supportive environment for the arts. The preamble of North Carolina Senate Bill 66, An Act to Provide a Comprehensive Arts Education Plan, reads as follows:

Whereas, North Carolina's economy needs a workforce that is not only educated but able to excel in 21st century skills, including innovation and creativity; and Whereas, arts education has been demonstrated to increase the motivation and engagement required to obtain the skills and knowledge necessary for high school graduation; and Whereas, arts education can close achievement gaps and improve academic skills in math and science, reading and language development, and other areas of the curriculum; and Whereas, arts education accelerates student performance, teaches discipline and teamwork, improves self-
esteem, and gives students a reason to stay in school; and Whereas,

arts education is an essential component of a comprehensive, rigorous,
and balanced education for all children in North Carolina's schools.

Of note, prior to this new legislation, North Carolina’s Basic Education Program (BEP), Public School Law 115C-81, was adopted by the State Board of Education in 1985 and specifically mentions the arts. It explains that a complete education consists of giving students a foundation in arts education, which includes dance, music, theatre arts, and visual arts. This description is somewhat of a state-level precursor to the 2002 Elementary and Secondary Education Act’s definition of core subjects as Reading/Language Arts, Mathematics, Arts, and History to name a few of the ten specific subject areas (NCDPI, 2012).

The North Carolina bill speaks of motivation, curriculum integration, a comprehensive education, problem-solving abilities, and the 21st century skills required for school success. Cultural policy advocates began discussing the economic and social benefits of arts investments in the 1960s, and their research found increasing favor with communities finding innovative forms of economic activity and improved public ideals (Strom, 1994). In conjunction, the creation of the National Endowment for the Arts (NEA), state arts agencies, and dozens of local arts councils was the motivation for the creation and development of a cultural/arts policy community, staffed by policy professionals who sought advocacy strategies most likely to succeed in the legislative world.

In North Carolina, state level support of the arts includes museums, galleries, and The North Carolina Arts Council, which operates as an agency of the North Carolina Department
of Cultural resources—the nation’s first cabinet level state agency for the arts, history, and libraries. According to the arts council, it receives an annual appropriation from the state legislature and from the National Endowment for the Arts. In addition, nonprofit arts organizations, artists, schools and others receive support by way of a competitive grants program managed by the arts council (NC Arts Council, 2013). A portion of the vision of the arts council reads, “the arts build bridges where diverse communities reach across boundaries to celebrate and share their cultures” (NCAC, 2013).

North Carolina’s visual arts resources and images are available and on display throughout the state in public buildings, in parks, and in the state’s art museum. The North Carolina Museum of Art houses thousands of works and volumes in its collections and library. It also includes a 164-acre museum art park, which includes over a dozen works of art and two miles of trails. According to the museum’s history, “the North Carolina Museum of Art [is] one of a handful of museums in the world with both a renowned traditional art collection and a large outdoor art park. Its 164 acres make it the largest museum art park in the country” (NCMA, 2013). In addition to the Museum of Art in the capital city, there are numerous spaces that house public art, including all seventeen of the state’s institutions in the university system. Several art galleries and museums that are a part of those institutions have opportunities and outreach activities that cater to the secondary schools’ populations.

While many states, including North Carolina, have included the arts and humanities in their basic educational goal statements, that aspect of the curriculum is still relegated to the fringes of the program and the school budget (Chapman, 2005; Engel, 1977; Remer, 2010). Additionally, Engel (1977) states the management of organizations established to further the
arts has turned into a large, disjointed network of bureaucracies, each vying for limited resources and competing with the schools at the state and local levels for needed support (Engel, 1977). Chapman (2005) agrees that the status of art education in schools hinge on the financial resources of the state and community in which it is located. Creating policies that ensure art is on the agenda for schools in ways that focus clearly on positive representations of Black people is key to art education policy discussion. When using CRT as a lens, Arts education policy discussions may serve to deconstruct dominating imagery and ideals, reconstruct common arts participation and contribution, and construct equitable narratives of people of color (Ladson-Billings; 1998), specifically Black people, in public collections and exhibitions in North Carolina.

**Critical Race Theory**

Critical Race Theory (CRT) emerged from law as a response to critical legal studies and civil rights scholarship and its scholars are concerned with disrupting, exposing, challenging, and changing racist policies that work to disenfranchise and subjugate certain groups of people and that attempt to maintain the status quo (Delgado & Stefancic, 2012; Ladson-Billings & Tate, 1995). A set of principles that all CRT intellectuals adhere to does not exist (Ladson-Billings, 1998); however, CRT offers the followings tenets as means to adding understanding and provides a framework for my research: 1) CRT acknowledges that racism is prevalent and permanent in America; 2) CRT challenges dominant ideology offering critiques to liberal ideals such as colorblindness and race neutrality, instead whiteness is a social gauge; 3) CRT encourages the use of counter-stories to dispel myths and
misconceptions depicted in stock stories (Bell, 1992; Delgado, & Stefancic, 2012; Ladson-Billings & Tate, 1995; Lopez, 2003; Solorzano & Yosso, 2001).

Ladson-Billings and Tate (1995) discuss the quantity and quality of school curriculum as they connect with intellectual property and property value. According to the authors, curriculum development must take into consideration the contexts of institutions, cultures, and policies. Access to schools and curriculum become forms of property to which whites are privileged, and the arts curriculum is included as a part of the school curriculum.

As a consumer of visual arts in all thirteen years of my public school experience, outside of Black History Month, I do not recall a significant art or art history lesson that focused on Blacks in art in America. Chatman (1993) and Keifer-Boyd, Amburgy, and Knight (2007) noted that the visual arts are in need of more minority role models in order to enhance the art education of not only students of color, but of all students. In addition, Chatman stated students would not have an exceptional education if they were only exposed to the works of a specific segment of society. Critical race theory is an appropriate analytic lens to utilize within art education research because it offers many opportunities to challenge norms ideologies and provide a place for the minoritized to give expressions and accounts of their experiences. Critical race theory does not offer tenets to provide an isolated explanation of race as an issue in art museum education, rather it allows me to focus on how it is an issue and what effects race has in the delivery of secondary art lessons.

Attitudes of appreciation for the arts as a useful skill and knowledge for students to have may be affected if arts resources are reflective of social and cultural injustices as theorized by Critical Race Theory. Perception is significant because of the position the arts
currently hold in education because, for example, I have witnessed occurrences such as arts classes becoming the first to be cut in times of financial strain. In addition, they serve as last resorts for students on a college trajectory, or are first resorts for students who have recurring behavioral or discipline issues.

Permanence

The permanence of racism as explained by Critical Race Theorists (Bell, 1992; Delgado & Stefancic, 2012; Omi & Winant, 1994) can be used to analyze the creation of art education texts and lesson plans, and is manifested through the critical race tenant of whiteness as property. Visual aids such as classroom posters and displays, visual arts literature, and opportunities for arts participation are concrete examples of tangible racist ideals. As it could be related to race and visual art education, Ladson-Billings and Tate (1995) offer apropos quotes from Cornel West and Lionel Smith, “race matters”, but “blackness matters in more detailed ways”.

The historical context of race in art education is defined and signified by imagery and lessons, both articulated and suggested, learned from those images. Bell (1993) proposed the permanence of racism and its application to American life, law, and culture. Art, as a distinct subset of culture, has become a social product in which artists are socially located. According to Wolff (1990), the language of art is itself culturally distinct and it facilitates and impedes the creation of cultural and social products. Those students who are able to participate in arts classes in secondary schools are exposed to images that perpetuate and often complete racist stereotypes.
**Colorblindness**

Themes often seen in CRT discourse include colorblindness as it relates to whiteness as property. Colorblindness is said to diminish the struggles and plight of people of color, and CRT scholars resist the term due to its ability to minimize such a significant part of what makes people of color different from the majority (Lopez, 2003; Lynn & Parker, 2006). Being colorblind and reducing the differences of Black people in the arts reflect the CRT tenet of whiteness as property. An example includes students who look at images that are more representative of them and see the beauty in men and women who are like them, or families who are participating in celebrations as their families do. When those students see the differences and appreciate them, colorblindness would suggest the student is off the mark and he or she should deny their race.

Micro aggressions as explained in CRT discourse about whiteness as property, is defined as, “the brief, everyday exchanges that send denigrating messages to people of color because they belong to a racial minority group” (Sue et al., 2007, p. 273). Viewing people of color more positively and frequently in works of art, specifically Black people, has been out of the mainstream because they were not seen as exemplary individuals in society. When the art of Black America and Black Americans is not political in nature, rather an attempt to merely being representational of one’s acceptance of his or her Blackness, it becomes a threat to the white properties of pride, respect, and intelligence (Cooks, 2011).

Omi and Winant (1994) assert that amateur biological beliefs provide a way of explaining differences in humans. It follows therefore, that racial character traits and orientations such as temperament, intelligence, sexuality, and aesthetic preferences are static.
and may justify differential treatment of racially identified people. The same amateur beliefs become apparent when the majority of the images seen of Black people in secondary art resources perpetuate irrational stereotypes.

As mentioned previously, the status of art education in schools hinges on the financial resources of the state and community (Chapman, 2005). Whiteness as property in art education is manifested when limited arts classes create an additional form of property that whites fight to normalize. One of many examples in visual arts access is resources used in secondary art classrooms. Some art classroom resources and visual aids depict whites in higher social positions, as dominant in war scenes, or owners of people of color. The secondary art students lucky enough to have the opportunity to visit local, state, and national art museums and galleries may be exposed to such images that are reflective of normalized imagery and ideals in the visual arts.

The National Gallery of Art has nearly four hundred pieces created by Black artists in their American art collection (NGA, 2013), which is highlighted online and includes twenty-two works on paper, paintings, prints, and sculptures. African Nude (1980) (Figure 1) displays a woman wearing only a large necklace reclining on a sofa. The National Gallery of Art’s webpage describes the piece as follows:

Her alluring position is similar to the pose found in classic images of odalisques—female slaves in the Ottoman Empire whose identities became sexualized and popularized during the nineteenth century. Yet unlike the seductive odalisque seen in Western art, whose gaze challenges by staring directly at the viewer, the nude in Wells' work, with eyes downcast, appears unhappily submissive and ill at ease amidst
the oversize lush plants and gala colors of the background. The viewer is thus left unsettled, as if unwelcome despite the outwardly inviting scene. (NGA, 2013)

Figure 1
James Lesesne Wells, 1980
African Nude

The description offered by the National Gallery of Art goes beyond the basic description of the piece, and instead adds the idea that her position is alluring, yet the viewer is unwelcome.
In addition, it is compared to sexualized classic pieces from a different period and further contributes to the over-sexualization of the Black female. The piece is not singular to the gallery in its depiction of women of color, as there are many more pieces that carry the same types of imagery and subject matter.

Kara Walker is a contemporary Black artist whose work uses silhouettes of figures that are usually exaggerated and overtly stereotypical. The piece highlighted in the online collection from the NGA is titled *Freedom, a Fable: A Curious Interpretation of the Wit of a Negress in Troubled Times* (1997) (Figure 2), and shows the story of a female slave whose dream of freedom really is a fable filled with ugly truths and continued hardships. The book appears to resemble a children’s book, however, as the National Gallery of Art’s description explains:

> Quickly one notices their demeaning postures and exaggerated features, which recall negative stereotypes of African-Americans portrayed in eighteenth- and nineteenth-century minstrel shows, novels, and art. Walker's figures depict a physically and sexually violent antebellum South, often the source of these virulent typologies. Walker's inversion of the portrait silhouette—a supposedly representative art form—reveals the corrosive power of stereotypes and prejudice. To heighten the irony and poignancy of her message, her cutouts are normally wall-size installations. (NGA, 2013)
Figure 2
Kara Walker, 1997
*Freedom, a Fable: A Curious Interpretation of the Wit of a Negress in Troubled Times*

Of the nearly four hundred pieces created by Black artists in their American art collection, highlighted online are twenty-two works on paper, paintings, prints, and sculptures. Of interest to my research is the fact that only two of the twenty-two pieces are currently on view according to the National Gallery of Art (2013). The two pieces that are on view at the time of this research include a landscape and a portrait of a white family that was painted by a Black artist in 1807. Both works by Wells and Walker, as well as many more public works of art, display what could be interpreted as victory of the dominant (privileged)
over the minority (subjugated) who must be conquered and or controlled in order to maintain white control and privilege (Sweeney, 2002).

Additional examples of images that show whiteness as property include resources that were delivered to my classroom, and over 76,000 other classrooms, public libraries, and Head Start centers, titled “Picturing America”. The set and resource guide was designed and created by the National Endowment for the Humanities to supplement the social studies curriculum through American art (NEH, 2013). The absence of the black faces in most pieces serves as a mark of whiteness as property, and a permanent reminder that was sent to art and social studies classrooms by a federal agency.

The limited number of Black people in the works can be interpreted as a representation of the lack of rights for Blacks in the years represented in the works, but I believe the limited number of images of Black people in general in the collection of large classroom posters is, as Gilborn (2005) stated, obscene and significant. The four images of Black people in the collection of fifty images are 1) Black Civil War soldiers being led by a white commander, cast in bronze that commemorate their service (Figure 3); 2) a contemporary painting of a stylized Black woman washing clothes (Figure 4); 3) a collage of broken Black faces in the inner city (Figure 5); 4) and a black and white photograph of people marching to Montgomery, Alabama to gain voting rights (the people are almost a blur) (Figure 6). The usefulness of the resource is evident, however, the portrayal of Black people in the collection is less than dignifying and is a literal illustration of the normalization, based on whiteness, of limited arts resources in public schools.
Omi and Winant (1994) assert that amateur biological beliefs provide a way of explaining differences in humans. It follows therefore, that racial character traits and orientations such as temperament, intelligence, sexuality, and aesthetic preferences are static and may justify differential treatment of racially identified people. The same amateur beliefs become apparent when the majority of the images seen of Black people in secondary art resources perpetuate irrational stereotypes.

Figure 3
Augustus Saint-Gaudens, 1884-1897
Robert Gould Shaw and the 54th Regiment Memorial

Examples of stereotypes students may be exposed to in art images and resources include but are not limited to Black men as bucks or child-like figures, Black women as hyper-sexed or servants, African nude women, and paintings of individuals in black face.
Hatt (2002) reminds us too of the Sambo image, which was one that depicted Black men as the singing, dancing, and sub-servant minstrel ready to please his white master, and how he (Sambo) will never reach the status of manhood and all of its rights and privileges. The first example mentioned above is described by Hatt (2002) wherein he gives readers a brief history of Black masculinity, or lack thereof, in American art. He asserts that the relationships and family life of slaves was depicted as happy, docile, and pleasant so that the white consumers of art would not be reminded of the true horrors of enslavement. Works that depict both the happy docile slave as well as the tangible tension between owner and slave can be seen in the works of Christian Friedrich Mayr titled *Kitchen Ball at White Sulphur Springs, Virginia* (1838) (Figure 7), and Winslow Homer titled *A Visit from the Old Mistress* (1867) (Figure 8).

In the Mayr painting, a Black family is seen inside their cabin dancing and participating in jovial activities, which, most likely, does not accurately represent the lives of enslaved Black people in America. The work is in the NC Museum of Art collection and is described as follows:

> This painting is remarkable for its vivid depiction of the private lives of African Americans in the antebellum South. However, these are not the farm laborers who comprised the vast majority of enslaved Americans. These are privileged household servants who have accompanied plantation families to the fashionable mountain resort of White Sulphur Springs. It was not uncommon for slave owners to sponsor dances and other social events for their servants. Visiting the resort, artist Christian Mayr was fascinated by one such ball, almost certainly celebrating the wedding of the
couple at center. Perhaps Mayr was amused at the slaves' imitation of the customs and manners of white society. (NCMA, 2013)

As the museum’s description notes, there were no balls, dances or parties had by the slaves that comprised the majority of the enslaved population at the time of the painting. The artist was thought to have been amused by the imitation of white culture and practices, which would be the only “culture” in which enslaved people of color could “imitate” or participate. This fantastic imagery was on display in order to keep white patrons interested as opposed to reminded of the true horrors of slavery. Currently, this type of image continues to keep viewers appeased in a sense because it is inclusive of people of color, however historically inaccurate it may be.

Homer’s (1867) work depicts a post-civil war free family being visited by their former owner. The white woman is dressed neatly and appears upright and dignified while the Black family, which consists of three women and a baby, is dressed shabbily and one member is almost cast completely in the shadows. The National Museum of American Art (2013) describes the piece as a portrayal of “the tension that existed between white plantation owners and their former slaves following emancipation. The women in the painting stand in a new relationship to each other that had not yet been defined. They face each other warily new narrow space, which no one moves to bridge” (NMAA, 2013).

Race and identity are also transferred through the works of Picasso and Gaugin, two well-known artists who are seen as exemplars in their respective styles and techniques of painting. I argue that because several of their works display women of color in a troubling light, they are participants in the CRT tenet of whiteness as property. Picasso, for example is
known to have looked to African images and objects for inspiration and ideas for his later works (Stepan, 2006). One such inspired piece is that of a group of white women whose faces are covered by African masks. The image could be interpreted as paying homage to the cultures he visited, however, Leighten (2002) asks viewers to take a closer look at the context of the work—prostitutes using sacred or revered cultural objects to hide their true identity.

Figure 4
Jacob Lawrence, 1940-1941
*The Migration of the Negro Panel no. 57*
Figure 5
Romare Bearden, 1964
The Dove

Figure 6
James Karales, 1965
Selma-to-Montgomery March for Voting Rights in 1965
Figure 7
Christian Friedrich Mayr, 1838
*Kitchen Ball at White Sulphur Springs, Virginia*

Figure 8
Winslow Homer, 1867
*A Visit from the Old Mistress*
The title of Picasso’s piece I use for discussion is *Les Demoiselles d’Avignon* (1907) (Figure 9), a portrait of sorts, depicting nude prostitutes in France. It, along with Gauguin’s (1848-1903) (Figure 10) nude paintings of young Polynesian girls, was said to be the beginning of primitivism in modern art (Chave, 2002; Leighten, 2002). It is noted that Picasso’s use of African masks to cover the faces of prostitutes is disrespectful and pokes fun at Africans, yet, this work, which was seen as offensive when first completed in 1907, has become the crux of a major art movement (Chave, 2002). Prostitutes were and still are seen as unsettling, unhealthy, unethical, and wretched; however, the modern art world and critics have hailed this piece as profound and monumental even though it makes a mockery of images and objects held sacred in some African cultures.

Social justice issues, such as disregarding cultural differences or disrespecting what some hold valuable as well as inequitable participation in the arts, are acknowledged by the majority when there are opportunities for interest convergence (Garber, 2005; Keifer-Boyd, 2003). Convergence can be used as an instrument to help explain and operationalize race and racism in the field of art education. It can serve as a tool to explicate and help make the salience of race and racism in art education resources and practices clear (Garber, 2005; Keifer-Boyd, 2003; Milner, 2008).

Chappell and Cahnmann-Taylor (2013) offer examples of how arts education programs become successes if they converge with interests of the majority when the majority realizes the benefit of multicultural education. The programs that have traditionally been “in-service” to minority populations become political targets and are dismantled when kept separate from mainstream educational services. It is the author’s suggestion that the
mainstream classroom become a part of the programs designed for marginalized students so that the majority student population and their parents realize the benefit and advantage of such programs to them. Collaboration, partnership, and dissemination of research are all needed in order for social change to occur.

Interest convergence was a factor in the public museum setting when Franklin D. Roosevelt’s New Deal and The Public Works Art Project (WAP) (Mankin, 1995) was created to provide work for artists in need of employment between 1932 and 1935; this later became a catalyst for the creation of the National Gallery of Art in 1937. Cooks (2011) describes two major exhibitions by Black American artists that occurred around the time of the WAP at the Museum of Modern Art (MoMA) and the Boston Museum of Art (BMA), which had two contradictory purposes and intents. While the BMA exhibition of Contemporary Negro Art (1939) was initiated to represent the development of Black artists who were set to take their rightful place in the world of art, the MoMA exhibition, Exhibition of Sculpture by William Edmondson (1937), presented a chance to display America’s awareness of primitive art (Cooks, 2011).

Both exhibitions were the first that showcased the art of contemporary Blacks in America at their respective galleries. The choice to exhibit was in line with the theme of progress in the WAP, but as varied as the reasons to exhibit, so were the responses to the works of art. Some viewed the gallery shows as a crossing-over of sorts used to legitimize Black art and culture (Cooks, 2011), while others saw the exhibitions as ephemeral experiments in contemporary gallery curatorial practices and presentation of
art. Despite the differing critiques, the interests of the artists and white America converged as “the art world capitalized on the notion of the primitive Black (and his art) to support its effort to define American identity, nationalism, and the rhetoric of progress during a time of economic despair and increasing nativist fears” (Cooks, 2011, p. 33).

Figure 9
Pablo Picasso, 1907
*Les Demoiselles d’Avignon*
Counter-storytelling and Recognition of Cultural Capital

The desire of Black people to “obtain freedom, justice, and dignity is as old as this nation” (Bell, 1992, p. 363). He reminds us, however, that racism cannot be eradicated and we should engage in racial realism, which tells us racism is permanent and integral to American society. To address the permanent place in American society, CRT accepts experiential knowledge through that use of storytelling, narratives, and counter-narratives, thereby providing a voice for people of color (Ladson-Billings & Tate, 1995; Lopez, 2003; Lynn & Parker, 2002; Solorzano & Yosso, 2001).
In order to maintain power and control, majority groups contribute to the creation and maintenance of stereotypes and negative images of minoritized groups. Realities, experiences, and perception are all subject to interpretation and those patterns of perception become forces of habit and reduce our ability to rationalize and instead accept the condition and state of race and stereotypes to be just the way things are (Aguirre, 2000; Delgado, 1989, 1992). Narratives and counter-stories act as supports when analyzing common cultures and manufactured depictions of people of color. The use of “voice of others” allows the oppressed to describe and give credence to their stories and realities (DeCuir & Dixson, 2004).

After a thorough review of arts literature, galley exhibitions, and art education curricula, the usefulness of counter-storytelling and the realization of cultural capital appear to be essential tools crucial to offset the abundance of white standards in arts education (Barone, 1992). Critical race theorists’ use counter-storytelling as a tool for giving voice to those whose stories are overshadowed by stock stories that are usually seen as superior (Aguirre, 2000; DeCuir & Dixson, 2004; Delgado, 1989). The author also notes that the narratives are not meant to serve as subjective stories but rather as meaningful episodes to counteract stories of the majority. The use of counter-storytelling in art education is documented in Invisibility of Blackness: Visual Responses of Kerry James Marshall (Whitehead, 2009) and Storytelling for Social Justice: Connecting Narrative and the Arts in Antiracist Teaching (Bell, 2010). Whitehead (2009) gives an account of how Marshall uses his art to address race-related subjects he encountered including the Civil Rights Movement, Black Power Movement, housing projects, and the role of blacks in society. While the
Whitehead work is an article describing an artist’s work, Bell completed a book chronicling how race is constructed as a form of difference and social justice. The book was an examination of how counter-storytelling may reproduce and challenge stock stories and how the arts expose and analyze images and patterns that reinforce racism.

The model created in the counter-storytelling project *Storytelling for Social Justice* (Bell, 2010) was created around the idea that storytelling and oral traditions are democratic and freely available to all. The four types of stories told through art explained in the book are stock stories, concealed stories, resistance stories, and emerging/transforming stories. Stock stories are those that are the most public in American institutions—the tales told by the majority. Concealed stories include those that are not in the mainstream yet are circulated, told, and retold by the minoritized and confront mainstream stories which portray strengths (cultural capital) of marginalized communities. Resistance stories are described as a warehouse of demonstrations of resistance to racism, and emerging/transforming stories are those formed to deliberately deconstruct and challenge stock stories.

The art curriculum developed around the storytelling model (Bell, 2010) was used in a high school as well as for in-service teacher education and professional development. The author specifically noted the usefulness of the awareness of cultural capital in the creation and implementation of the curriculum. Aspirational, familial, linguistic, social, and resistant capitals (Yosso, 2005) were manifested, both purposefully and inadvertently, by the students who created works of art based on the storytelling model.

Cultural capital and funds of knowledge are accumulated unique knowledge, learning and thinking essential for individual, household, and community wellbeing and survival.
Participation in the arts by people of color, specifically Hispanics and African Americans has seen a steady decline since 1982 (Engebretsen, 2013; Rabkin & Hedberg, 2011). The reduced access to arts education for people of color is significant and should not remain lower than that of white students. The varied studies that have proven the arts to be beneficial to students by way of increased academic performance and college attendance (Brewer, 2002; Chapman, 2005; Mishook & Kornhaber, 2006; NAEA, 1994, NASAA, 2013; NEA, 2013; Rademaker, 2007; Ruppert, 2006) are of great importance. Access to and participation in the arts are essential to success for students of color in the arts fields.

As a child, I studied and pined over the art of native Durham artist Ernie Barnes from the 1970’s television series Good Times, while searching, to no avail, for images in my art classes like those I saw once weekly from Barnes (Figure 11). It is imperative for children of color to be exposed to images, works, and opportunities that do more than seek to benefit
those who traditionally have been in positions of both power and privilege. As noted in the North Carolina bill, the arts play a significant part in the development of student self-perceptions; 21st Century art students of color may continue to have few opportunities to see positive likenesses of themselves in mainstream media and art galleries, as well as in literature provided by art classes in secondary schools.

Figure 11
Ernie Barnes, 1976
Sugar Shack

Although there is a wealth of research on arts education policy (Binkiewicz, 2004; Chapman, 2005; Engel, 1977; Hatfield, 1999; Hope, 2010; Lowell, & Ondaatje, 2006; Scott, 1970), Critical Race Theory (Bell, 1992; Delgado, & Stefancic, 2012; Ladson-Billings &
Tate, 1995; Lopez, 2003; Solorzano & Yosso, 2001), and critical analyses of arts activities
and participation (Bell, 2010; Chatman, 1993; Desai, 2010; Garber, 2004; Rademaker, 2007;
Ruppert, 2006; Stuhr, Ballengee-Morris & Daniel, 2008; Wolff, 1990), I found very few
studies and texts that addressed art museum education programs and resources as they are
situated in Critical Race Theory. Arts educators are not yet inundated with standardized tests
and assessments, therefore, the legislation and policies that states have passed and adopted
stand apart from most educational mandates, and have become necessary only as funding
allows in some instances (North Carolina General Assembly, 2009), and somewhat symbolic.

Secondary public arts teachers that utilize public art museum and galleries as sources
of exemplar works, occasionally unwittingly, serve as stewards of the arts as well as the
primary source of access to the arts for many children. These significant tasks and
responsibilities of arts teachers coupled with the lack of knowledge of the presence of critical
race tenants within art museum curriculum creates conflict with arts students’ perception and
choice at the classroom level. The need to create engaging lessons, ensure all students are
given the opportunity to have genuine meaningful arts lessons and experiences, and provide
exposure to varied age appropriate skills may create further conflict with the student as he or
she is faced with the lack of positive representation and low participation of people of color
in the arts. It is important for the benefactors of racial privilege to recognize their positions in
public art museum education that has served to produce ideological models that have both
directly and inadvertently contributed to the detriment of minoritized art education students.

Discussions about art education practices and theoretical perspectives that could
contribute to creating conversations and curricula that specifically aim to address the need to
reduce and eventually eliminate white privilege in visual arts pedagogy, praxis, and practice in the secondary school setting need to occur on a regular basis. School reform efforts and teacher education have focused on relationships with community and the individual, and between the cultural, institutional and social worlds individuals find themselves in (Chappell & Cahnmann-Taylor, 2013; Marron, 2003; McDermott, 2005, Stevenson & Deasy, 2005).

Hope (2010) advises ensuring terminology related to arts policy is used realistically so that words like creativity and innovation do not become rhetoric. I would enhance that suggestion by adding culture and diversity to the list of rhetorical terminology that art educators and arts policy makers have used frequently. Finally, Hope suggests using arts education research findings accurately and completely in the promotion of the arts in education, to which I would append, increasing CRT research in art museum education to assist in creating more meaningful arts policies and curricula.

Lastly, I concur with Strom (2004), who holds that the debate about the arts must be concise and clear because the arts do not have the same policy agendas as more traditional policy issues, and advocates must be creative in how they shape their message so arts-focused goals can be addressed in a more effective manner. It is my desire to shape another creative, yet poignant, argument about secondary arts education delivery, consumption, and influence.
CHAPTER III
METHODOLOGY

To see things or people small, one chooses to see from a detached point of view, to watch behaviors from the perspective of a system, to be concerned with trends and tendencies rather than the intentionality and concreteness of everyday life. To see things or people big, one must resist viewing them in their integrity and particularity instead. One must see from the point of view of the participant in the midst of what is happening if one is to be privy to the plans people make, the initiatives they take, the uncertainties they face (Greene, 1995, p. 10)

My research focus is a narrative inquiry on the perspectives of secondary art teachers in North Carolina and how they allow for opportunities to address race in lessons or curricula they develop. I specifically explore the following research questions:

1. What are the perspectives of secondary teachers in North Carolina as it relates to addressing race and identity in their classrooms?

2. How do North Carolina secondary art teachers develop lessons when referencing or visiting public art collections?

In this chapter, I explain how this study was carried out using a narrative inquiry research method as data was viewed through a CRT lens. Interviews and curriculum content data were analyzed using the CRT tenets permanence of racism and colorblindness. The chapter reveals the details of the research process by describing the research design, data collection and analysis processes.

A qualitative research approach was appropriate for this study because the primary focus of the research question was to reveal complex contextual factors such as collection composition and individual experiences of art educators that could not be expressed through numeric analysis. Denzin and Lincoln (2000) distinguish differences in quantitative and
qualitative research by offering an explanation that states the importance of qualitative research exploring the “socially constructed nature of reality” (p. 8). The authors also note that the inquiry is shaped by the relationship that is formed between the researcher and the research, and situational constraints. Alternatively, quantitative research creates an emphasis on measurement and analysis of relationships between variables as opposed to processes.

**Narrative Inquiry**

Through use of narrative inquiry, researchers gain a better understanding of complex situations while learning from the varied points of view of study participants (Chase, 2005; Connelly & Clandinin, 1990; Kramp, 2004; Pinnegar & Daynes, 2007). In addition, qualitative narrative inquiry that includes multiple narratives is increasingly informative because each story increases benefits found in data analysis and allows for deeper understanding through participants’ emotions, thoughts, and researcher interpretations (Chase, 2005; Connelly & Clandinin, 1990). Qualitative researchers who utilize narrative inquiry attempt to understand, rather than explain, through the use of story or narrative, how humans experience the world.

The context, complexity, and relevance of narrative inquiry in education are important because the personal and social stories of humans that are constructed and reconstructed (Connelly & Clandinin, 1990) offer descriptive stories of the human experience. In this instance, the contexts of secondary art teachers’ experiences, locations, and histories played a role in the development of art education curricula and lessons that effected subsequent consumption of works by secondary students. Additionally, the context of the social and cultural atmosphere of individual schools (Guba & Lincoln, 1994) at the
time of lesson creation played a part in the analysis of the lesson plans. Study complexity was gained when determining how cultural traditions and norms played out in curriculum development while factors such as teacher willingness to consume public works, social contexts of works of art, and cultural differences in classroom populations were considered.

Examples of narrative research in art education include experiences of educators and students engaged in reflecting on arts practices and techniques (Coufal & Coufal, 2002; Keats, 2009), creating resistance narratives to address research and curriculum related to art education (Rolling, 2011), and “art as narrative inquiry can function as a mode of constructing, generating, and representing knowledge as well as contributing to the goals of self-understanding and narrative truth” (Bochner & Ellis, 2003, p. 510).

The nature of interview analysis and interpretation allowed for many explanations and understandings of lesson plan development and ways in which teachers addressed race. Therefore, I emphasized the specific characteristics of each participant’s narrative and ensured the narrator’s voice was made evident (Chase, 2005). Finally, the relevance of this study to the field of art education research is embedded in my analysis of lesson plans, as it was determined how teachers address race in the secondary art classroom. It is the hope of the researcher that the study audience will be able to ask challenging questions and determine issues and implications of the study that are applicable to multiple teachers, schools, and possibly, public art museums.

The narratives compiled for this study were categorically bound together by events, perceptions, and experiences (Kramp, 2004; Polkinghorne, 2007). It is clear that the narratives in this study were “socially situated interactive performances”, (Chase, 2005, p.
that were told to the researcher in a specific setting for a specific purpose. As Connelly and Clandinin (1990) note, the task of narrative inquiry is to offer audiences accounts of the continuous and interactive process of human stories. As I analyzed the data collected from each participant interview, I was able to learn about the complexities, and contextual differences of each account, and thoroughly study teachers’ ability and willingness to address race in order to gain a better understanding of the role of the secondary art teacher plays in the understanding of public art collections and exhibitions.

**Research Design**

**Study Participants**

Merriam (1998) and Creswell (2007) hold that narrative study is best for capturing the details of individual stories. To that end, I identified teachers who had several years of teaching experience in order to provide meaningful explanations of the opportunities for students to address race in secondary art classrooms. The research question of how teachers address race in lessons developed when referencing or visiting public art collections was investigated through interviews with ten teachers. Teacher participants included those from schools that had visited or viewed works from a public collection with students within the past twelve to eighteen months.

The teachers were selected through criterion sampling, which requires all participants to meet a specific predetermined criterion in order to inform the research (Merriam, 2002; Patton, 2003). With that requirement noted, all selected teacher participants included secondary school public art teachers in North Carolina who had taught for four or more years, and who had visited or viewed public works of art with their classes within the last
twelve to eighteen months. I chose four years of classroom experience because the hands-on experience and developed skills of veteran teachers allowed for an in-depth interview that included many examples from lesson plans and curriculum offerings. It is through interviews and analysis of lessons from teachers who have real-world application of planning and teaching techniques that this study properly evolved.

It was anticipated that the multiple perspectives of the arts teachers would provide a wealth of information for analysis and provide substantial descriptions of the contexts of the narratives. The art teachers bear the load of curriculum development, lesson plan creation, and product creation for students who have become consumers of public works of art at the secondary levels.

**Curriculum and Lesson Plan Content Analysis**

This narrative research also includes content analysis of lesson plans developed by the study participants. This unobtrusive method allows qualitative researchers to investigate materials created within society (Hesse-Biber & Leavy, 2011). It was determined that a wide range of opportunities for art planning was available, and that variety aided in creating additional dimensions of interest and identified common patterns (Creswell, 2007; Patton, 2003) that crossed the many variations of art curricula.

The systematic examination of art teachers’ lesson plans allowed for added dimension and increased understanding as participant interviews were analyzed. This study identified subsections of art lessons, which included opportunities to express ideas through varied media and techniques, the ability to use writing and storytelling through art, student exhibits, and oral expressions that emerged as students addressed race in art. The ability for students to
express themselves culturally and socially in art is necessary when allowing students to have an authentic arts experience (Bell, 2010).

**Data Collection**

Creswell (2007) and Merriam (2002) give researchers a clear guideline to reference when beginning to gather data. The process involves locating a site or individual, gaining access to the site or individuals, and developing rapport with the study participants. Following the initial steps of data collection, researchers must engage in purposeful sampling, accurately and thoroughly recording information, resolving field issues, and storing data. In addition, a data-gathering plan was created before materials were collected and prior to interviewing participants and reviewing the gallery and museum images presented to students. The plan consisted of those presented by Stake (1995), which included identification of individuals who can assist in data collection, including gatekeepers, a list of data sources, a calendar/timeline, and expected expenses. In addition, a data storage system and a research log were utilized in order to maintain effective organization of collected information and materials (Altrichter, Feldman, Posch, & Somekh, 2007; McNiff & Whitehead, 2010).

Of primary importance was journaling and maintaining a log of research activities (Mcniff & Whitehead, 2010; Ortlipp, 2008). Streib (1993) describes the use of journals in a longitudinal qualitative study and its possible use as curriculum. The log created during this study became a record of my research decisions, ideas, and insights pertaining to the narrative inquiry method. My journals and logs will be used to build upon for future arts education research, visual arts curriculum development that focuses on public arts resources,
and arts education policy impact studies. Journaling was important and integral to my research process because it served as an instrument to illustrate the importance of connecting the permanence of racism and colorblindness in arts resources to participation through counter-storytelling in the arts.

Individuals identified who were able to assist in data collection and serve as gatekeepers included classroom teachers and district level arts education directors. When explaining my research interests to the gatekeepers, I made it clear why their respective site was chosen, and offered an approximation of time needed for participants to complete the interview process and or assist in contacting other study participants. The gatekeepers and participants were informed of my intention to report study results in the form of dissertation research and write-up. It is my hope that individuals will gain information and insight into the ability for students to address race in their respective plans and curricula.

The primary source of data was from interviews conducted with the ten study participants and lesson plans and curricular materials used in their classrooms. Observations of study participants’ lessons, documents, artifacts, images, and researcher log reviews were used as secondary data sources for this study. Interviewing in qualitative research requires relationship development and craftsmanship (Chase, 2005; Seidman, 2013; Patton, 2003). The social context of the interviewing relationships between myself, and the study participants played a part in the data collection.

Gender, race, and years of employment also played a part in the interview process, therefore I maintained figurative distance from the study participants in order to allow them the opportunity to form independent responses to my queries. Observations of lessons taught
allowed for real-time contextual study of participants, and became an additional strength in data collection (Seidman, 2013).

It was my plan to have teacher participants that represented varying educational backgrounds and epistemological views, worked in diverse school cultures, and were allowed differing resources available at his or her disposal. To that end, semi-structured interviews, with open-ended questions, were conducted with each of the teacher participants in the study. Individual interviews did allow for detailed descriptions of factors that affected curriculum and lesson development around public art resources. The interviews and observations took place over the course of one school semester, and occurred during the second semester of the school year.

Most of the interviews with each of the arts teachers lasted approximately one hour with time allotted for reflection and research logs to be completed. Observation and field notes from interviews provided valuable contextual information for the study which included settings, materials available for student use, participant demeanor, level of enthusiasm, and perceived amount of interest in student consumption of public art resources. The two lessons I observed were brief and to be continued during the following class meeting.

Documents collected and reviewed included art education department meeting minutes, lesson plans, and units of study from teacher participants. The collection and review of those items allowed for discovering unanticipated facts that informed the study. In addition, the documents served as substitutes for activities the researcher could not observe directly (Creswell, 2007; Merriam, 2002; Patton, 2003; Stake, 1995). The documents offered
a broad coverage that included a long span of time and various events and settings for art lesson plan creation.

Field issues that were faced during the research design and data collection included dealing with the sensitive issue of race and its possible indefinite presentation in the form of treasured and respected works of art, transcription of the many interviews that were conducted, and attempting to limit my projection of my agenda, culture, and status into the interview (Creswell, 2007). Locating documents and materials did not present a significant field issue because many of the requested documents had been previously saved by the study participants.

The research data storage system was comprised of hand-written notes and observations that were transferred to a personal computer. Data was collected using two digital recorders, and will be kept confidential under password protection. A back-up storage drive was kept in case of computer failure or loss of written documents, and a master list of data types was developed which included a matrix to assist in locating and identifying data (Creswell, 2007).

**Data Analysis**

Establishing clear themes and subsections when completing findings from raw data ensured transparency and defensible interpretations. After review of data, the researcher created categories from phrases and themes used in interviews, observation and field notes, and document review. Criteria for interpreting findings as described by Bernard and Ryan (2010) and Chase (2005) were not precisely set, yet it was the researcher’s goal to analyze data and interpret identified patterns. Such patterns included simple ones that involved an
analysis of word count, theme identification, participant responses related to curriculum development, and arts participation opportunities. A more complex method of analysis included identification of subtopics, contradictory points of view, and new insights gained from documents and participant responses.

The analysis of data using triangulation (Hesse-Biber & Leavy, 2011; Patton; 2003) provided information to create a framework and descriptive narratives for this study. To contribute to the credibility of the findings, triangulation of data sources occurred, as the findings were checked against other perspectives and sources. The descriptions included a range of topics relevant to the research questions and design, which included curriculum development and the perceived or measured presence of the permanence of racism in arts resources, opportunities for meaningful and authentic counter-storytelling, and student participation in the arts.

The research attempted to identify specific and clear opportunities for students to create counter-stories while participating in the arts. As stated previously, the usefulness of counter-storytelling and the realization of cultural capital are essential tools needed to offset the wealth of white standards in secondary arts education. Counter-storytelling is used as a tool for giving voice to those whose stories are overshadowed by stock stories that are usually seen as superior (Aguirre, 2000; Delgado, 1989). The opportunities for art students to create counter-story narratives are not meant to serve as the occasional subjective story, rather as meaningful incidents to offset stories of the majority.

Data coding, classification, and interpretation processes were carried out in order to describe setting contexts, explain what was discovered in lesson plans, and detail what was
articulated through the interview process (Creswell, 2007; Patton, 2003). It was expected that coding of data would result in representation of information that was expected to be present before the study was conducted. Codes that represented surprising information not expected were included as well as codes that represented information that was conceptually interesting or unusual (Bernard & Ryan; 2010; Creswell, 2007; Merriam, 2002).

After the initial coding of data, larger themes were developed in order to examine what or who had been excluded or whose stories had been silenced in the lessons and curricula. As suggested by Creswell (2007), double entendres as well as deliberate statements and expressions were analyzed to reveal possible sublime and blatant subtexts within the lesson plans as well as interview narratives.

**Validity and Reliability**

The use of multiple interviews and lesson plan analysis helped to confirm emergent findings, and as data was later analyzed and triangulated, patterns were identified that coincided and strengthened the study (Creswell & Miller, 2000; Connelly & Clandinin, 1990) and increased validity and reliability. Teacher interviews allowed for insightful interpretations, lesson plans were reviewed repeatedly for patterns, and observations of lessons taught provided opportunities to develop thoughtful interpretations of teachers’ behaviors and motives for developing lessons related to race and identity.

Merriam (2002) discusses in detail the best practices for increasing validation and reliability in qualitative research such as narrative inquiry. Several methods were used to increase validity and reliability, which included member checks, an audit trail, peer review, and maximum variation sampling. Member checks allowed study participants to review
interview transcripts for plausibility and provide feedback while an audit trail provided a
detailed description of procedures, methods, and events that created decision points during
the study. In addition, the researcher used peer review by way of discussions about raw data
as well as interpretations of data with a “critical friend” in the form of colleagues and fellow
researchers in order to gain additional insights (Mills, 2006; Stringer, 1993).

**Researcher Bias**

As necessary in qualitative research (Merriam, 2009), I identified my biases
developed as a result of being an art teacher for over 17 years and a supporter of the arts in
K-12 schools. As I researched, gathered data, and later analyzed data I attempted to bracket,
The process of setting my personal experiences aside in order to attempt to understand
different perspectives required constant self-checking as I gathered and analyzed data.

My lengthy career as a classroom teacher gave me empathy for the teachers who are
responsible for lesson development. The planning and carrying out of arts lessons is not
straightforward, nor is it unproblematic, especially when incorporating issues such as race
and identity. Simultaneously, my permanent position as a person of color created a bit of
frustration about and opposition to the fact that stereotypes are perpetuated in a place I find
valuable to the development of appropriately educated citizens of the world.

**Ethical Issues**

Stake (1995) and Cousin (2008) discussed the need for researchers to abide by ethical
obligations in order to keep misrepresentations and misunderstandings at a minimum. Cousin
offers four notions which include to “do no harm”, to “be open”, to “be honest”, and to “be
careful” (p. 17). A written description of the research in the form of an informed consent with the right to withdraw consent was provided to study participants prior to undertaking the research process. An additional step was taken in the study in order to protect the privacy of participants by assigning aliases to locations and participants.

The ethical considerations the researcher adhered to for this study involved the extent to which study participants’ voices were heard, collection and management of data that was sensitive and personal, and the relationships between the researcher and the participants. There were ten study participants involved in the study, and it was the responsibility of the researcher to ensure each participant was properly represented, and his or her voice was heard and appropriately represented in this study.

In order to protect anonymity at an additional point in the research process, all data collected, both public and private, will be stored in a secure location and limited access to private data will be granted to peers for review (Cousin, 2008; Creswell, 2007). I recognize the intrusion my presence created as interviews were completed, and I maintained a professional and least intrusive position during the research process.

**Limitations of the Study**

As stated in Creswell (2007), narrative inquiry researchers must be able to collaborate actively with individuals participating in the research, therefore, the study is limited to ten study participants. Many teachers have limited hours of availability, which required flexibility and precise planning in order to visit all participants specified above. The study participants’ level of interest and desire to respond thoughtfully depended solely on their personal effort and concern or attention given to the study topic. Seemingly reduced interest
affected the variety of the responses and diversity of lessons and in-class activities represented in the study.

A final note is my limited participation in large-scale research projects and my position as a novice researcher. The details and minutiae of narrative inquiry require giving unwavering attention to all aspects of the study. I maintained focus on the purpose of the study as it aligned with the literature and body of knowledge related to CRT and art education during progression of the study. Through contact and support from my dissertation committee and critical friends I was able to complete this study, which has become a source of success for me as well as the students of color who benefit from the arts.

Summary

This research was an opportunity for scholarly inquiry that attempted to illuminate the ways in which secondary public arts lessons and curricula address race. Using a qualitative narrative inquiry approach and content analysis, selecting teachers that have the ability to create lessons developed when addressing public art offered opportunities for significant and meaningful research that is important to the art student/consumer as well as classroom educators.

This chapter detailed the research design, data collection methods, data analysis techniques, ethical issues faced by the researcher, and limitations of the study. The following chapters will first detail participant profiles, offer descriptions of selected sites, and present study findings. The study will conclude with connections to past research, implications for policy, and recommendations for art studies and future research.
CHAPTER IV

FINDINGS

The findings of this narrative inquiry reveal concerns about and ways to address race in the secondary art classroom, the idea of the creation or realization of self through the arts, communication through the arts, and resources needed to teach the arts in a secondary public school classroom. All of the concerns have considerable meaning for both students and teachers in North Carolina public schools.

This narrative inquiry was carried out through data collected from the stories and thoughts shared by ten teachers. Narrative data were collected during interviews with the teachers over a period of four months. In addition to participating in interviews, participants offered examples of lesson plans they have used in their classrooms. An analysis of those documents allowed me to gain an in-depth understanding of what students in the participants’ classrooms are asked to learn and know.

The participants in this study identified themselves as teachers who have been teaching for four years or more with a degree in art or art education. The teachers were selected because they reflect and represent the population desired for this study—the individuals have taught for four years or more, are secondary public school art teachers in North Carolina, and have visited or viewed public art collections within the last twelve to eighteen months. The participants included two Black men, two white men, three Black women, and three white women. The following pseudonyms were used for the participants: Alexandra, Blair, Camille, Dana, Emerson, Fred, Greer, Helena, Isahna, and Jasper.
As I began the participant selection and data collection processes, I emphasized to the study participants that they were serving as co-researchers as I attempted to gain understanding of lesson planning and curriculum development as they considered resources, images, and race. Throughout the interview and analysis process I remained aware of the need to accurately and fairly allow the voices of the teachers to be heard. Criteria that influenced how I chose each part of the stories to tell included critical events or ideas that influenced teachers’ decisions when lesson planning, the narrative indicated a change in the art teacher’s decisions to include images reflective of people of color, recurring themes found in several of the narratives, and specific thoughts or ideas stood out as significant and important to my research. This chapter will be presented in two sections with teacher narratives first, followed by findings of the document analysis of participant lesson plans.

The narratives revolved around several ideas, however the four foremost themes were: (a) the desire to be an effective educator while ensuring student success; (b) using art as a means of communication and expression; (c) the use of technology as a virtual museum and research tool in middle and high school art; and (d) insufficient resources available for participant use and classroom materials. The narratives depict relationships that are developed, differences between teacher and administrators’ approach to education, and connection to and participation in arts and culture. The narratives also reveal significant stress and angst regarding levels of success as art teachers and the level of support given versus the level needed. I conclude each narrative with final thoughts about participants’ classes, resources, and lesson planning.
Teacher Narratives

Alexandra

Alexandra is a fourth year teacher who was excited about the arts and teaching, and after earning a Bachelor of Fine Art degree and a Master of Arts in design and fibers, she went immediately to work in the classroom. She responded to my email request to participate in my research, and when we met, she was ready with a set of questions to ask me after the interview concluded. Her “laid-back” artistic style was evident in her countenance and dress, and she presented herself as such. We chatted informally for a bit before the interview began, and she let me know she was happy about her current position and is not looking for anything new right now. I am not sure why she shared that bit of information with me, but it is important, as I found other participants less than satisfied with their positions and the current state of education.

Alexandra’s school is one that was “created” with funds from a grant awarded by the Gates Foundation. The high school is divided into four smaller learning centers, each with their own administrative team and academic goals. Alexandra believes the schools should be recombined and designated a “regular” high school due to the varied levels of success in what she called an “academic experiment”. In addition, the funding for the grant has ceased, and the district is spending additional money to employ three additional principals for one school that is an average sized high school in the district. The number of students in Alexandra’s school is 450, and the total between the four learning centers is approximately 1700.
The demographics at her school are “interesting” to her as well, in that it is comprised roughly of one third white, one third Black, and one-third Hispanic/Latino. She resides in a part of her county that has a large percentage of Asian residents while teaching in a school that has students of Asian heritage comprising less than one percent of its population. She said she often hears disparaging remarks about Asian students and attributes it to lack of exposure and ignorance as opposed to genuine dislike and hate. Alexandra believes that the students she teaches in the rural part of her county “don’t get out that far.” She recognizes the issue and attempts to “humanize the Asian students by bringing in works of art from Asian artists and the Asian culture."

She has taught art for four years and still questioned her ability to really be a good art teacher. Alexandra explained her philosophy of education is to meet students “where they are” because we are living in an increasingly visual world. Students in her classroom are given opportunities to understand and communicate through the creation of art works. As we discussed her philosophy, Alexandra emphasized the ability for students to have “a unique voice in communicating something about the world- they can use art as a tool for understanding themselves and understanding the world.”

The art students she taught visited an actual museum with her once and many times digitally. Alexandra uses technology regularly in her classroom, explaining that she visits museums pages at least twice a month with her students as a research tool. She encourages inquiry-based teaching models and allows students to work on one concept in different ways-working often at different paces, with varying media/techniques, and often collaboratively.
She noted the frequent use of Google (as a verb) to remind and refresh students of ideas they may have been working on in their art class.

As with many participants, when asked how they determined which images they use for reference purposes in their classrooms, their answer, like Alexandra’s, was “it depends.” That response was consistently followed by an example. The example given by Alexandra was a lesson on advertising and how artists can use their work to make a statement. Students in her upper-level classes chose a socio-political issue they were passionate about and explored a statement they wished to make about the issue. The students had the option to choose art techniques based on a concept map created by the district.

Alexandra (along with many other teachers in all subject areas) had to “rethink” how the second semester lessons would be developed in order to have increased success in her classroom. She listened to her students and their interests as she developed and redeveloped lessons each semester. Students expressed interest, and Alexandra went with the changing tide in her classroom based on student conversations, interests, and motivations.

The use of technology is encouraged in her school and in order to take advantage of students’ interest in cell phones, tablets, and computers, Alexandra developed a lesson based on digital photography and its importance in the students’ lives. She turned their everyday activities into a lesson on traditional vs. contemporary photography, composition, and visual literacy. She noted that the teacher who was there prior to her arrival was “rigid in his approach to teaching” and he lectured the students daily about art history and “old masters”. Alexandra’s lessons were getting away from the traditional sense of art history and toward a novel way to teach what students need to know. She expressed her desire to bring images of
people that looked like them and that were closer to their age that they could relate to. She noted, “sometimes I need some type of soap opera drama to hook them in.”

As students develop lessons, they also develop ideas of self. Alexandra’s belief is that art has its “own agenda” and it helps students form who they are. She spoke about how she had seen the “power of self-discovery” through art and caring mostly about showing her students the importance of the processes of art. In the quest for a final project, students go through an important series of steps to ask and answer many questions that other artists may have asked and answered as well. The connection between the student and the professional is one that Alexandra reiterates to her students in every lesson.

Time is a resource that is a factor when planning and visiting museums for Alexandra. She teaches on a block schedule and expressed difficulty in the class make-up. She has four levels of art that she teaches simultaneously, and finds it tough to make it around to everyone and address all the students’ needs. Her visits to museums and galleries require pre-visit lessons; she finds it challenging to differentiate the lessons in order to have a successful museum visit. “I didn't even make a field trip last year, so I'm not sure if money was really an issue.” Alexandra is the only art teacher at the school and the arts department is quite small. The band and chorus classes at her school have booster clubs that pay for most equipment, field trip costs, uniforms, and extra classroom items. She stated, “I usually make reasonable requests, and they haven't said no yet.”

The conversation continued about state and district level resources offered to secondary art teachers. Alexandra believed they aren't exactly useful, including the district resource arts curriculum, which she finds “terrible”. She noted, “It's kind of like a pacing
guide but it's just such an old way to tackle art education… many of the projects are boring, and they're probably the same projects that my parents were doing in high school. You can tweak those and use those as a starting point but I think it needs to change a little.” Every school has the curriculum map available, but it's not required that art teachers use it. She said, “I have the freedom to make up whatever lessons I want to, according to my own curriculum, and that's wonderful and terrifying at the same time.” Her suggestion to improve the curriculum is to have some sort of unit comparable to the North Carolina Museum of Art. She discussed the use of a database/collection of lessons other high schools in the district are attempting to create for secondary teachers.

Alexandra’s art classes have not benefited from any individual grants, but she expressed that she has “big plans for this year we'll see how many of those plans come through.” In the past, she used money allocated for her classroom for consumables such as paper, pencils, paints, etc. She had not purchased any books because she felt, “there are a lot of books hanging around laying around in the classrooms, because there were two are teachers in the school and the other school cut their art teacher position. There are lots of things, just a lot of stuff that's in my room. We are just going to sort through it all we just have to find the time to sort through it all.”

Alexandra and I found it absurd and wasteful to think that there is such a disparity in the allocation of funding for arts programming and teaching in many counties in North Carolina, and there is no time or effort given to devising a plan to sort through the “stuff” in some classrooms. In Alexandra’s case, she stated that the administrative team and bookkeepers don't tell her how much money she has allocated for her classroom needs and
supplies—she is to merely submit a budget to them and wait for approval. She said that every year she “kind of tiptoes and tries not to make too many waves, but this upcoming year I'm going to let them know it will be helpful to know how much I'm able to spend.”

Blair

Blair and I met in a local restaurant to eat and chat. She arrived with a sunny disposition and a huge smile on her face. Our conversation before the interview was on the subject of enjoying summer break and spending time with family and friends. Often non-teachers feel the summer is too long of a break for teachers and students, but Blair and I feel it is sufficient and could last a few days longer. We talked about the classroom joys, stresses, and our favorite assignments we complete with our classes.

She completed her undergraduate studies at Washington and Lee University in Virginia and studied biology and art. Even with a double major, she had to hold various jobs in order to help her parents with expenses. Blair completed her Master of Art Degree in art education at UNC Pembroke two years ago and is happy that experience is over, as she put it, “it was a crazy beastly bear”. The program took her two and a half years to complete, after which she went back into teaching art immediately.

She obtained her latest teaching position she got immediately after starting her degree program, so she had a full time graduate degree load and was a full time teacher. Her previous school “was really different. It was almost like a private public school and there was really little diversity there, both among the teachers and among the students. And so we did the civil rights moment project. The project was centered around the movement and I thought it was really important for them to learn about that.
Blair had developed her philosophy about teaching and art education and found it to be:

Very personal... my parents... I was always an artist and my parents supported that as long as it was a hobby. But certainly not for a career, and so it's always been sort of personal, not a vendetta, I just have issues with art being valued and seen as important. So I wanted to be an art teacher where I could show students that the process of creativity and problem solving that is in a way related to a different side of the coin. Lets say different from the language of and the action of creation… and that's really that's who I am.

When asked if she has taught anything besides art, she responded with that well used phrase “that depends”. I completely understand why she said it depends, because as an art teacher we often encompass different subjects and incorporate those skills and concepts into our lesson planning.

As we discussed visits to museums, Blair responded, “I haven't taken my students on a field trip in a few months, simply because of the logistics. And, I've only been doing this four years, and I have also made three changes in positions in three years.” With the transitions, Blair came understand the varied site-level process for planning a trip outside of the school. She, along with many teachers question how to coordinate the buses, how to get paid for the day if a substitute is needed even though you are working and teaching. Her last outing with the students was a collaborative project with an African American art museum space. She worked with two other teachers in her district and held a “big show” that included sculptures her students created. It was a show that focused around the anniversary of the
Civil Rights March on Washington. Blair remembered, “a lot of students that came to that opening also got to see shows in the cultural arts centre downtown.”

Factors besides getting to know new administrative teams that affected whether or not Blair took her art students to galleries and museums included time and monetary resources. She lamented:

Yeah, we have no money. I was at a school this year that had a zero dollar budget. The two art teachers taught 2/3 of the school which was roughly... I taught about three hundred students and the other teacher taught 300 students. So, 600 total. So we raised money and we sold and receipted $14,000 of cookie dough. And we got to keep $6000 of that… And that's how we funded our big project. We got paper and things like that. But I our county, the arts do not receive a budget or anything. We tried several times to coordinate a field trip… The students wanted to go to the museum in Raleigh, but logistically it was just a problem.

At her new school, Blair put in an order for art supplies and said, “they haven't batted an eye yet, which is good.” The supply order was for basic classroom consumables such as paper, pencils, markers, and clay, which totalled approximately $1000. With that limited amount of supplies, Blair will have to teach art to more than 700 students. She recalled that at her first school, that was elementary, she had $75 for over 800 students. “It was just the teacher allotment, but that was a different county. I mean it’s terrible it’s dire. I mean I don't really know how we are expected to do our jobs on zero... I pay for it myself basically.”

As we talked, I kept thinking we (art teachers and arts administrators) need to develop sister schools and partnerships in order to help the teachers who may be less than 100 miles
away who have no budget from their schools and districts. As with many teachers, especially those with no budget, Blair said, “I've always found a way, but it’s been very frustrating to see it for what it is. And my county is... I would a say a fairly well to do county.” I would have to say well to do is accurate, as it has 120 schools, serves over 72,000 students, and according to the census bureau (US Census Bureau, 2014), is considered a metropolitan area in the state. Like Blair, the visions that many art teachers have cannot be carried out due to budgetary constraints. She noted, “It was really frustrating to have a vision and have this great idea and knowing it could be pulled off but many, many times I thought it might fall through because the funding to get there wasn’t available.”

We then discussed how she chooses specific images to supplement her lessons in her classroom.

That's really hard. I really feel overwhelmed with the amount of material, and great material that is out there. I usually try to find lesson plans that I think integrate subject matter and things that are relevant to students and where they live. I look for things that will get them excited in the classroom. The civil rights one that I did... I think it is so important for them to see that right here in our city, we had the sit in movement and to do the March on Washington...it was just the 50th anniversary last year and that was amazing to let the children see what really happened.

After she develops a plan, she said she usually finds or creates a lesson plan like the one she used for the museum exhibition that will capture the kids attention while teaching them about history, culture and their community. When teachers see that it's exciting and try to share that excitement with students, it often creates a great chemistry in the classroom.
Another artist used as reference in Blair’s planning is George Chagall and the pop art movement. She recalled showing them images from history that he created based on the Holocaust and the Great Depression. She also incorporated the work of James Barnhill who is a local sculptor nationally known for his “amazing bronze figural works.” He visited Blair’s school and talked to the students about art as a profession, sculpting, and the arts history in the city. After the discussion, Mr. Barnhill encouraged the students to visit the museums and galleries in the state.

Technology use in her classroom is ever-present. “Yeah, I'm an avid Pinterest user and I am also aware of the NC Museum of Art which has a wonderful... a really good website for teachers. And I sort if peruse the material during the summer or really any time. I think it's fun. And when I find something I like, I will incorporate it.” The NC Museum of Art also offers in-person workshops for teachers in the state, but Blair has yet to attend one. She said she would love to, but it just hasn't worked out for her yet. She did say she was set to attend a workshop at the public university in her city as well as an online art education conference. I found it refreshing that Blair uses local artists to reference in her classroom. “Like do you know Cassie Stevens? She is this crazy, in an awesome way, elementary school art teacher somewhere in the south. But she will like dress up every day and it will relate to her themes for her classes. She's like kind of ridiculous but awesome if you like that stuff.”

When planning lessons for her students, she stated, “I try to relate art to their everyday lives. I want them to know that art is not just in museums. It can relate to their thought process.” She went on to give another example of a lesson plan that focuses on typography and graphic designers. The students discuss careers they could have as artists,
and an additional one with engineering as the focus. She actually goes through the actual process of creating and engineering an amusement park ride.

As mentioned previously, Blair found it very important to address social justice, culture, and race in her classroom. She is a strong believer in the idea that art helps students have a better understanding of self. “I love the quote that I have in my classroom. ‘Art is what teaches children to be more like themselves instead of like everybody else’.” Figuring out what you like as a person includes a creative play aspect that is often included in the secondary arts curriculum. Projects like self-portraiture, especially in the middle school years when children are trying to find their identities, becomes a means of expression that, as Blair put it, “helps them narrow it down.”

Textbooks and other supplements for Blair’s classroom have accumulated for years in her current building. She attempts to make good use of the material that is there, but finds the books archaic and not interesting to her students. As the school year ended, she was already planning for the following school year, thinking of recycling objects in order to have art projects like turning water bottles into flowers that resemble the works of Van Gogh.

When asked if she could have any resource, Blair mentioned technology, but not in the way I expected. She said,

What's really interesting [is that] last year, I was a part of the tablet technology that our county received. So we got a Race to the Top Grant and we got millions of dollars for these tablets. So every teacher got one and every student got one. And it was completely flawed... They broke a lot, the wifi was frustrating, the students learned how to abuse them very quickly.
In the same segment of our conversation, however, she noted their usefulness,

But at the same time it was awesome because I could have students do individual research for projects. So I could show them on my projector examples of art, things like what we needed to look up... I actually had them go to the endangered species list and find an animal they wanted to work on. And we did a project on it based on James Audubon. And it was great. And then they got taken away. So as far as resources go, I wish I could have.... Instead of iPads, or some kind of tablet.... I had a smart board in elementary that I loved. I do not have anything like that at my new school. As far as I know I don't have any technology there, not even a projector. So I am not sure what I am going to do. I have heard that some private donors may be working on getting the art room some things like that. But technology is what I want. And a kiln.

Her classes have benefitted from grants, with the first received for the project she completed for the civil right project. The grantor was the local arts council, and it was for $1500 dollars, which is a significant amount for any public school in the state. Blair thought, “it was great because an art teacher friend of mine and I went to Costco and we bought hundreds of rolls of tape and we got a great picture of us doing that. And otherwise we wouldn't have had an opportunity to do a project that had so much of an impact that was so impressive because we didn't have anything. We didn't have any money. And the rest if it we paid for with the money we earned. I love grants I'm going to write more.”

As we concluded the interview, Blair shared a few final thoughts about lesson planning and her classroom.
I think it is extremely important for art teachers to have the freedom to devise their own lesson plans. I'm a huge proponent of the common core. I think it is great as long as it is not specifically dictated through professional development or administration that tells us what to teach and when. I think art teachers need the ability to assess their own students.

She also shared the project she was most proud of—the one with the Civil Rights Movement. She took the initiative and got the work done. “It was not one that was done through graduate school... It was not one that was done through professional development... It was myself, and a group of art teachers who sat down and said a lets do this. And it was great! So, the freedom to do what we knew would be just right was awesome and fulfilling.”

**Camille**

Camille invited me to her home and welcomed me in on a Saturday morning. Her energy was contagious, her enthusiasm refreshing, and her helpfulness was unlimited. As with previous and subsequent interviews, we started with a conversation, but this was a lesson in what to do as a professional and peer. I was given contact information for other artists and teachers in the state that may be willing to participate in future research. Her personal contacts and friends included artists, art teachers, school administrators, and the district’s arts administrator. Camille found the friendship and work relationship with her district’s senior level arts administrator “really awesome… she's one of those people that I'm so glad she's in my life. She is so incredibly wonderful.”

Having studied out of state, she earned an undergraduate degree in art education from Buffalo State College in Buffalo New York. She later earned a Master of Arts Degree in
curriculum and instruction from City University in Seattle Washington. She was living and working in New York and moved with her sister (who now lives next door to her) to Washington state. It was immediately evident that she found comfort and pleasure in connections with her family and friends. This included her two lovely young children who patiently waited, upstairs in the studio, for our interview to end.

Her philosophy on education is founded in her belief that all kids can do anything. We share a few classroom guidelines, and I found it wonderful to hear that there are others who don’t allow children to say they can’t complete a task or assignment.

I don't want to ever hear I can't I really believe that all students can enjoy art. I have a few that try to tell me I can't I can't do art and I give them examples of if you do what you need to do work hard it'll work out. I always try to start with a lesson that will help them succeed... so I'm not giving them an A, they're really earning that A, so I really just want them to feel success. I tell them that they can do it, even if they say that they can't draw a stick figure. But I tell them they can.

In addition to having the students feel success in the classroom, she is so satisfied with what she does with and for children.

I just love what I do and I want students, even if it's not for art, I want them to have a passion about something so hopefully it will develop that sense of passion in my classroom. And then if that leads to an art career great, and if it doesn't, I want them to be aware and talking about something. It doesn't have to be art but you have to be passionate about something. So hopefully they will develop that sense of passion in
my classroom. And I tell them I want you guys to be passionate about something it doesn't have to be art but you got to be passionate about something.

In addition to art, Camille has taught core subjects. In her first and second years of teaching she was a building substitute, “so [she] taught some of everything”, and in her third year of teaching, she was a language and reading teacher. She has been at her current school eight years, teaching solely art.

Museum and gallery visits in Camille’s art classes usually occur at least once a year. We discussed the Norman Rockwell exhibit that was at The NC Museum of Art and recalled how it effortlessly tied into the US history curriculum. She reminisced in such an emotional way saying, “I almost cried when I saw his work. He's my favorite artist, and I wish he was my grandpa. I really understand his sense of that juxtaposition of youth and old age… it reminds me a lot of my family because I feel like a lot of times families get away from that tradition.” She continued talking about family values and expectations such as sitting down and having dinner as a family together. We agreed that things like that are so important to children. “Like a lot of family values I think we're getting away from a lot more, and our society is a really quick society.” She continued talking emphatically about her love of Rockwell’s work. She has also attended several of the workshops at the NC Museum of Art. She noted that they are, “really great... and not even for the continuing education credits, it's just nice to go and learn, and be the student and plus a lesson plan is given.”

A surprising revelation was Camille’s abundant and seemingly limitless access to resources such as time and money:
I've been very lucky in my current position… we just got a new principal. My former principal basically got me whatever I wanted or needed. We try to order supplies for a few years in advance and there are certain things we order that I need every year but everything else I tried to order separately. This year was our paint order year so I try to hover around $600 or $700. To be quite honest I couldn't tell you how much I get, I try to be very frugal with what I get and I make it last. I make sure my kids don't waste. I make sure I'm very frugal with my supplies you never know some one may say we don't have a budget!

I conveyed my envy and let her know how wonderful it is to have that kind of support at the school level. I explained to her that some art teachers in large districts in our state have a zero dollar budget. She was surprised and did not realize there were still secondary art teachers who could not place orders beyond what the administrators allowed them to order to begin the school year. Camille continued,

My new principal just told me yesterday, because we are a 1 to 1 technology school, every kid has a laptop. The 6th grade gets one laptop cart per team, and we had a laptop cart that held 25 laptops and I took it one day and I just left it there in my classroom. They knew where it was and my former principal said to just keep it in my classroom if I need it and it stayed in the classroom as long as I needed it. I did have to share it with the sixth grade teacher if they wanted it. My new principal said we have a lot of money to spend and she asked what I needed and I said 16 iPads and she said ‘done’.
She requested 16 because she has 32 seats in my classroom, so there's one tablet for two students to share. She believes every student doesn't need one and sharing requires the students to collaborate as they work on projects and art research.

In addition to monetary support and resources, time is not an issue in her school. Camille explained the school’s schedule and there is an abundance of common planning time for teachers to collaborate. The administrative team covers classes for core teachers so that they can have additional planning throughout the week. Camille explained the curriculum mapping that another teacher found not useful. The integrated lessons were a focus of her undergraduate studies and practicum, “they said make sure you integrate your lessons, especially with social studies, language arts, math, and science.” We both believe integration adds depth to all curricula and it makes lessons more meaningful and impactful for students while helping them reinforce skills. She recalled, “I've done that my entire career and it was nice to come to a school that still does that and unfortunately we got away from it but our new principal wants to get back into it.”

Beyond the classroom, when Camille takes her students to galleries, she explained that she tries to make sure the students remain engaged and busy. Sometimes students can very easily get distracted, or “others can't appropriately walk through and really get a lot out of the opportunity and experience.” An example of her gallery lessons is having the students choose five pieces in the exhibit and answer several questions about each piece. She gives them, “a little bit of guidance and maybe a short activity and then time on their own to explore.” When they return to the school, the core teachers also incorporate the gallery experience and lesson into their teaching.
The lesson plans developed by museums and galleries have been of use to Camille, “but I tweaked them to make them fit”. She talked about The North Carolina Museum of Art’s excellent concept maps and how smart they are. She also uses writing in her lessons through NC Write. The formative assessments have writing prompts that use a piece of artwork from the North Carolina Museum of Art. The students view the pieces and use a graphic organizer to write about the works of art.

The ideas and themes Camille explores when taking her classes to view works of art are based on personal interests of the students and herself.

I just like to hear their opinions because a lot of times when you get older you formulate your own opinions and you kind of get stuck there. You formulate your opinion and it's kind of hard to deviate from that. It's nice to hear their opinions because they do just as much talking as I do. I already know how I feel so I want to know what they feel… it's a lot of their opinion and why they feel that way. It's not just, ‘I don't like this piece’, its why they don't like it. They have to use specific vocabulary to explain it. I try to work on having them use their own voice at school. I don't want them to just tell me they like this work, I want them to tell me how it makes them feel. I ask ‘what colors do you like?’ ‘What are the elements of art on the wall? Use those words. Use the words on the word while to describe what you're saying so that we can understand.’

When considering and addressing race in her lesson planning, Camille let me know she tries to be diverse in her choices of plans, but also tries to collaborate and ties her lessons in with what her students are learning in social studies. She noted, “if I can tie in multiple
core classes and core artists from different cultures I try to do that as much as I can. Sometimes it doesn't work so well.” Because some units are so specific, she cannot get too creative in her planning. She did describe a lesson that she recalled from many years ago that addressed social justice music of the 1960’s in which she discussed the Vietnam War, Martin Luther King Jr., and women’s rights issues in society.

Personal expression and self-identification is addressed in her planning as she offers students different ways to express themselves, not just through art, but through “writing, talking to me, speaking... I want the students to have understanding. I think art sells itself... I don't have much of a struggle once they get the concept they understand it.”

Camille uses journaling in her classroom on a regular basis and allows her students to tell her what they do and do not like. As in the gallery assignment, she asks what they would change about works of art and what they want to see more of. “I try to give them many different ways to find their voice in the classroom—not just with art but as a kid as a middle school student.”

Camille finds resources in her school helpful, but feels the “art text book sucks. I feel like it's a college book. I very rarely use it because I feel like it's way above their ability level and I just don't think it's okay for our classroom. I don't care for it.” Since she is not pleased with the text adopted by her district, she too uses many different electronic and web-based resources including the North Carolina Museum of Art, The Getty Museum, and The Guggenheim’s online images and lessons. Of final note, due to the substantial financial support Camille’s program received, it was not shocking to hear that at the time of our
interview, Camille had not applied for any grants because she had access to sufficient monetary support.

Dana

This is one of several interviews I looked forward to conducting. Dana is a thirty-year veteran art teacher, has travelled the world, and has such an interesting outlook on life, art, and education. We started the interview at her dining room table and concluded on her patio, watching deer graze in a field next to her country home. She has a flair for the dramatic, a love of color and visual movement, and the best sense of humor.

We began as all of my interviews had, with conversation and a brief discussion about education and training. “I was schooled in a small, private schoolhouse in the northern United States,” she began. She attended a Historically Black College and University, Morgan State University for her undergraduate studies, and earned a Master of Art Degree from the University of Pennsylvania.

Her words were slow, purposeful, and she seemed to be reading from a storybook as she spoke. Dana told me to be sure that I believed that, “art is necessary… it is an expression of self… of life… of everything.” After I assured her that I concurred, we continued in the purposeful manner in which she began. “I have not taught anything besides art, because art encompasses it all,” she said. “I visit museums as often as I can and I have been in so many museums and galleries I cannot remember them all by name, but each one is now a part of me as well as a part of the children I took to them.” The Corcoran, The Smithsonian, The Guggenheim, The Museum of Modern Art, The NC Museum of Art were spoken of, but there was no mention of specific images or artists, yet.
If there are exhibits about Black people or any indigenous people, Dana exuberantly expressed that she was “all over it!” She emphasized the importance for all children to see that sometimes it's about how works of art make them feel, when the images look like them or something they have experienced, and when they don’t. She said, “so determined is my mind to get and see, that even the doors and sidewalks of museums become experiences that I share with my students. I ask them, ‘how do you think we came to be in this place, on this walkway, through these doors?’ ‘Why did the architect make us walk east instead of west to get to the door?’ ‘What do you want to see and hear when we enter their space?’ Questioning is my answer to more questions.”

I did not expect Dana to use lessons provided by galleries and museums, but she did so on a regular basis. But of course, there was a little something extra added to them.

When I use those lessons, I explore with the students what they feel about what they're looking at and what they think the artist was trying to convey or portray or give to the viewer. There is a gift in everything visual. There is a gift in things heard and touched as well. Do you think it is fair for people who cannot see to have to walk in a space and not experience it at all? I let the students feel the art and express what they feel about the art.

She continued to talk about lessons provided by museums and the ideas and themes that she explored with her students. She felt that the importance of art movements and periods such as expressionism, abstraction, and modernism were not important for children to need to know at this point in their “schooling”.
When asked about lessons that address race, she replied, “In my classroom I address race regularly. There's no need to dance around it… the beauty of the world, the diversity that we share, and the individuality that we all have is one of the greatest lessons we learn.” She reminded me of lessons I too learned as a Black student attending a predominately white school—if you don't know who you are then you don't know anything, and according to Dana, “art is just another expression of people, so when you delve into that part of humanity, there's nothing other than knowledge of self that can be gained.” It was obvious that she expected her students to have a sense of agency and self-direction.

Dana’s thoughts about resources were in line with other study participants in that resources such as time and money are quite often factors that affect the major and minute happenings in public school classrooms. Having taught in segregated schools, she knows very well that, “everything in the public institutions is about money, everything costs money, and you have to have resources to do the things that students need done.” She found resources that were available but not at all helpful. She did find it important to note that regardless of resources, opportunities abound when teachers become creative and resourceful advocates for their students. “As an educator I think it's worth exposing, particularly children of color, to art and the importance of art. As we learn who we are, what we are, where we are going… to that I say no, the resources are definitely not sufficient.” She believes money is a part of the improvement of many schools, as well as a means to eliciting and gaining the expertise of a variety of artisans and artists throughout the state and other states that could collaborate with teachers.
Dana’s art class has benefited from grants, but not in the traditional sense. She told me about how she wrote letters—which would amount to a formal grant application—to organizations, businesses, and museums soliciting help for her art classes. She has received thousands of dollars in materials, money, and time offered for services because she was determined to have her students “become great people first, then great artists.” She has been able to purchase supplies, texts, and some videos with allocations from her school.

The interview with Dana was not as long as others, but it was nonetheless meaningful to my research. We concluded with a few final thoughts, and she proposed,

I think education can be fabulous, but North Carolina has a bit to learn about art and how we educate the whole child. It's not just the class children need to take to get out of taking something else, or a filler class. There are many wonderful students that are truly talented, and if they could have the opportunity and have that type of exposure and learn about their own creativity and expression it would be phenomenal… it could change everything for them. Most of our children need us, and we need them too.

Emerson

The first male teacher to reply to my invitation to participate was Emerson. He lived several counties away, so it took some time to coordinate our schedules and get together to talk. He was from a small town and had lovely small-town manners. We are approximately the same age, but I was addressed as ma’am throughout our conversation. The coffee shop where we met was locally owned and full of the best local art in the area. There wasn’t an empty space on the walls, and it was great.
Emerson earned a Bachelor of Fine Art from The University of North Carolina at Greensboro. After graduation, he worked for 6 or 7 years in the professional art arena, and later decided to return to school to get his North Carolina teacher license. He was very proud of the fact that he decided to teach art and discussed his previous career as a graphic designer and commissioned painter. He felt his real space was in a classroom teaching high school students how to prepare for the “real professional art world” as he put it. His philosophy about teaching art is that,

Art is a talent, but still a skill that can be picked up, and since I work in public schools, I look at myself as helping children become students of art. They don't necessarily have to become artists because everybody doesn't need that formal training… They just need the drive to want participate in the arts in some way. But students who are in my class, I do my best to make sure they are successful, even if they are not innately a visual artist.

Within the last year, Emerson has taken his classes to art spaces outside of the classroom five times. Normally, he visits museums once or twice a year. He felt the exhibits and spaces were “calling him” this last school year. He talked about the political issues on education and expressed the importance of staying aware of the political climate, but more aware of his attitude toward teaching, as he did not want to become disgruntled and have the students be unintended victims of his frustration. The museum he usually visits is a part of the local university. The most interesting exhibit he recalled was one that featured Alexander Calder. He recalled the movement, art, and science that went into his creations and how the students were all amazed as well. Emerson felt the education liaison at the museum was very
helpful and instrumental in creating opportunities for his classes to attend and learn. “She came to my school and talked about some things related to Calder and his art. She really prepared us for our visit so that when we went we knew what to expect and what to look for in his work.”

Since the museum is less than a mile from his school, Emerson did not have many issues planning field trips to that museum. His main issue was finding time to visit, as he stated, “because it seemed like we were testing every other day last year. When he found the time to travel outside of the classroom, he looked for exhibits and artists that “peaked my interest and the students’ interests.” Many times, the lessons he created for gallery visits were a result of cross-curricular planning on his part. There were lessons he developed and trips he planned based solely on core teachers’ units of study.

When I choose exhibits to view, I think it's important for students to recognize the connection between the arts and history, and how it ties in with a lot of things from our culture and the cultures if others. The elements of art, culture, community partnerships... I consider all of those things. I look at the pacing guides from the state, and tie in lessons with that. Sometimes I seek out info from the students to see what they are learning in other classes so they can make connections to what I teach in art.

There were no specific images Emerson looked for, but there were ideals that he had as he researched. He wanted his students to see as many types of art as he could expose them to, and as many varied methods of thought and creation. He also uses technology in his classroom on a regular basis to research works of art and artists. “I look for websites and
information about those artists. We talk about it and have class discussions about what they see. We then compare and contrast with the pieces they have seen in my classroom.”

As it pertains to race, Emerson stated,

The issue of race in my class and social justice does not wait for February. I try to include artwork from different cultures and talk about how those artists influence history in general. For example, I teach collage and talk about a NC artist Romare Bearden and his impact on the Harlem Renaissance and how that, in turn, became so important to US history. I talk about Frida Kahlo and how her work and the work of her husband influenced the political scene of Mexico at the time. Her imagery and self-portraits and her contributions to the art world is so important. They addressed and sparked social issues that were happening at the time.

In Emerson’s classroom, students are encouraged to constantly think about and express ideas about themselves and what they want to create in art.

I think innately, art helps them to express... I try to reinforce the basics so they have a better way of expressing themselves. For example, if they are making a narrative about themselves, and they have stick figures, then I will show them how to use realism and expressionism to better represent what they are trying to say with their art. I talk a lot about symbolism in areas well with my students and the usefulness of using them.

Funding from Emerson’s district is not always filtered to his classroom/ department. “I’ve had the experience where the arts coordinator would tell me how much money I have, but it doesn't always... well... it doesn't seem like that in the administrative end at my school.
I fill my requests at the beginning of the year. I didn't get the supplies I was expecting, and it made me upset. But once I began to understand how things work, I tried, but it didn't work in my favor.” He feels any and all resources are helpful in some manner, but he also believes he could always use more. Like others I interviewed, Emerson holds himself somewhat responsible for acquiring his classroom supplies. He stated, “I feel like I have to hold myself more responsible and accountable for making that happen as we'll, but it's up to us as educators to go out and seek it to make it happen to put into the classroom.”

The ability to teach all forms of art is of concern for Emerson as well. He expressed his feelings of having a weakness as an art teacher. He would like to have his students work in clay, but because his school is a renovated and redesigned YMCA, there is no logical safe space to put a kiln. We realized that it was not redesigned with all art media in mind.

We concluded the interview with his final thoughts about teaching art and its importance to secondary students,

As a matter of fact, I just had a conversation with my administrator yesterday about my feelings about the electives not being respected as much as the core teachers are. Especially when we have our professional learning community days. It just seems like things like professional development are geared toward and tailored to core teachers and their needs. And we are... like the electives are just like islands. I think that when a school environment becomes inclusive and our goal is to help a child, then we should use every thing we have available to make that child successful. Learning shouldn't be a limitation and a box that we put our kids in. The shouldn't be
a piece here and a piece there. There should be an effort to make it cohesive and to try to make it so that everybody is on the same page.

Fred

Fred is a nineteen-year veteran art teacher who has been in the same district for his entire teaching career. He was fun to look at (he wore a blue and white striped suit with a bright orange shirt and orange socks) and fun to talk to. Fred presented himself as open and willing to take on a challenge. We met at his school and every person that passed him in the hallway gave a greeting and a smile. There were a few former students helping in the school over the summer, and they all embraced him and told him all about their college plans. He seemed to be a very popular person in the school.

He received his Bachelor of Art Degree in Art Education and a Master of Fine Art Degree from private colleges in the mid-west. He emphasized the lack of diversity at the universities, as he noted, “The only time I saw people of color while in college was on television or online.” The lack of diversity was a reason he sought out employment at a school that was very diverse. He said the only way we can live in this world and be normal is to “see and enjoy something other than oneself.”

The teaching philosophy that guides Fred is a simple one, he said, “I believe that I'm there to teach all who want to learn… and I do teach even those who don't want to learn. Because of the environment we are in learning and we will learn.” He continued with his belief that students need to have an understanding that art is everywhere and it is in everything. He reminds his students that, “without art there is no design for our clothes,
shoes, homes, cars, and even the phones they use all the time! Everything is art, and they need to understand that without art there will be nothing.”

Besides art, Fred has taught or tutored reading, language arts, and math. In his current school, he has been a part of the school improvement team, and is required to have a remediation group every day. It is mandated by the school’s improvement plan. Fred wished he had that time for planning in the arts, but he cooperates willingly and has an easy time keeping his group engaged and active in their remediation class.

In his art classes, Fred visits museums and galleries at least once or twice a month with his students. He lives in a city with many gallery and museum spaces and said, “because were so close to exhibits I think it's important for them to see new shows and new artists. It is important for them to know old masters as well as contemporary artists.” The most recent field trip involved so many participants, he was asked by the museum staff to bring fewer or give them time to provide additional docents for his groups. Even though he often has issues with funding for the trips, he is determined to make sure his classes get out and see as many shows and art pieces as possible. Fred said, “Sometimes money is a resource that is an issue, especially if there is a museum or gallery that charges fees… some students do not have the ability to pay, and I will have to cover the cost- because we will all learn, no matter what.”

Before selecting shows to visit with his classes, Fred said, “I usually browse through fliers and exhibit announcements and see what interests me. I always pay attention to what the kids like… we frequently talk about current events and contemporary ideas, so I will choose exhibits that I think they will be interested in seeing. I pretty much just let my soul
take me to the best one.” As with other study participants, Fred develops his lessons based on contemporary artists and issues, as well as with what they are studying in other classes. He noted, “I try to compare and contrast the differences of the developed exhibits compared to what I've done with the students in the classroom and what's in our current literature and textbooks.”

Fred’s description of his use of time during the school day could be described as having military precision. He seemed to carry out his instructional day with as much care and humor as he did his choice of clothing. He said,

I use my time in my classroom very wisely because it's important that students are able to gain every bit of usefulness out of time in my classroom… I know that the arts are quite often put to the side and not focused on as much as core subjects. I think it's important for students to see a little bit of everything—painting, drawing, sculptures, every genre, style and media process there is to see. I also think it's important for students to be exposed to, and open to, the ideas of new concepts and things they haven't seen before or things that may spark a conversation or may spark some sort of unrest or some sort of debate either internally or with their classmates.

He used conflict as a teaching tool in his class and found a low level of stress to be helpful to the students’ creative processes.

When creating lessons for his advanced class, Fred let me know, “I base a lot of my lessons on with the students already know, what they need to know, and what I think it's important for them to be exposed to. I meet them where they are because I know every student does not come in with the same level of exposure to the arts and I know that everyone
does not come in with the same interest in the arts, so my lessons touch around everything that every student needs.” When choosing specific images or visual aids Fred has lessons that allow his students to choose what they're interested in and what they want to see because he wants to keep them motivated and “hooked on art” in his classroom.

Conversation is the vehicle through which race is addressed in Fred’s classes. When I posed the question about how he approaches and tackles the subject, he answered with careful thought—-as if he needed to ensure very word was exact. He said, “I just tell true stories that may be happy, and may be sad. Race and culture are not words that are taboo, rather I bring them into my conversations and lessons in meaningful and purposeful ways. My students are never made to feel embarrassed about who they are or what questions they may have during our conversations.” Fred’s use of stories seems to work well for him as he teaches. He also explained how he tells stories in order to get the students interested in biographies of artists.

Like other teachers that participated in this study, Fred found art to be one, if not the only, approach to allowing students to discover and express themselves. When we discussed how students come to understand who they are, he described a lesson he was visibly excited about. He said, “Yes. Yes. Yes! Creating self-portraits with words.” He went in depth describing a lesson about self-identity and self-knowledge. Fred’s explanation indicated careful planning for and consideration of his students. When my students create art it opens so many opportunities for thought and action. I enjoy watching them go through the process of thinking and analyzing interpreting and judging their own work. Art makes them reflect, question, and consider other points of view and create new points of view.”
Fred is lucky to teach in a district that provides funding for his art program. “Yes, I do receive funding from my district for classroom resources, but I always feel like there's a little more that I want for my kids… because there's always a little more than I want them to do.” He expressed an interest in allowing his students opportunities to use a wide variety of media, and to use professional grade materials. I understand his desire, because lower quality materials do have quite a different result when working with art media and techniques. He said,

We could get, not necessarily more expensive stuff, but more substantial and higher-quality materials in our classroom. I think this is especially significant for the students who are really interested in art and dedicated to craftsmanship. I think it's important for them to be able to use high quality materials that quite often have a different result than the student-grade papers, the student-grade paints, or with the student-grade markers… they need to know how the different media respond or react to one another on a professional level.

Grants have played a part in the acquisition of resources in Fred’s class. He has applied for individual grants as well as ones that require teams of teachers to apply.

Fred’s final thoughts were about his physical classroom space. It is large, and well-lit with massive skylights. There is a wall of storage shelves and cabinets, a large supply closet, a kiln room, and a wall of windows that opens to the front corridor of the school. He closed with, “my classroom is an open, wonderful, magical, transformative studio space that makes one get excited about creating. I make sure it is an environment where students can be
stimulated as well as relax. They can always have a moment to be in the zone of thought or in
the process of creation.”

**Greer**

My interview with Greer was puzzling, yet beneficial to this study. We began thirty
minutes late and it was conducted with a sense of hurriedness on his part. There was no
initial conversation about the purpose of the study, or questions about what would be
expected. His first words were, “what do you got for me?” I did not take offense to his pace
or straightforward mannerisms, nor did I attribute it to anything personal.

I will present this narrative as it unfolded, just to offer the reader a bit of a glimpse
into how dissimilar it was to the other interviews for this study.

I started the conversation with a question about education, his response was, “I have a
Master’s degree in special education. I have a BA in liberal arts.” I smiled and went to the
next question about a philosophy on education, to which he replied,

I was asking myself a question last year about whether or not I have a philosophy… I
threw my educational philosophy out the window. I believe you teach students where
they are and you take them from where they are and then you build on the skills that
they already have. They might have some skill, they may not be at a skill that is at
standard, but you actually try your best to bring them up to par or up to standard
level.

We continued. Greer informed me that he taught for twenty-one years, and he then
looked at me and said, “what now?” At that point I was ready to end the interview and thank
him for his time, but I decided it would be best to remain positive and professional. We
briefly discussed visits to museums and galleries with his classes. He began with, “I am in museums and galleries twice, maybe twice a year. It depends on what's going on. If there is an exhibit they are showing that I have an interest in… if it's a major person that I have an interest in, I may want to check it out… then I'll go… but otherwise I don't.” I found it profound and enlightening that his somewhat dismissive and disconnected persona probably translated to his pedagogy. Perhaps he was having a bad day or perhaps the interview would miraculously turn around and become the best part of my study. I waited anxiously.

After a bit more prying and asking leading questions about his classroom resources and further reasoning behind choosing specific exhibits, Greer replied, “money is an issue that I face with every trip… because you literally have to pay for the substitute teacher. If I try to plan for trips, they (administration) are not making it easy for you to do that. They start making you get into the logistics about getting a sub, getting a bus, and eventually it falls on the responsibility of the student to have to pay a fee just to visit the museum and it could equal up to thirty or thirty-five dollars.” I was excited to get more than two words from him, although he seemed to become a bit frustrated as he discussed difficulties he had with is school administrators.

I continued the line of questioning and asked about his use of lessons provided my museums. He said, “I don't necessarily take the lessons they create or use what we see. When we are at the museums, we are at the museum. I don’t revisit it in my classroom… I don't necessarily do that. I don't think in my curriculum and things I want to target myself in terms of visual content or visual literacy I don't think it translates into that.” I wanted to ask him why he took the time to visit, or why he didn’t find it important to make connections with
students’ experiences outside the classroom, but I did not find it appropriate at the time.

Again, I wanted to exit the coffee shop and head home to prepare for my next interview, or work on transcribing the previous interview, and yet, I stayed put.

The conversation continued as I focused on his lesson planning and curriculum development. Greer did not find the use of themes important in his classroom, he said,

Instead of themes, I look for technique and application in the making of things. I look for that content. Something that I hope the students will do is some critical thinking about how they are creating works… the process, the use of materials. I'm not trying to make a connection to current events that are happening in society for visual content. There are important things for high school students to be aware of like social justice issues and connecting events ideas visual images to current events, but that is not my job.

I wanted to skip the question about addressing race in his classroom, but in order to stay true to my research and the narrative process, I asked the question. He simply replied, “In my lessons, I address politics, race, and culture through geography.” Of note, Greer teaches in a predominately Black high school that was once the premier school for Black children in his city. The school has over 2000 students and is now one of the schools in the district that has had a high turnover rate for both teachers and administrators.

I prepared myself for Greer’s responses to the final questions, and they became less shocking, yet remained relevant. As it pertained to students’ understanding of self, Greer thought, “I don't think that in a large way that they get that idea of self…that they get a better understanding of themselves through art. I believe… I think they would, but not at this stage.
I think understanding of ourselves, realistically speaking, it takes a little bit more years of living on the planet for that to happen.” I could not resist the urge to ask a more probing question about that response. I wanted to know if he felt high school students has any idea of who they are and who they might want to become. He said,

At the age of 17 they are struggling with other issues, so I have to honestly answer it that way. My students don't understand it-self. I think that they have a hard time understanding art processes let alone something as deep as that. They need to understand art processes not something like that. The other thing is that it is like a social thing, almost like a philosophical issue. It's like an idea like a social idea and our students don't always understand things… I would have to delve into a religious kind of thing to understand the ‘I’… it takes much more. It takes more like it's a bit more philosophical.

I ended that line of questioning and asked about his use of resources, if any, and their usefulness to his curriculum. Greer responded,

The resources that we get are not sufficient at all. It's very limited because you need surplus you need surplus. You need surplus to carry into the following year and it's just not enough. The amount of money you get lets you buy a little bit and that's just about it. It is not much if your lessons sort of repeat themselves… I always teach same lessons every year because it does not allow you to branch out and do other stuff. It's simply not enough.

Greer’s answer indicated the use of similar, if not identical lessons, for his students for the last twenty years or so. I wondered how many students did the same lessons and
projects every year. He is a high school teacher, and the students who follow an arts path so that they are able to have an art major in college may not have had many opportunities for varied and challenging lessons. I was disturbed to say the least, but I did not allow my personal feelings to interfere with his narrative.

He continued to talk a bit about resources and informed me that he has not applied for any grants, but he thought it would be helpful. He said,

When I do get money I just use it for basic art supplies and stuff like that. I kind of use funds from an art club at my school for any supplies that I might run out of throughout the year, so when I get closer to the end of the year I'm able to use that money. Sometimes too you may have a benefactor like a parent who's able to give you money and they have their child in your class. But sometimes they want to donate something, so some parents donate and it's most likely things that they have that they don't want, and it is not what I want either. It's not worth it.

Greer continued his narrative and described art students’ schedule at his high school. He said, “If the students have me for one year, and then Art II, what else do you have in your toolkit? I run out of things to do. I constantly have to look for something novel to give them to do it because they become disinterested, and that's where I would like to incorporate flash or illustrator into the fine arts.”

The talk of technology seemed to revive Greer, as he became visibly interested and animated as he talked about how he would incorporate specific software into his lesson plans. He said, “that is the new frontier, you know, where you can actually take a drawing and be able to animate the parts of it that will be cool!”
As the interview came to an end, I asked if there were any final thoughts he would like to share about his classroom or lesson planning. He began speaking freely and seemed to have a cathartic response to my question. He said,

I think the problem that I'm experiencing this year is in my Art I class. It's combined with a proficient class, which, when you get these guys coming into it… into a high school art class… I'm not approaching that class if they are middle school anymore. We are doing high school art, you know? And my high school art class is actually preparing you and challenging you and getting you ready in case you're going to an intermediate class. They need to know what to expect and to be able to do. As they will move from proficient to advanced, some of them have gone to art school (college) from my school. So when they schedule art classes and they put in an advance class and a beginning our class in one room it's frustrating because I'm only one person. You have to address these budding art students and then you have this other group over there that needs your attention and I can't juggle like that it's not fair to the students.

I felt empathy as he continued. I too have experienced the desire to reach all students, but overloaded classes do not always allow for the best teaching one can carry out. He continued,

A lot of these guys, you know, the students, they can't sit for a long time they just have to constantly move and it doesn't change. They have to get into stuff and it just doesn't work, but you try to make it work. And that's just the way it is right now. My beginning art class has never had real art, and if I'm teaching drawing I'm going to teach drawing skills, not fantasy art. I'm not working from your imagination, we are
not drawing Daffy Duck, we are going to draw from observation, and we are going to consider some elements like proportion which is translated into the actual size of the thing we are going do a whole bunch of my stuff and make it look neat. I try, but they just don't have it.

As with most of my study participants, I felt Greer found his career personal and meaningful, but he was obviously troubled by administrative issues, class make-up, and what he felt was a lack of resources.

**Helena**

Helena was a breath of fresh air and a gem. We meet in her classroom during the summer months. I entered the middle school and was directed to her classroom on the fine arts hallway, which was lovely and still decorated with student work from the previous semester. I expected the same light, color-filled space I entered as I walked down the fine arts hallway. To my dismay, her classroom had no windows, it was very dimly lit, and almost cave-like. Nevertheless, Helena made a way to facilitate the creation of wonderful student work.

We began with her educational background, and she really started at the beginning. I smiled as she began talking, as she started with,

I went to elementary school in Asheville NC-the western part of the state. And that was Hill St. Elementary School. After that I went to X Junior High. My high school was Asheville High School. It used to be called Lee Edwards, it was changed during integration to Asheville High School, and we were forced to go to school with the white children. From there, I went to nursing school in Sumter SC, and I earned my
LPN… from there I went to Technical College and earned an Associate Degree in business. From there, I attended North Carolina Central University, and I earned a Bachelor of Art in Art with a concentration in drawing and literature. From there, the university of Florida in Gainesville, and worked on an MFA.

I was immediately interested in her teaching philosophy because she was the eldest of my study participants. After she mentioned being a part of integration efforts in the state, I was anxious about her responses. Her philosophy of teaching was short, but she stated it with dedication and enthusiasm. She said, “Yes, I do have a philosophy, and that is a simple quote-The best that I can do is the very best that I can do and that is the best that I can do.” She informed me that she has taught theatre, dance, and character education, etiquette, and oral interpretation.

Helena was delighted to participate in my study, and was eager to tell me about her field trips. She told me,

I take my students to shows at least once a semester, sometimes twice a semester, depending on what's available in the community that will fit in our school schedule. I get as excited about the field trips as the kids do. I have already planned a trip for the first semester. We are going to a Mexican exhibit that will have a gallery activity that will allow them to make sugar skulls for Dia de los Muertos, then we are going to come back here and paint up the place!

I asked if money was a factor when taking her students out of the school, to which she replied, “Resources are absolutely factors. The allotment for my program is very modest.” I let her know we would get back to resources and money later in the interview.
As we continued talking about field trips and how she selected which shows to take her students to, Helena said,

I just want you to know a few things. Based on what I teach, the arts are humanitarian, and there is absolutely nothing that is... There is nothing in the universe that does not include the human spirit, so anything that will display personal interactions with people, with living things, with life, with life skills, decision making processes, and so forth... those are the types of things I look at when I expose students to various activities and shows outside of school.

She continued to tell me about her field trips.

When we get back to the school, and even before we leave for a field trip, I encourage thought and reflection from my students. I ask those probing questions and from that point they create projects. I ask them what they would like to do with the information and knowledge that they have gained. I ask them, how do we channel this information? Sometimes it may be creating a movement piece, it may be writing a story or play, it may be visiting more museums or creating works and lesson plans for people who may not be as able as they are.

Helena informed me that she uses plans from museums often and appreciates the effort that education curators out into making those lessons and tying them in with other subjects. She said,

Lesson plans are often sent prior to our visit, and often I will teach what the exhibit may be before we get there. For instance, ... Is difficult... middle school students have a hard time understanding modern art, because they don't understand that art goes
beyond the figurative and realism.... The process can be the art in a form they are not used to the seeing. It could be with media they are not familiar with. I have to teach and let them know what they are about to see, and they make a decision after that point whether they like it. Some of them don't like it because they don't understand it at first, but we always try to get to a point of understanding.

I asked what themes she explores with her students as she creates lesson plans. She said,

Within my classroom, the themes I explore social, economic and current issues. Cultural issues teach us how human beings live and make contributions to the world community... How they live, how they grow, how they die, how they matriculated through school, everything about their cultures and lives. I have been attempting to explore, with my advances classes, some risk-taking thoughts within art.

Helena carried on and I was pleasantly surprised by her next responses. She continued,

Such as social issues... immigration and how some of our politicians want people to be sent back to their homelands, and making comparison with those that want to come into our country... That in contrast to the slaves that were forced to come to this land and were kept captive in this country... higher and deeper thinking skills questions is what I like in my space. Ones that address the difficult questions. Issues about same-sex marriage and homosexuality, I think those are safe subjects that we can talk about or that we can write about, create about, and perform... They will have us thinking about others ... human beings... in our society that deserve or do not deserve what we have.
I continued my line of questioning and asked Helena about her the ability for art to help students gain a better understanding of self. She replied,

At some point they learn what they like and don't like. It helps them with self-reflection, you know, self evaluation... what they want do and what they learn to do and what they learn to appreciate, what they are willing to share, and it also helps them to build goals. Like the ones that come in and say they can't, they can build goals, and the better they get, the better they enjoy it and they're able to share their works with others. And they want to do it.

As promised, I returned to the issue of resources and funding for her classroom. She told me her resources are “modest” She definitely felt they were helpful because as she said, Any and every little bit helps, but often times, it appears that the powers-that-be feel that the electives need less than other classes in education. So our funding always gets cut back... Scaled back... very low, and when there is a surplus of money in the schools, that money also goes to other teachers. The elective teachers can request money, and they can get their needs met, but they still get rejected the majority of the time. The resources are very minimal, and we need more. The elective teachers are not given attention. I think part of the problem is that we need a lot more integrity tossed into our discipline from administration, from legislature, from parents, from other teachers, from everyone. Our courses seem to be handled now a days as sort of a playground, a dumping ground, a holding area... It feels like our funding constantly gets dropped unless we get our own money to support our own discipline. We have to go out and get our own supplies and resources.
Helena teaches in a school that is 65% Black, with only 9% of those students performing at standard on standardized tests. She adds, “I try to use a lot of literary resources. Usually I do that because we need to involve our children more with reading and reading comprehension. An art critique is very difficult for our children to read and understand. I ensure every year I have at least one new set of art magazines. Usually that takes a large portion of my budget.” Helena’s final thoughts included a bit of frustration about education in general, but her continued hopes to have a great school year. She said,

Yes, I have final thoughts... I would like to rather not have to deal with the bureaucracy and disrespect that teachers have been subjected to in the last 8-9 years. It has been appalling. It hurt the integrity of these educators. We have some awesome educators. It hurts their integrity and it kills their morale, and for that reason, teachers become less passionate about what they do. And I am growing into one of those teachers. But I pray that some children or a child will come into my life that will light my fire that will give me that boost and I can share the same energy with them and we can come out of the year with some awesome accomplishments.

Isahna

Not knowingly, I followed the eldest of my participants with the youngest. She too was a gem and a pleasure to talk to. We met at a library and she was ready to get started as soon as she entered the room. We talked for thirty minutes or more about the process of earning a PhD and what steps she needed to take. Isahna was very interested in my personal journey as a mother, teacher, and graduate student. I did not mind entertaining her queries because I am always excited when people are excited about education. After we got through
her questions, we began the interview. She informed me that she attended an arts magnet high school and went on to a private art institute in the north. She earned a Bachelor of Fine Art in Photography and completed a Master of Art in Teaching after she earned her undergraduate degree.

We continued with her philosophy about teaching. She said,

My philosophy is that I think art is vital especially when approaching holistic education. I think students learn a lot of critical and practice a lot of critical thinking skills in my room. They learn how to find their voice, express ideas, build visual literacy, and increase verbal literacy skills through the use of creative and critical thinking.

After she explained her philosophy, we discussed visits to museums and galleries she makes with her classes. She visits two to three times a year and was really excited about a trip she took last year to Washington DC. It was a portfolio trip with the high school students in her school. She said,

We got to visit the Corcoran Gallery, the Portrait Gallery… they really got to see all of the major museums in DC. Then they were able to have a lot of schools (colleges) come and look at their portfolios for higher education. So basically the Corcoran posts and annual college fair or portfolio day or high school students bring their bodies of work to the Corcoran. There will be all of the major accredited arts and art institutions in the country and students basically wait in line in order get their portfolios reviewed.

I found this fascinating! I had not heard of the portfolio day, so Isahna continued,
There were 50 students from my school who were able to go. We stay for one day, there were five teachers that chaperoned and there were no other high schools in this city that did that. It's for 9th through 12th grades, but juniors and seniors have priority. Students have maybe three weeks from the time that the trip is announced to prepare, and those first three weeks are only for seniors and juniors to try to scrape money together to get their portfolios together, but if there are extra spots, then we open up those slots to sophomores and freshmen if they would like to bring their work. It is really cool because the night before, all the students spread out all of their work and students get to interact with teachers and get critiqued by teachers who usually don't interact with them and it's really helpful.

Isahna had my attention and continued talking about the details of her trip and how beneficial it is to her students.

I continued with resources and funding questions. Isahna thought she was “really fortunate to have a pretty nice chunk of money provided” by her school. She let me know the school collects lab fees from the students at the beginning of the school year. She said students who take the class for a year are asked to contribute $20, “which boils down to about $.11 a day and then students who are taking semester long classes are asked to contribute $10 a day… I mean $10 for the semester… so normally with that, we don't need to ask for anything else.” I had not heard of schools asking for lab fees from students, however, the school is an arts magnet school, so parents are probably aware of the possibility of contributing to the school in creative ways.
Next, we discussed her lesson planning process and how she goes about looking for images and themes to explore with her students. She said,

Normally I plan lessons first and then look for resources that are relevant to the lesson. I have used an exhibition lesson from an exhibition before, but normally I just try to find artists that are relevant. I always have a gallery sheet or a worksheet that students are asked to carry with them while they are looking at work. Sometimes it might say sketch your favorite piece, or look at the wall text and tell me a little bit about this artist. There will be vocabulary that I like for them to use in their descriptions.

When I asked about the most memorable exhibit she viewed, she described one that was at The NC Museum of Art. It was an exhibition by artists of color called 100 Artists. The museum patrons would not have known it was curated specifically to showcase Black artists because of the title, which, alone, was interesting. Isahna viewed it as well and said, “I reviewed the terms and suggested questions to go over with my students before bringing them. It was very basic but I had students write about work using those pieces and pieces of information from the website. It had questions about tolerance and the way that students address identity and their works and things like that.”

We continued conversing and Isahna described a wonderful lesson she does with her students at the beginning of every school year.

The one thing I really like to do in the beginning of the year is called ancestor investigations. This will be the third year that we are having a fall art festival where students are making work while focusing on their ancestor investigation. It is a day
where living families kind of honor the legacies and stories of people who have passed. My students interview living family members to find out things about their ancestors and then they are asked to create symbols to represent the things that they accomplished during their life and the things that they're passionate about during their life then there as to make connections between their ancestors and their current lives. I kind of build on that throughout the year even though it's not directly connected but, yeah...

She continued with her curricular focus.

I am really passionate about having students build visual literacy, a lot of times I use graphic organizers and final charts to help students. For example, I have a worksheet that asks the students to create a shoe to describe their personality. So will list things from their personality and it could be something like... ‘I am loving’, so they would have to look up synonyms for loving and shoes and associations for those… synonyms. And based on those associations, they start to think of a visual representation for those associations so it's all about having students think about the working process and their thought process and building concepts. I would say that I actually focus more on conceptual thinking in concept building than I do technique sometimes. I think a lot of other stupid teachers at my school really focus on technique since we are an arts magnet high school and we are very technical and we focus on techniques so much and I don't feel bad about not focusing so much on technique because they need balance.
It was uplifting to hear Isahna speak about balance, teaching the whole child, and scaffolding in her curriculum. She continued and explained her use of visual aids in the classroom.

When I'm choosing visual aids I think about the class at the beginning of the year. At the beginning of the class, I pass out student surveys and I has some questions there that are divided into what types of art or what types of music they like… basically is like creating a Facebook profile. I look at those periodically throughout the year just to figure out what my students will connect to and sometimes it helps me to think about images that might connect to lessons or previous lessons.

We moved on to the issue of race and how or if it is addressed in her classroom.

Isahna shared the following:

When addressing race, we just go ahead and talk about it in the beginning of the year. We spend one day just talking about it and creating a safe space for students… and for each other… creating a space where students can make mistakes. We talk about things and have them address the possibility of offending a friend, and we use communication skills to be able to say ‘hey, I think you need to make a different thought or statement but this’. It is my idea or this is my culture…. I try to build a safe space. My students talk about making generalizations and culture and rights. We have a lot of open and honest group discussions. Sometimes we get cut off in awkward situations like the bell ringing or will have to stop but that's usually the only time I feel uncomfortable.

She described her school and its demographics.
I think my school is a very unique place in that it's a magnet program where students from all over the city are bussed in from different places, and so the culture of the school kind of tends to be more tolerant because there's so many clicks that there are almost no clicks. I've been lucky to have diversity in the classroom. There's more of an understanding when you have people talk about race because there's so many different races within the school is not like most schools within our city.

The conversation did not slow its pace as we moved on developing self and identity in and through art. She added,

When it comes to understanding self I think it's a really, really powerful thing to create and when we create we think about ourselves. We think not only about working styles and the things that you do well and the things that you struggle to complete. I think students are also able to make connections with others by talking about works and being able to compare and contrast... Like you can talk about the works of the other classmates and compare it to the works of professional artist. A lot of times those critiques in the classrooms sometimes when naturally drift away from arch into experiences that the artist is talking about. I feel like I asked the students lots of questions asked them tons of questions and in asking those questions listen for those answers where unable to say I'm this or I'm not that... It allows them opportunities to reflect.

The resources in Isahna’s school seem to be plentiful based on her previous response. I asked about improving resources and what she desired, or what she would do. She said, “I do find the resources helpful, but we do have to ask families for monies for all the things we
do. What we receive is helpful and some families are able to contribute more than others. It is nice to have that cushion, but we also have to ask families for money and it is what it is.” She added,

I don't use my textbooks… when we do research to learn about different techniques, because I'm focused on trying to instil 21st-century skills with my students, I do a lot of digital research. This year is the first year I'm not using Ed Moto. I'm going to try Google classroom and so a lot of times when I'm trying to have them research artist or look up techniques and things like that will look online. I also create a lot of power points for them so if a kid is missing assignments or missing class, they can just get online at home and look at the PowerPoint that was used during the class.

Technology continued to be a focus of the conversation. She, along with other teachers in her district, had been encouraged to increase their use of technology in the classroom. She said,

I teach one unit of Photoshop and only one of our labs has Photoshop. They learn these tools and then they can use them again because we are able to use it. It's really expensive and I know once... that one time they're not able to use it again unless they are in that lab, and the lab has to be reserved well in advance. There are 14 computers in the lab. I don't have any computers in my classroom but three of our teachers do, and I would like to have some in my room just for the purposes of research and looking at references-it would be really helpful.
Isahna remembered that she didn’t tell me about a district resource she has access to. She explained a program at the city’s arts council that provides funding to public and private schools in the city. She noted,

We use the arts council money. I brought a visiting artist into my room and I paid them using that funding… I would love to have more this year. I think I will prefer having a real artist come in rather than going to the museum but it's not always possible. One time I had a Chinese artist come in and he was really good and he did a residency. Another time I had a fashion consultant come in and she came in and talked to the kids about the anatomy of the sewing machine, how to use the sewing machine, and then we had one of our high school alums who is a designer come in. She showed us how to make drafts and spec sheets. She showed us how to make patterns and things like that and that was so fun! It was fun for me too… we did so much and we learned so much from her.

She continued,

Fortunately, our tech art theatre tech department has a sewing machine sewing room that has 12 sewing machines. The room is so small that there are only six set up, and I have a space to make the digital lab in the back of my room, so it's two tables. I have tons of clothes out on them, so when we do our sewing unit I'll bring six of those machines over and use those in my room. They just sit in the box when they're not in use and instead of just let them sit there I take them to my room and I use them.

In what seemed to be one of the more pleasurable interviews, Isahna concluded with her final thoughts. She shared,
What I would like to finalize the interview with is my thoughts about experiential learning and how I really enjoy giving my students the opportunity to delve into experiential learning and being able to apply things that we do in the classroom… so having festivals and allowing them to talk about their work with the whole school community and their parents is an awesome experience for them. I also did a sustainable use fashion show last year and having them work together in teams to create something and then share it with the world and not just our class. We did not just put it on the wall. To really have them be a part of the sharing process and having them sharing has been very empowering for them and for me. I have really enjoyed watching them take their work to the next level and step up to the plate in different ways because of certain things they did to help the process. Certain kids that finished their projects were all about making some phone calls to invite people, or just little tasks that probably wouldn't matter but that were so important to the process to be successful. They really encouraged me. I was really excited about doing it and it was great. It helped them connect classroom experiences with opportunities for careers in the real world that deal with the arts and how art really is a part of so many different businesses and ventures that are going in our community and professions… it was awesome!

**Jasper**

Art, art everywhere, and then there is more room to put more on the walls. Jasper was an incredible artist who had his office walls filled with his work and the work of his students. He invited me to his new administrative office and offered me lunch. I accepted his offer, so
we chatted over tuna sandwiches and a glass of sweet tea. Jasper was welcoming, warm, and had the best southern accent I had ever heard.

Undergraduate studies began in Chapel Hill for Jasper, but after his freshman year, he transferred, “back to the mountains where [he] belong[s].” Appalachian State University is where he completed his undergraduate degree in education; he then completed coursework to become an art teacher in North Carolina. After twenty plus years of teaching art, Jasper decided to earn a Master of School Administration from East Carolina University. He felt it was a good move for him as he prepared to teach art for one final year before he transitioned from the classroom to an administrative position because, as he said, “I know the children, the adults, and all of their strange inner-workings. I have watched many, many principals come and go, and I could run this school with my eyes closed.” Jasper had not yet earned his administrative credentials, yet was given an office, administrative responsibilities, and much respect.

As we ate our lunch, we continued to discuss his years in the classroom and how much change has occurred in education during his tenure as a teacher. Jasper continued and told me the change he has seen did not change his philosophy about art and teaching. He said,

Children have not changed over the years, our expectations have, and their privileges have. Twenty-first century students are no more intelligent than those in the seventeenth century- they just have more gadgets to play with and more buttons to push when they study… I teach children, and children love to learn when taught well.
I believe it is my obligation to teach as I was taught—with sincere concern for student success, and having pride in what I do.

His “old school” and traditional ideals were not archaic and stiff, yet were obviously filled with high expectations for his students and himself. Jasper seemed to genuinely care about education and his students while simultaneously maintaining what some may perceive as a conventional way of teaching.

I asked him about visits to museums and galleries, expecting him to say he visits museums and requires his students to take copious notes about old masters and works from early art periods. His response was nothing I imagined, as he replied,

I like to take my students to see anything and everything that people call art. There is value in the folk art I grew up with in the mountains of North Carolina, as well as the works of Rembrandt, Lichtenstein, Manet, Monet, and that crazy guy Picasso. I take my students out to museums four times a year or more. We have a few nice large museums here in the city, and smaller locally owned gallery spaces. We are in walking distance to a great trail that has sculptures everywhere… I mean all on top of the trees, in the bushes, people have made this place a real special thing. So we go to as many places as we can and as often as possible, they need to see a lot.

I was pleased to hear his response, and I was also curious about the frequency of his visits and how he was able to afford such a large number of visits to sites off campus. Jasper replied,

I live by some really simple mottos. When it comes to getting what I need, I always find a way. Lots of visits means lots of information. To some museums, money is
only an issue if it matters to the visitor. There are enough visitors to and members of museums to offset a free tour that also provides great publicity… I have an agreement with one museum director and education liaison… they agreed that as long as we want to visit the museum, we are welcome. In return, I encourage my students to go home and brag and boast about how wonderful the museum is and how cool it is to see the new exhibits. The kids get an additional trip and the museum gets money from the adults that take them. I have seen church buses go after a Sunday service. It is a symbiotic relationship that has nothing to do with science. I love it (boisterous laughter)!

I asked Jasper how he determined which exhibits and images to focus on when he visits museums. He replied,

I go and we see. We see and we learn. We learn and we do. There is no set of rules I follow when I consider an exhibition. Well… there was one… it was a show that was filled with life-size portraits, but some of the models were baby bottom naked! Now we both know I couldn’t take them to see those, not because of the nudity exactly, because I have textbooks with naked flying babies, but some of the models in that show were sitting and standing in positions that showed all and everything. But other than those that may be too far out of the realm of understanding for my students, I take them to see art for the sake of art.

As we continued talking, he explained that he tries to use many pieces he views in museum and gallery spaces to introduce or review concepts and techniques with his classes. Again, Jasper was a sort of traditional teacher, and he felt experiences outside of the school should
be used as an extension of the classroom. He explained how he used examples of decorative frames that were on pieces he saw in an exhibit as an introduction to a woodworking unit he planned to begin following the visit. He said,

There is lesson to be learned from all of my field trips, and if I don’t connect that to what the students are learning, the field trip becomes playtime for the students. We are competing with technology… not that I don’t use it and find it great… its just that our children need to recognize that they are competing with other children in the world who go to school longer than them and sometimes learn a lot more than they do in their primary and secondary school years. Playtime is playtime, and school time is not a place for meaningless play.

Museum lessons, both written and online are a part of Jasper’s go-to resources when developing his yearly projects. He explained his excitement when he found applications developed by iTunes, called iTunes U. The Louvre, The Museum of Modern Art, The San Francisco Museum of Art, and others all have podcasts, tours and virtual information for patron use. Most students in Jasper’s class have access to a device that allows them to download the application, and use it for at home and in-class research. He said, “I am able to create lessons and use their favorite thing- technology- and we all benefit from the apps.” Jasper’s use of technology does not end with the use of the applications; he also takes advantage of the wireless interactive projector that was installed in his classroom and in every other classroom in the district.

Jasper explained how he selects images and addresses race in his lessons. He described a specific lesson he uses, in various forms, which he feels covers race, culture,
identity, and what students will see and create in his class. He called it The Destruction
Lesson. He said,

Each student in my class receives an index card and a pencil. I allow them to choose a
corner to stand in, or a table to sit under, and while in their “private” space in the
classroom, they are instructed to write down the question they have about another
race and one thing they have heard that may be offensive about a group of people,
race or culture. I tell them no other students can read their cards, and neither will I…
so they can be as open as they would like to be. After they write their question and
comments, they sit in silence and think about what they wrote, why they have
question, and when/where they heard the comments. By this time, they are deep in
thought. I ask them to fold their papers so no words are visible and bring them to a
tray in the center of the room.

He continued,

By now, some are hesitant to put their card in the tray, but I assure them it is a safe
place to put them. After we have them all, I pull out my shredder and I run them
through twice... their notes. The relief on some of their faces is visible. After they
take their seats, I put them into groups and each group comes up with an image they
feel represents love and care. I have had so many students give the most beautiful and
creative ideas. I think this may be my favorite lesson too… Ok… then we use the
small pieces from the shredder to make a collage/mosaic for our class and each class
has their own piece.
The project description was an awesome example of how the students are able to reflect on their thoughts and beliefs, as well as take action to destroy the stereotypes they may have heard or used. And with that destruction, Jasper offers an opportunity for creation. He smiled after he completed the description, and said, “That is splendid, huh?” I replied with a smile and simply said, ”Indeed it is, Sir.”

We concluded the interview with final thoughts and ideas about his classroom and lesson planning. Jasper seemed to have so much more to share, but declined due to a meeting he was to attend. He said,

You know, I could talk about this kind of stuff till the cows come home, but I just want to say that we need teachers to teach, because the children want to learn. I haven’t met a child yet that didn’t want to know anything! There is a way to reach each and every one of the students we see. Maybe it is not the art class that gets them, but we have to find out what does, so I plan projects that get to all subjects as much as I can.

Jasper’s narrative was entertaining, enlightening, and provided meaningful data to support my research focus.

*Cross Narrative Analysis*

Analysis of data collected for this study occurred and developed through examining, categorizing, and recombining information in order to communicate my interpretation of the findings. I determined themes based on identified patterns which included simple ones that involved an analysis of word count, participant responses related to curriculum development, and opportunities for counter-storytelling. A more complex method of analysis included
identification of subtopics, contradictory points of view, and new insights gained from documents and participant responses.

Common themes are shared by the participants in a narrative study, and this instance the identified themes included ways in which the participants described the experiences of their students as well as their own experiences in the classroom and in museum/gallery settings. The themes include participants’ desire to be effective educators while ensuring student success, using art as a means of communication and expression, the use of technology as a virtual museum and research tool in middle and high school art, and limited resource availability for the purpose of acquiring classroom materials.

High levels of professionalism and dedication to the teaching profession were reflected through the participants’ desire to be effective educators while ensuring student success. The teachers in this study stated that although there are differing levels of success for their students, the expectation and objective is success, at some level, for the students in their classrooms. Alexandra, Camille, Emerson, Isahna, and Jasper specifically state their desire to see students succeed. Alexandra discussed the need to, “rethink how the second semester lessons would be developed in order to have increased success” in her classroom, as well as the willingness to be “flexible in [her] lessons in order to have successful museum and gallery visits.” Camille stated that she wanted her students to feel success and encouraged her students by telling them they were capable and able, even if the students said they could not complete the simplest of tasks such as drawing a stick figure. The theme of success continued with Emerson who attempted to ensure success regardless of artistic ability of level of experience in and exposure to art. Finally, Isahna and Jasper were primarily
focused on student success in the artistic process as opposed to a product. Isahna stated. “I think students learn a lot of critical and practice a lot of critical thinking skills in my room. They learn how to find their voice, express ideas, build visual literacy, and increase verbal literacy skills through the use of creative and critical thinking.” The success of their students came in many stages throughout the creation of art pieces, and Isahna and Jasper made a conscious effort to offer students opportunities to feel successful from conception to construction in the art class.

Opportunities for students to convey positive and negative feelings through art were offered in the classrooms of Blair, Camille, Dana, Emerson, Fred, and Isahna. The teachers all accept and encourage the use of visual art as a means of communication and expression. Fred and Camille focused on writing and the use of the spoken word in their classroom as students create. Fred described a lesson in which he has students use only words to create a self-portrait of sorts. Camille had conversations with her students on a daily basis in order to provide additional ways for students to convey thoughts, ideas and feelings. Blair also used self-portraiture in the art room as a vehicle for expression, and said “projects like self-portraiture, especially in the middle school years when children are trying to find their identities, becomes a means of expression that helps them narrow it down.” Emerson, Dana, and Isahna found art to be a foundation for basic expression in education. Emerson tried to “reinforce the basics so they have a better way of expressing themselves.” Dana told me to be sure that I believed that, “art is necessary… it is an expression of self… of life… of everything.” Isahna and Dana specifically mentioned the ability for students to find their voice as they create and share their works. Students in their classrooms are encouraged to
“feel” the art that is created especially when addressing specific cultures and groups of people.

Conversations concerning the desire to access to 21st century equipment and its availability for use by teachers and students recurred throughout the study. The use of technology as a virtual museum and research tool in middle and high school art was mentioned in the narratives of Blair, Camille, Emerson, Greer, Isahna, and Jasper who used technology as a research tool and supplemental instrument to aid in instruction. Blair and Emerson stated the usefulness of the concept maps presented on the NC Museum of Art website while Camille discussed the multitude of lessons available for galleries and museums nationwide. Camille’s site was designated as a 1 to 1 school, one in which a laptop or tablet computer is provided for every student, which gave her many more opportunities to use technology in her classroom and for lesson planning. Isahna and Greer have limited access to computers, tablets, and other forms of technology, but they expressed interest in developing lessons that focused on digital arts and animation. Jasper’s use of a specific application to access global art pieces was impressive and useful, as it allowed students to actually take virtual tours of museums in other countries.

Frugality and resourcefulness were participant characteristics that I frequently noted. The majority of participant responses related to resources included comments to support the idea that funding is limited for the arts in their schools, if not completely absent. Limited resource availability for the purpose of acquiring classroom materials was mentioned by all but one of the study participants. Helena called her resources “modest”, Isahna remarked about her need to “ask parents for money and other resources”, while Fred and Emerson
acknowledge the funding provided by their respective districts is present, but leave a few projects unvisited due to funding. Greer, Dana, and Blair stated their funding is “insufficient” and they often have difficulties throughout the year when planning lessons with a small amount of money. Greer said, “money is an issue that I face with every trip… because you literally have to pay for the substitute teacher. If I try to plan for trips, they (administration) [do] not make it easy for you to do that. Dana let me know she had received thousands of dollars in materials, money, and time offered for services through grants because she was determined to have her students “become great people first, then great artists.” Finally, Blair stated, “we have no money. I was at a school this year that had a zero dollar budget. The two art teachers taught 2/3 of the school which was roughly... I taught about three hundred students and the other teacher taught 300 students. I've always found a way, but it’s been very frustrating to see it for what it is. And my county is... I would a say a fairly well to do county.” Alexandra was the one participant who received no money from her district and relied solely on her own money, donations, and grants in order to teach art to her middle school classes.

Differences in the narratives and themes were as varied and unique as the participants and included opportunities for participants to collaborate and develop partnerships with community members, participant’s thoughts about art as a vehicle to develop a sense of self, addressing social justice issues in art, and the presence of lessons that address writing in the art classroom.

The emphases of two teachers were situated in their desire to network, make community connections, and establish clear goals outside the classroom for students.
Collaborating and developing partnerships with community members emerged as a subtopic in the narratives of only two teachers, Alexandra and Isahna. Alexandra’s lack of resources seemed to be a driving force in her willingness to locate and expertise in developing relationships in her community in order to have a successful school year. Isahna discussed a fashion show and community art exhibit she arranged for her students so they could have experiences that allowed them too see art as a vocation and profession.

Aside from Greer, participant’s thoughts about art as a vehicle to develop a sense of self were consistently in support of the idea that art assists with developing self and recognizing culture. Greer felt his students don't understand the idea self and thought they didn’t have the ability to understand who they are and who they would like to possibly become. He found the idea of self to be a “philosophical issue” and “social idea” that his students don't understand and are not able to grasp.

Teacher narratives that addressing social justice issues in their classrooms and art projects included those of Camille, Emerson, Greer, and Helena. Camille discussed a lesson she created years ago that involved playing music from decades ago that addressed social justice issues, Greer stated the need for high school students to be aware of social justice issues and current events, and Helena experienced integration during her formal education. However, of the ten participants, the two teachers who emphatically expressed the need for students to address social issues in the art classroom were Blair and Emerson. Blair’s lesson that focused on the Civil Right’s Movement was completed in the last year, and at the time of her interview, she was still visibly excited about what it allowed her students to see and learn about what happened during that period in history. Emerson said lessons about race and
social justice issues “do not wait for February”, instead, he addresses those topics on a regular basis in his classroom.

Participants that address and offer chances for writing in their classrooms were not numerous. During data analysis I attempted to identify specific and clear opportunities for students to create counter-stories while participating in the arts. As stated previously, the usefulness of counter-storytelling and the realization of cultural capital are essential tools needed to offset the wealth of white standards in arts education. Counter-storytelling is used as a tool for giving voice to those whose stories are overshadowed by stock stories that are usually seen as superior (Aguirre, 2000; Delgado, 1989). The opportunities for secondary art students to create counter-story narratives are not meant to serve as the occasional subjective story, rather as meaningful incidents to offset stories of the majority. Camille, Helena, and Isahna were the three participants who discussed using writing in their curriculum.

*Document Analysis of Participant Lesson Plans*

The lesson plans that were presented/offered by the teachers were not distinctly ones that were discussed in the narratives nor were they all used in conjunction with museum or gallery visits. I found that to be significant, as I gained knowledge of many different types of lesson used in the secondary art classrooms of the study participants. I present the findings in this section in aggregate form so that anonymity of the study participants is maintained, as some of the lessons were in conjunction with specific shows and community events that may allow for identification of the study participants. In addition, the lesson plan submission was not equal from each participant. There were several participants who offered three to four lessons, and others who offered none.
Teachers in this study wrote lesson plans for different reasons. As revealed in the study, there were participants who wrote lesson plans for third party education companies, those that wrote plans as a part of professional development, some that wrote to share with their district art teachers, and teachers who wrote at the request/requirement of their respective schools. The formats of the lesson plans varied as well, and included ones that were written as sort of journals, others that were two to three pages long that included objectives and goals that connected to subject areas outside of art, Power Point slide shows, and a few that were less than a page long that indicated the bare minimum of information—those were used to post in the classroom for administrators to have quick access to what students were learning and what the teachers were focusing on in the classroom.

The following chart offers data found that includes specific artists that were addressed in the lesson plans, curricular focus, opportunities for students to address race, and other important characteristics of the lesson plans developed and or used by the teacher participants. The themes identified in the teacher narratives mirrored the themes found in the document analyses. In addition to the previously identified themes, I looked specifically for opportunities for students to participate in counter-storytelling as a means of expression. The document reviews were designed and carried out to determine if the teachers used lessons that played a role in supporting the idea of counter-storytelling. If available, I read the objectives of the lessons first, followed by the theme and or subject matter of the lesson, followed by images used as resources, and finally, I determined the media used and the lesson’s connection to technology.
As mentioned previously, I did not collect lesson plans from each participant because some did not offer plans for review. The lessons I received are reflected below, while a detailed display explaining which teachers offered plans, brief descriptions of the plans, and my method of analysis is included in the appendix of this study.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Artist of Focus</th>
<th>Media or Technique</th>
<th>Race Addressed</th>
<th>Cross-curricular Connection</th>
<th>Museum Connection</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>V. Van Gogh</td>
<td>Painting</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>LA, SS</td>
<td>Virtual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edouard Manet</td>
<td>Drawing</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>S, M</td>
<td>Virtual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>K. Walker*</td>
<td>Collage</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>SS, LA</td>
<td>Virtual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frida Kahlo</td>
<td>Painting</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>SS, LA</td>
<td>Virtual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N. Rockwell</td>
<td>Painting</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>SS, LA</td>
<td>Real</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G. Segal</td>
<td>Sculpture</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>S, M</td>
<td>Virtual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Monet</td>
<td>Painting</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>S, M</td>
<td>Real</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>J. Lawrence*</td>
<td>Painting</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>SS</td>
<td>Real</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>August Rodin</td>
<td>Sculpture</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>S, M</td>
<td>Real</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Johan Sergel</td>
<td>Sculpture</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>Virtual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gustav Klimt</td>
<td>Painting</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>M, LA</td>
<td>Virtual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mary Cassat</td>
<td>Painting</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>LA</td>
<td>Virtual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T. Jacques Ralli</td>
<td>Painting</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>LA</td>
<td>Virtual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. Munch</td>
<td>Painting</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>LA</td>
<td>Virtual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Max Klinger</td>
<td>Printing</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>Virtual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R. Bearden*</td>
<td>Collage</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>SS</td>
<td>Virtual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Schultz</td>
<td>Drawing</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>SS, M</td>
<td>Virtual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M. Rothko</td>
<td>Painting</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>Virtual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wangechi Mutu*</td>
<td>Digital Art</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>SS</td>
<td>Real</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 12
Lesson Plan Analysis
*Indicates an artist of color; Language Arts (LA); Science (S); Social Studies (SS); Math (M)
The following is an excerpt from the North Carolina Essential Standards in Visual Arts (NC DPI, 2014) that the participant lesson plans addressed specifically. The notes on the numbering and strands designated by an individual letter indicate: v-visual literacy, cx-contextual relevancy, cr-critical response. Visual literacy is language used in and about art. It may be used to describe how works are organized, communicate an understanding of the elements of art and principles of design, and apply critical and creative thinking skills to express through art and solve problems in art. Contextual Relevancy is the application of knowledge of the arts in relation to heritage, culture, history, and additional disciplines. Students use contextual relevancy to understand the evolution of art throughout historical periods and geographical locations. Finally, critical response in the essential standards refers to the use of critical analysis to write, verbalize, or in other ways react to art. Describing, interpreting, analyzing, critiquing, observing, and judging are skills that are put into use during critical response. It is important to note, however, that the standards listed are only a very small portion of the essential standards and clarifying objectives presented in the full document (NC DPI, 2014). According to the standards, students will be able to:

8.v.1 Use the language of visual arts to communicate effectively.
8.v.1.1 Use art vocabulary to evaluate art.
8.v.2 Apply creative and critical thinking skills to artistic expression.
8.v.2.1 Create art that uses the best solutions to identified problems.
8.v.2.3 Create original art that conveys one or more ideas or feelings.
8.v.3 Create art using a variety of tools, media, and processes, safely and appropriately.
8.v.3.1 Apply knowledge of safety and media to maintain and take care of the workspace.

8.v.3.2 Use a variety of media to create art.

8.cx.1 Understand the global, historical, societal and cultural contexts of the visual arts.

8.cx.1.1 Understand the role of visual arts in NC and the US in relation to history.

8.cx.2 Understand the interdisciplinary connections and life applications of the arts.

8.cx.2.3 Use collaboration to arrive at effective solutions to identified problems.

8.cr.1 Use critical analysis to generate responses to a variety of prompts.

8.cr.1.1 Use convincing and logical arguments to respond to art.

8.cr.1.2 Critique personal art based on identified criteria.

The data showed visual literacy was used in lesson plans and allowed students to describe how works are organized while communicating an understanding of the elements of art and principles of design. Wolff (1990) stated that the language of art is itself culturally distinct and it facilitates and impedes the creation of cultural and social products. Students were able to apply critical and creative thinking skills to express through art and solve problems in art, however, some students were exposed to images that perpetuated and seemingly completed racist stereotypes surrounding visual art.

For example, the lesson plans that referenced the works of painters Van Gogh, Monet, Klimt, and Rothko all used visuals that included no people of color. Van Gogh and Klimt created bold vibrantly colored pieces that often included portraits and figurative works. The pieces used as reference for Van Gogh and Klimt included portraits of only white men and
women. The well-known works of Monet are generally those of gardens and landscapes, however, two of the images selected for the lesson included those as well as several with white women and white children. The students who participated in the painting lessons had an opportunity to participate appropriately using proper vocabulary and techniques through visual literacy, but they were not encouraged to create pieces that were representative of their race. The students were taught vocabulary, but were not given an opportunity to have a voice.

Contextual Relevancy is the application of knowledge of the arts in relation to heritage, culture, history, and additional disciplines. Teachers in the study created lessons that helped students understand art in different historical periods and geographical locations, but overall, the heritage, cultural, and historical references were not those of people of color. The lessons created that did reference people of color used images created by Kara Walker, Jacob Lawrence, and Romare Bearden. As stated in the literature review, the works of Walker are characterized by extreme exaggerations of the Black female figure, three of which were used in the lesson analyzed in this study. The stories that accompanied the works were indeed reflective of American history and the Black slave in America, however, the images were the stereotypes that secondary students need less of—large hips and large hips on Black women who are serving (sexually in one of Walker’s pieces) white people.

Jacob Lawrence’s paintings used as reference were based on American history and the Black experience as well. The simplified use of the Black figure in his works were not reflective of physical stereotypes as in the work of Walker, he addressed the social and economic plight of Black people with bright colors and exaggerated movements that represented lifestyles and experiences of Black people in America. The titles of three of his
series used in the lessons were *The Harriet Tubman Series, The Great Migration Series,* and *The Genesis Series.* Images used for reference included ones that told visual stories about slavery, Black migration to the north, and Biblical stories he heard as a child.

The lesson referencing Romare Bearden was written specifically to address North Carolina artists and their contribution to art history for high school Art I students. The lesson was written simply and noted the need for the teacher to cover art history at the most basic level. Students who participated in the lesson were able to learn about Bearden and see images that he created as a part of his desire to express his passion for music. The collages of Black people referenced were quite stylized, but not stereotypical in the way that Walker’s pieces were.

Critical response in the NC standards refers to the use of critical analysis to write, verbalize, or in other ways react to art. There were three participants who discussed using writing in their classrooms, however, only one lesson presented for analysis allowed for critical response through writing about art. The lesson referenced the work of Edvard Munch and his painting *The Scream.* Students were to compose a short story along with a storyboard that communicated what the figure was really screaming about. The prompt was open-ended and a class discussion was a part of the lesson, but students were not encouraged to write about one specific topic or source that would have made the figure scream.

As I completed the analysis of the lesson plans, I discovered participants’ use of visual literacy, contextual relevancy, and critical response was evident in most projects presented to the students, but the opportunity to address race was not—unless it was the choice of the student to do so. The participants stressed the importance of individuality and
expression, so one may be led to believe that in most classes and in most cases, the students would be allowed to create works that were representative of their own thoughts and ideas.

**Summary**

The findings presented in this chapter indicated that matters such as teacher support, class size, teacher and student interests, and connections to other subject areas played considerable roles in lesson plan development and selection of museum and gallery exhibits to visit. In addition, the desire to be an effective educator while ensuring student success, using art as a means of communication and expression, the use of technology as a virtual museum and research tool in middle and high school art, and insufficient resources available for participant use and classroom materials were themes identified in the findings. The issues were consistently present in the narratives and were significant to choices made by the study participants.

The chapter began with an introduction and continued with narrative descriptive findings of participant perspectives on resources, lesson planning, and student learning and creation in their classrooms. The first section described findings that addressed the research question: How do North Carolina public secondary art teachers address race in lessons developed when referencing or visiting public art collections? The second section in this chapter described findings revealed in the document analysis of lesson plans used by the study participants. In the following chapter, I offer further discussion and interpretation of the findings as they connect to the literature, conclusions, implications for classroom practices, and recommendations for future research.
CHAPTER V

CONCLUSIONS, IMPLICATIONS, AND RECOMMENDATIONS

If methodologies have been used to silence and marginalize people of color, then methodologies can also give voice and turn the margins into places of transformative resistance (Solorzano & Yosso, 2002, p. 37)

This chapter consists of conclusions, connections to research, implications, recommendations, and my reflections gained from this study about secondary art teachers in North Carolina and the lessons they teach. Using previous research and literature related to arts funding and CRT to inform my interpretation of the findings, I introduce a discussion of the findings presented in chapter 4. This research supports prior research that learning is not only the result of standards, planned curriculum experiences and the ability of a teacher to teach, but it is also shaped by the climate of a school including its attitudes of teachers and students, hidden expectations about what is valued and expected—the explicit and implicit curriculum respectively of both the classroom and the entire school (Eisner, 2002). The participants’ desire to be effective educators while ensuring student success, using art as a means of communication and expression, the use of technology as a virtual museum and research tool in middle and high school art, and insufficient resources available for participant use and classroom materials were ever-present throughout the narratives shared by the teachers. My interpretation serves an approach to organize data and communicate research discoveries through conversation.

As noted in the literature review of this study, CRT offers the followings tenets as means to understanding and provided a framework for my research: 1) CRT acknowledges that racism is prevalent and permanent in America; 2) CRT challenges dominant ideology
offering critiques to liberal ideals such as colorblindness and race neutrality, instead
whiteness is a social gauge; 3) CRT encourages the use of counter-stories to dispel myths and
misconceptions depicted in stock stories (Bell, 1992; Delgado & Stefancic, 2012; Ladson-
Billings & Tate, 1995; Lopez, 2003; Solorzano & Yosso, 2001).

Student access to schools and curriculum become forms of property to which whites
are privileged, and Ladson-Billings and Tate (1995) discuss the quantity and quality of
school curriculum as they connect with intellectual property and property value. According
to the authors, curriculum development must take into consideration the contexts of
institutions, cultures, and policies. My findings indicated the images and artists that were
used as references were a direct reflection of the privileged, and did not offer many
opportunities for students to see artists of color or images of people of color. Chatman (1993)
and Keifer-Boyd, Amburgy, and Knight, (2007) noted that the visual arts are in need of more
minority role models in order to enhance the art education of not only students of color, but
of all students. In addition, Chatman stated students would not have an exceptional education
if they were only exposed to the works of a specific segment of society.

Conclusions and Connections To Research

One significant result of this research is the reiteration from teachers that funding is
insufficient in many cases. Neither the findings nor my interpretation are generalizable,
however, it is a considerable reminder that all but one of the study participants felt the need
for additional resources in their classrooms. It has been documented and established that the
arts foster an atmosphere of engagement, attention, and exploration and are additional
support to growth in academic achievement, (Moorefield-Lang, 2010) and are worthy of funding at a level equal to that of core classes.

Hatfield (1999) and Remer (2010) informed us that Most of the U.S. state departments of education have adopted the national arts standards, but those standards were created to focus on what students in the arts should know and be able to do rather than on the programs, processes, or access issues that aim to offer chances for learning. The need for basics such as paper and paint was an issue for the teachers who participated in this study, and some would forego an assignment or use their own money to supplement and supply their classroom resources when money was in low supply, or not provided at all. In the authors’ opinions, state education (standards) policies serve as predictors of what happens or will happen in local districts and schools- the arts are a supplement to the math, science, technology, and engineering classes.

While many states, including North Carolina, have included the arts and humanities in their basic educational goal statements, the arts are still relegated to the fringes of programming and the school budget (Chapman, 2005; Engel, 1977; Remer, 2010). Chapman (2005) agrees that the status of art education in schools hinge on the financial resources of the state and community in which it is located. The literature supports my findings, as many of the study participants stressed the need for additional funding for their programs. Emerson had no idea what his budget was for the school year, Blair had no budget to use in her district, and all other participants, except Camille stated resources are an issue. Camille’s school was an anomaly that I had never heard of in my eighteen years of teaching. The ability to provide all materials needed to students in all schools across the state is not likely
realizable, but to address resource shortfalls is a goal that can be taken into account and addressed.

Critical Race Theory

Permanence of Racism

The permanence of racism as explained by Critical Race Theorists (Bell, 1992; Delgado & Stefancic, 2012; Omi & Winant, 1994) can be used to analyze the creation of art education texts and lesson plans, and is manifested through the critical race tenant of whiteness as property. Communication, expression, and learning in and through the arts were some of the foci of the study participants. While discussing visual aids such as classroom posters and displays, visual arts literature, and opportunities for arts participation, there were few instances in which the teacher participants in this study focused on the Black artist or Black experience. A quote from the literature review as it relates to race and visual art education, Ladson-Billings and Tate (1995) offer a reference from Cornel West and Lionel Smith, “race matters”, but “blackness matters in more detailed ways”.

The teacher participants in this study had lots to tell me regarding their lack of resources and support as well as their use of images to support their classroom projects, which is in support of the previous research (Chapman, 2005; Engel, 1977; Remer, 2010). The images used, however, were specific to people of color in only five of the twenty-three lessons I analyzed, and mentioned in a few of the narratives. Two teachers said they do not address the Black race specifically in their lessons, while others informed me of lessons used rarely that addressed race. Those students who are able to participate in arts classes taught by several study participants are exposed to images that perpetuate and often complete racist
stereotypes. It is important for students to participate in the arts in a meaningful way. Eisner (2002) described the null curriculum, what is not taught or included in schools’ cultures. The absence of organized and purposeful arts learning in secondary schools that address artists of color supports a culture of devaluation of artists of color and art that represents people of color in a positive light.

*Whiteness as Property*

Another basis of this research, whiteness as property, is manifested through the limited number of Black people in the works selected as resources in secondary art classes in the state. The intellectual and social property inherent in some works of art used as resources by secondary teachers in North Carolina that were a part of this study did not include many works that were reflective of positive imagery or a higher quantity of works by artists of color. The abundance of the white images, coupled with images that perpetuate stereotypes, reinforce white intellectual and social property of visual art.

The work of Kara Walker was covered in the literature review and her silhouette pieces were used by one teacher, and in her style, the figures of Black women were unusually exaggerated and overtly stereotypical. Emerson used the piece highlighted in the literature review titled *Freedom, a Fable: A Curious Interpretation of the Wit of a Negress in Troubled Times* (1997) (Figure 2). As noted in the description of the art, there were, “demeaning postures and exaggerated features… negative stereotypes of African-Americans…Walker's figures depict a physically and sexually violent antebellum South, often the source of these virulent typologies” (NGA, 2013).
The works used by the teachers in this study can be interpreted as victory of the dominant (privileged) over the minority (subjugated) who must be conquered and or controlled in order to maintain white control and privilege (Sweeney, 2002). For example, Norman Rockwell who is well known for his “American ideal” paintings, was used as a reference in one of Camille’s classes. She chose to use an image that included a Black man, but his job was one of servitude, and considering the era of the painting, he was specifically painted in a subjugated position (Figure 14).

Figure 13
Norman Rockwell, 1946
*Boy in a Dining Car*
Counter-storytelling and Recognition of Cultural Capital

The two perspectives related to this study and the importance of counter-storytelling are arts-imagination, which is art making as a way to understand, and arts-embodiment, which is defined as art embodying knowledge (Keifer-Boyd, 2011). Examples from this study in which art making was used as a way to reflect on individual understanding of self, arts-imagination, include lessons and examples presented by all but one of the study participants. Alexandra believed in the power of self-discovery through art. Blair said “Art is what teaches children to be more like themselves instead of like everybody else”. Camille thought “I try to work on having them use their own voice at school. I don't want them to just tell me they like this work, I want them to tell me how it makes them feel”. Dana shared an epiphany when she stated, “art is necessary… it is an expression of self… of life… of everything”. Finally, Emerson told me “the issue of race in my class and social justice does not wait for February. I try to include artwork form different cultures and talk about how those artists influence history in general”. The quotes from the participants reflect their willingness to allow students to participate in the arts in a meaningful way.

The lessons created by Jasper, Isahna, and Fred are in line with CRT, which accepts experiential knowledge through that use of storytelling, narratives, and counter-narratives, thereby providing a voice for people of color (Ladson-Billings & Tate, 1995; Lopez, 2003; Lynn & Parker, 2002; Solorzano & Yosso, 2001). As secondary students participate in counter-storytelling in their classrooms, they participate in arts-embodiment by exploring concepts that “promote human dignity through subversive renderings of difference that dislodge hatred of self and others” (Keifer-Boyd, 2011, p. 12). The best example of arts-
embodiment was Jasper’s destruction lesson that allowed for the physical, symbolic, and creative promotion of human dignity through art.

The narratives of Dana and Helena directly reflect the thoughts of Bell (1992) who stated the desire of Black people to “obtain freedom, justice, and dignity is as old as this nation” (Bell, 1992, p. 363). Dana’s many years of teaching has given her wisdom and insight into the needs of her students as it relates to freedom and justice issues. Additionally, Helena’s first-hand experience of integration gives her substantial facts and experiences that transfer to her lesson planning and project development. Blair’s narrative and her willingness to include social justice issues such as The March on Washington allow her students to recognize the permanent place of race in American society.

Cultural capital and funds of knowledge are accumulated unique knowledge, learning and thinking essential for individual, household, and community wellbeing and survival (Chappell & Cahnmann-Taylor, 2013; Moll, Amanit, Neff, & Gonzalez, 1992; Pacheco, 2012; Yosso, 2005). The meaningful episodes in which counter-stories are created in Isahna’s classes counteract stories of the majority. Her students’ research and display of personal family histories are usefulness through counter-storytelling and the realization of cultural capital which are essential tools crucial to offset the abundance of white standards in K-12 arts education (Barone, 1992).

This capital transfers to arts processes and learning by serving as an analytic tool students use to make meaning of their work as well as the works of other artists. Blair, Emerson, Fred, and Camille all allowed their students to reflect on the work of their peers and professionals, while Ishana and Jasper created lessons that embraced cultural capital and
funds of knowledge as integral to the success of students in their classes (Barone, 1992; Landay, Meehan, Newman, Wooten, & King, 2001; Rolling, 2008). “When students engage in arts processes, they develop distinct and complementary social practices: developing craft, engaging and persisting, envisioning, expressing, observing, reflecting, stretching, and exploring and understanding art worlds” (Chappell & Cahnmann-Taylor, 2013, p. 247).

Chappell and Cahnmann-Taylor (2013) offer examples of how arts education programs become successes if they converge with interests of the majority when the majority realizes the benefit of multicultural education. Isahna’s ancestor investigation is a wonderful example of how her arts programming interests align with her school’s community outreach efforts and parental involvement focus. It is the suggestion of Chappell and Cahnmann-Taylor that the mainstream classroom become a part of the programs designed for marginalized students so that the majority student population and their parents realize the benefit and advantage of such programs to them. Collaboration, partnership, and dissemination of information are all evident in Helena’s willingness to address topics such as immigration and non-traditional families. Efforts such as these are necessary for social change to occur.

Document Analysis

Hatfield (1999) posed several questions related to arts integration and state curricula. He posits, “if the content of the national arts standards, state arts frameworks, and local arts curricula is recognized as a core area of learning for U.S. students, why do arts advocates focus so heavily on the impact of the arts on learning in and across other disciplines,” (Hatfield, 1999, p. 10)? This integration was seen in most of the lesson plans I analyzed, and
implies us to continue to ask that question. How are the arts seen as equal to core classes, yet have been so neglected that they must now be integrated back into the curriculum (Chapman, 2005)? Each of the lessons presented in the findings revealed a purposeful connection to one of four subjects that are considered core subject areas. As the secondary art teachers in this study and across the state prepare lessons for their classes, they must also consider how their curriculum parallels math, science, social studies, and language arts curricula.

Lesson plans collected and analyzed for this research correspond to literature presented in both the social reconstruction (Blandy, 1987; Chalmers, 1981; Freedman, 1988; Nadaner, 1985) and cultural understanding approaches (Allison, 1980; Boyer, 1987; DiBlasio, 1985; Eisner, 1979; Weinken, 1986) by Tomhave (1992). The approach taken in this research was to examine and scrutinize the lessons to determine if there was a hidden agenda that perpetuates cultural inequalities, or if the concerns of various ethnic groups were adequately addressed, specifically Black students. Of the lessons I analyzed, five used the work of Black artists, with one of those portraying extreme exaggerations of stereotypes of Black women, and one lesson used an image of a Black man in a position of servitude. It is my observation that students do not have plentiful opportunities to gain an appreciation of, respect for, and acceptance of diverse cultures’, specifically Black artists contributions to the human condition.

**Implications for Teachers**

The findings of my research respond to the study’s research questions, and achieve its objective of determining how secondary arts teachers in North Carolina address race in their
lessons. The implications for addressing race in art are significant and include (a) the need to reduce and eventually eliminate white privilege in visual arts pedagogy, praxis, and practice in the secondary art setting; (b) recognizing that art teachers serve as stewards of the arts as well as the primary source of access to the arts for many children; and (c) hearing and acting on the voices of the practitioners who deliver art to students at the secondary level.

Eisner (1979) and Simpson, Jackson, and Aycock (2005) restated the idea that experiences in school can be educative, noneducative, or miseducative as proposed by Dewey. Arts education experiences would be considered educative if they enhance further expansion and growth for the student within the domain of the arts. On the other hand, arts experiences would be miseducative if the student's possibilities for further growth were limited, or noneducative if the experiences have essentially no impact on growth in the domain of art. If a student's art and art education experiences related to race have been negative, menial, or nonexistent, it should not be surprising if he or she is predisposed to think of the importance of race in art education in these same terms.

School reform efforts and teacher education have focused on relationships with community and the individual, and between the cultural, institutional and social worlds individuals find themselves in (Chappell & Cahnmann-Taylor, 2013; Marron, 2003; McDermott, 2005; Stevenson & Deasy, 2005). Discussions about art education practices and theoretical perspectives that could contribute to creating conversations and curricula that specifically aim to address the need to reduce and eventually eliminate white privilege in visual arts pedagogy, praxis, and practice in the secondary art setting need to occur on a
regular basis. The social institution of public schools is rich with opportunities to build relationships that are supportive and consequential.

Secondary public school art teachers that visit (either virtually or physically) public art museum and galleries often believe them to be sources of exemplar works. Those teachers serve as stewards of the arts as well as the primary source of access to the arts for many children. The responsibilities of arts teachers coupled with the lack of knowledge of the presence of critical race tenants within their art curriculum could create conflict with arts students’ perception and choice at the classroom level. The need to create engaging lessons, ensure all students are given the opportunity to have genuine meaningful arts lessons and experiences, and provide exposure to varied age appropriate skills is urgent. There is a lack of positive representation and low participation of people of color in the arts, therefore, it is important for the benefactors of racial privilege to recognize their positions in public art education that has served to produce ideological models that have both directly and inadvertently contributed to the detriment of minoritized secondary art students.

Teacher voices need to be heard in a meaningful way that will affect change at the school level as well as at the policy-making level. There were stories and narratives of success and frustration, but they were all worthy to be heard and shared in a consequential manner. Eisner (2002) asserts learning is also shaped by the null curriculum, what is not taught or included in the culture of the school. In schools where the arts are not included, or when they are taught in unstructured ways, students are still learning. The absence of organized and purposeful arts in schools sends a lasting message to students about the arts, and students may learn that the arts are not of value. Together the explicit, implicit and null
curricula shape the culture of the school. The narrative of Greer, for example is one that was enlightening due to his frustration and willingness to share that with me. Because his frustrations translated into repeating lessons year after year and limiting his visits to museums based on what interests him, it reflected the need for teacher voices to be heard and frustrations addressed. The lack of engagement and involvement on the part of the teacher implies a lack of value of his/her subject area.

**Recommendations for Practice**

Gardner (1983) spoke of the tendency of schools to privilege verbal and logical-mathematical intelligences over musical, spatial, and kinesthetic intelligences. He also discussed windows of opportunity for artistic development that may close if children are denied the chance to learn and practice. Brewer (2002) notes that we often talk in terms of balance among the arts, sciences, and humanities, but he warns that their differences should be kept in mind: The arts, he says, are affective and participatory, celebrating the life of feeling and imagination; science is objective, detached, precise, and rational; and the humanities deal with the analysis of moral actions. He concludes by saying that each family of study has its own essential forms of cognition, and therefore the arts have a distinct role to play in education.

Veteran teachers can begin to remedy the issues revealed in this research by recognizing implicit and or unconscious biases that may effect lesson planning. As teachers reflect on their practice and reexamine biases, they may be more willing to use techniques such as counter-storytelling. The creation of counter-stories should be employed regularly and should be extended to all minoritized groups. In addition, Cultural understanding
approaches to art education (Boyer, 1987; Weinken, 1986) that address the need to realize the significance of social and cultural rights of the majority (Allison, 1980) as well as the recognition that the ideas, beliefs, values, and feelings of cultures are determined by art, language, and other forms of expression (DiBlasio, 1985; Eisner, 1979) should be revisited by art teachers and art curriculum developers.

Narratives were used to inform this research, which focused on how secondary arts teachers addressed race in lessons they create or utilize. After gaining insight from the participant narratives, considerations developed for lesson and curriculum development in the arts include: a) As the findings reflect, art is used to express, communicate, and reflect self, therefore, all “varieties of self” should be allowed to manifest through visual arts; b) as art teachers embrace what interests them, they should remain cognizant of their positions as stewards of the arts and expose students to many varies types and representations of people of color in their classrooms; c) stories are our own, and are individual-students should be allowed every opportunity to create and engage in a deeper level of understanding through the arts; d) continued connections should be made to the 21st century through use of technology and virtual museums, especially for those teachers who have limited or no resources at their disposal; and e) art classroom should be places of empowerment and social justice.

**Recommendations for Future Research**

Researchers should continue their work on determining how the arts improve or increase student achievement, benefit at-risk students, and connect to traditional core subject areas. There are, however, important ideas and issues that deserve further exploration.
Primarily, it is important to determine if decreased and diminishing participation in the arts by people of color is due in part to delivery and consumption issues while in secondary classrooms. Participation in the arts by people of color, specifically Hispanics and African Americans has declined steadily between 1982 and 2008 (Engebretsen, 2013; Rabkin & Hedberg, 2011). According to The National Endowment for the Arts’ Survey of Public Participation (2008), access to arts education for people of color is significantly lower than that of white students. Because most students in North Carolina are offered one or more of the arts in K-5 public schools, educators and policymakers need to know how lessons are developed and delivered in order to understand how consumption at an early age may effect consumption and participation in higher education and adulthood.

Secondly, it should be determined if schools that have an arts focus, such as the A+ Schools in North Carolina or arts magnet schools may be more effective at addressing CRT in their delivery of arts to secondary students. Those schools with an arts focus may have more opportunities to delve deeper into the arts and their connections to issues such as social justice. As students may participate in counter-storytelling in their classrooms, they participate in arts-embodiment by exploring concepts that “promote human dignity through subversive renderings of difference that dislodge hatred of self and others” (Keifer-Boyd, 2011, p. 12). Further research to investigate art educators’ willingness and ability to combine art and CRT is important and should be investigated.

Finally, the role local and state level arts policymakers in North Carolina play in the support of arts and students of color should be investigated. The national arts standards were created to focus on what students in the arts should know and be able to do rather than on the
programs, processes, or access issues that aim to offer chances for learning (Hatfield, 1999; Remer, 2010). In the authors’ opinions, state education (standards) policies serve as predictors of what happens or will happen in local districts and schools. The cultural capital and funds of knowledge accumulated by secondary students are necessary for serving as analytic tools students use to make meaning of their work as well as the works of other artists. Research has shown that art education pedagogy that embraces cultural capital and funds of knowledge is integral to the success of students in art (Barone, 1992; Landay, Meehan, Newman, Wooten, & King, 2001; Rolling, 2008). Creating policies that ensure art is on the agenda for schools in ways that focus clearly on positive representations of Black people and effectively utilizing counter-storytelling is key to art education policy discussions.

**Summary and Reflections**

Attitudes of appreciation for the arts as a useful skill and knowledge for students to have may be affected if arts resources are reflective of social and cultural injustices as theorized by Critical Race Theory. I have witnessed the arts classes becoming the first to be cut in times of financial strain, therefore, perception is significant because of the position the arts currently hold in education. It is my responsibility as a person of color, woman, and artist to maintain a determined effort, through art education and arts policy, to address the “Standard, majoritarian methodology [that] relies on stock stereotypes that covertly and overtly link people of color, women of color, and poverty with ‘bad,’ while emphasizing that White, middle-to upper-class people embody all that is ‘good.’ Morally, the silence within which assumptions are made about good versus bad describes people of color and working-
class people as less intelligent and irresponsible while depicting White middle-class and upper-class people as just the opposite” (Solorzano & Yosso, 2002, p. 29).

Teachers and consumers of art must not settle for traditional components of fine art in classrooms and revise our ideas of what secondary students should be aware of. We must realize visual literacy, contextual relevancy, and critical response in the secondary art class can be addressed in so many ways. Students will find the value in art once they realize its power to affect change. It is our charge to involve students on a deeper level and require them to be more active creators. Simultaneously, we should make it clear that they have the option to create their own paths in order to initiate something new in, and through, art.
References


Gauguin, P. (1897) *Where do we come from? What are we? Where are we going?* [Painting]. Retrieved from www.gauguin.org


Lawrence, J. (1940-1941). The migration of the Negro panel no. 57. [Casein tempera on Hardboard]. Retrieved from http://picturingamerica.neh.gov/


Lynn, M., & Parker, L. (2002). What’s race got to do with it? CRT’s conflicts with and connections to qualitative research methodology and epistemology. Qualitative Inquiry, 8, 7-22.


President’s Committee on the Arts and the Humanities (2011). *Reinvesting in arts education: Winning America’s future through creative schools*. Washington, DC.


APPENDIX A
Teacher Interview Protocols

Teacher:____________________________ School:________________________
Date:_______________ Time:_______________ Location:_________________

To facilitate my note taking, I would like to audio tape our conversations today. For your information, only the researcher on the project will be privy to the tapes, which will be eventually destroyed after they are transcribed. In addition, you must sign a form devised to meet my human subject requirements. Essentially, this document states that: (1) all information will be held confidential, (2) your participation is voluntary and you may stop at any time if you feel uncomfortable, and (3) I do not intend to inflict any harm. Thank you for agreeing to participate in this study.

I have planned this interview to last no longer than one hour. During this time, I have several questions that I would like to cover. If time begins to run short, it may be necessary to interrupt you in order to push ahead and complete this line of questioning.

Introduction

You have been selected to speak with me today because you have been identified as someone who has a great deal to share about teaching and learning. My research focus is the role public arts agencies and museums play in the education of secondary art students, and how their education departments and art classroom teachers play a part in allowing for opportunities to address race and identity. My study does not aim to evaluate your techniques or experiences, rather, I am trying to learn more about decisions regarding lesson plan development and hopefully learn about practices that help improve secondary students’ arts learning.

1. Can you tell me a bit about your educational background?
2. What is your philosophy about teaching? About art/ art education?
3. Have you taught any subjects besides art?
4. How often do you visit museums and galleries with your students?
5. Are resources such as time and money factors when exploring those opportunities?
6. How do you determine which exhibits to view?
7. How do you use those exhibitions to enhance your lessons?
8. Have you used lesson plans developed by museums in your classroom? If so, which ones and how?

9. What ideas and themes do you explore when viewing works?

10. What do you consider when planning/creating lessons for students?

11. How do you decide which images/visual aids to use in your classroom?

12. How do you address race in lessons you create with your students?

13. How do you think art helps students have a better understanding of “self”?

14. Do you receive funding from your district for classroom resources/materials?

15. Do you find state and district resources helpful? Are they sufficient?

16. How could the resources be improved?

17. Has your art class benefitted from any grants? If so, which one(s)?

18. How have you used your funding in the past? Consumables, visual aids, books…?

19. Is there anything else you would like to share with me regarding your classroom and your lesson planning?

20. Please show me some of your lesson plans.
APPENDIX B
Informed Consent Form

Study Title: How Secondary Visual Art Teachers Address Race: A Narrative Inquiry for Social Justice
Principal Investigator: Vanessa Smart
Faculty Sponsor: Dr. Lance D. Fusarelli

You are being asked to participate in a research project conducted by Vanessa Smart in the College of Education, North Carolina State University (NCSU). You are being asked because you are a secondary arts teacher or museum official who has knowledge of and ability to make decisions about lesson planning that is a focus of my research.

PURPOSE: The purpose of this study is to determine how public secondary art teachers play a part in allowing for opportunities to address race in the art classroom.

PARTICIPATION: You will be asked to participate in a one on one interview that will consist of dialogue and your responses to research questions. I expect your participation to take about one hour of your time. In addition, I would like to view some of your abbreviated lesson plans that use public works of art as a resource.

RISKS & BENEFITS: The potential risks associated with this study are possible inconvenience due to the timing of the interview, but if any conflicts arise, we can discontinue the interview at any point. I expect the project to benefit secondary education by creating a dialogue about arts and identity in our state arts curriculum and public arts agencies.

COMPENSATION: You will not receive any compensation for your participation.

VOLUNTARY PARTICIPATION: Please understand that participation is completely voluntary. Your decision whether or not to participate will in no way affect your current or future relationship with NCSU or its faculty, students, or staff at NCSU. You have the right to withdraw from the research at any time without penalty. You also have the right to refuse to answer any question(s) for any reason, without penalty.

CONFIDENTIALITY: Your individual privacy will be maintained in all publications or presentations resulting form this study. At the conclusion of the study, all video or audio recordings will be destroyed after they have been transcribed. Pseudonyms will be used for this research project.

If you have any questions or would like additional information about this research, please contact me at vrsmart@ncsu.edu. The NCSU Institutional Review Board (IRB), which is administered through the Office of Sponsored Programs and Regulatory Compliance.
(OSPRC), has approved this project. If you feel your rights as a research participant have been violated during the research process, you may also contact the IRB Coordinator Jennie Ofstein at Campus Box 7514 Raleigh, NC 27695, (919) 515-8754, irb-coordinator@ncsu.edu. In addition, you may contact the IRB administrator Debra Paxton at Campus Box 7514 Raleigh, NC 27695, (919) 515-4514, debra_paxton@ncsu.edu. A signed copy of this consent form will be given to you.

I understand the above information and have had all of my questions about participation on this research project answered. I voluntarily consent to participate in this research.

Signature of Participant/Date ________________________/_______

Signature of Researcher/Date ________________________/_______
## APPENDIX C

### Participant Descriptions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Alexandra</th>
<th>Blair</th>
<th>Camille</th>
<th>Dana</th>
<th>Emerson</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4th year</td>
<td>4th year</td>
<td>11th year</td>
<td>30th year</td>
<td>5th year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BA, MA</td>
<td>BA, MA</td>
<td>BA, MA</td>
<td>BA, MA</td>
<td>BA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moderate Budget</td>
<td>Yearly budget of $0</td>
<td>Unlimited resources</td>
<td>Limited budget; grant writer</td>
<td>Moderate budget-issues with access</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Getting away from the traditional sense of teaching art history</td>
<td>Freedom for teachers to plan and explore as deemed appropriate for secondary students; social justice</td>
<td>Encouraging success regardless of ability or experience; fostering students’ passions</td>
<td>“Art is necessary, it is an expression of self, of life, of everything”; students are to have a sense of agency and self-direction</td>
<td>Professional artist; student advocate; “Learning shouldn't be a limitation and a box that we put our kids in”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fred</th>
<th>Greer</th>
<th>Helena</th>
<th>Isahna</th>
<th>Jasper</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>19th year</td>
<td>21st year</td>
<td>22nd year</td>
<td>4th year</td>
<td>20th year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BA, MA</td>
<td>BA, MA</td>
<td>LPN, BA, MA</td>
<td>BA, MA</td>
<td>BA, MSA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moderate Budget</td>
<td>Moderate Budget</td>
<td>Small Budget</td>
<td>Significant Budget w/ parental support</td>
<td>Moderate Budget</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Excitement fills his space; “I'm there to teach all who want to learn… and I do teach even those who don't want to learn. Because of the environment we’re in, we will learn”</td>
<td>“I threw my educational philosophy out the window. You teach them where they are and you take them from where they are and you build.”</td>
<td>“The best that I can do is the very best that I can do and that is the best that I can do”</td>
<td>“Art is vital especially when approaching holistic education. Students learn critical and practice a lot of critical thinking skills in my room”</td>
<td>Southern gentleman; “Children have not changed over the years, our expectations have, and their privileges have”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## APPENDIX D
Lesson Plan Matrix

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Teacher Participant</th>
<th>Artist of Focus</th>
<th>Brief Lesson Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Jasper</td>
<td><em>V. Van Gogh</em> (Painting)</td>
<td>Self-portraits and artists’ emotions were the focus of the lesson. <strong>Gustav Klimt</strong> (Painting) Non-traditional stylizing of figures and emotions in art. <strong>Charles Schultz</strong> (Drawing) Timelines and storytelling through cartooning. Students were to tell a story using cartooning techniques. <strong>Mark Rothko</strong> (Painting) Color use, space, and contemporary art. Questions posed to students about what makes art real.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emerson</td>
<td><em>Kara Walker</em> (Collage)</td>
<td>Students were studying historical narratives and their use in contemporary art. <strong>Frida Kahlo</strong> (Painting) The painting lesson was developed to address the idea of “self” and life.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Helena</td>
<td><em>T. Jacques Ralli</em> (Painting)</td>
<td>Classical painting lesson on space, figures, and emotions in art. <strong>Jacob Lawrence</strong> (Painting) Harriet Tubman Series and The Great Migration Series were used to explain historical events.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Blair</td>
<td><em>August Rodin</em> (Sculpture)</td>
<td>Students researched the artist and his use of bronze casting as a medium. <strong>Johan Sergel</strong> (Sculpture) Students created a mini-sculpture of wire and cloth in order to become familiar with human proportions and natural movement. <strong>George Segal</strong> (Sculpture) Students were to learn about the artist and how his works bring attention to important social or historical issues. Students were to create a life-sized sculpture of a person that relates to a social or historical event.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alexandra</td>
<td><em>Edvard Munch</em> (Painting)</td>
<td>Students were to respond to a prompt asking why the figure in the painting was screaming. They wrote a short story about their ideas.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Dana**  
*Max Klinger* (Printing) Students discussed the use of symbols in art and society. They created a symbolic representation of themselves.  
*Romare Bearden* (Collage) NC artists and their place in art history. Students referenced his jazz singers as they focused on the expressions of the musicians’ faces.  
*Mary Cassat* (Painting) Students researched the artists in order to discover why she focused on the female figure in her work and why that was important at the time.  

**Greer**  
*Wangechi Mutu* (Digital Arts) Students viewed her exhibit at a museum and discussed her use of fantastic imagery and non-traditional means of storytelling.